Observations on the State of Indigenous Human Rights in China

Prepared for:

The 31st Session of the United Nations Human Rights Council
Universal Periodic Review
Submission Date: March 2018

Cultural Survival is an international Indigenous rights organization with a global Indigenous leadership and consultative status with ECOSOC. Cultural Survival is located in Cambridge, Massachusetts, and is registered as a 501(c)(3) non-profit organization in the United States. Cultural Survival monitors the protection of Indigenous peoples’ rights in countries throughout the world and publishes its findings in its magazine, the Cultural Survival Quarterly; and on its website: www.cs.org

Cultural Survival
2067 Massachusetts Avenue
Cambridge, MA 02140
USA Tel: 1 (617) 441 5400
agnes@culturalsurvival.org
www.culturalsurvival.org
I. Executive Summary

China voted in favor of the adoption of the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (UNDRIP) in 2007, however, it refuses to recognize the term “Indigenous Peoples” in its borders. Even though poverty levels have declined and the wellbeing of the general population has improved, ethnic minorities are left behind as indicated by low educational attainment, low participation in the labor force and lack of access to healthcare. Basic rights such as the right to self-determination, the right to peace and security, and the right to religious traditions and customs are violated at an alarming rate.

II. Background information

China recognizes 55 ethnic minority groups which account for 8% of the total population—nearly 112 million people. There are other ethnic groups that have not yet been recognized. Ethnic minorities largely occupy the northwest, southwest, and western part of the country. Out of the 55 ethnic groups, 53 have spoken languages while 23 have written languages. For over two millennia, the Han Chinese absorbed several other ethnic groups to become the most dominant ethnic group, however, its inability to respect and endorse other ethnic groups brought about the need for the other ethnic groups to seek independence. By the end of the 1940’s, China had fallen under a communist regime ending the sinofication of the other ethnic groups, by the Han Chinese.

Outside the Han Chinese, the largest ethnic groups are the Zhuang, Hui Minority, Man, Tibetan Zang, and Uyghur. The Zhuang, being the second largest ethnic group, has a population of about 17 million and occupies the province of Yunnan and the Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region. The Hui Minority, with a population of about 10.6 million, practice Islam, speak Mandarin and live in provinces in northwestern china. The Man ethnic group has a population of around 10.4 million living in Liaoning, Heilongjiang, and Jilin provinces. Tibetan (Zang) live in Tibet, an autonomous region in southwest China, has a population of 6.2 million people. The Uyghur ethnic group has a population of a little over 10 million and occupies the Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region. Governance of ethnic minority groups in China is through the Law of the People’s Republic of China on Regional Autonomy (REAL). This law established five autonomous, minority ethnic, regions and encompasses all laws affecting autonomy including self-government, the economy, cultural rights, and the relationship between the central government and the autonomous regions. The five autonomous regions are Guangxi, Inner Mongolia, Xinjiang, Ningxia and Tibet. REAL was promulgated to promote a unified China by strengthening equality, unity, cooperation, and to accelerate development in the autonomous regions. However, in practice the autonomous powers granted under REAL function as non-autonomous local governments which are no different than local governments outside of the

---

2 Ibid.
6 Ibid.
9 Ibid.
autonomous regions. As a result, there is insufficient exercise of legislative powers; until 2012, no autonomous region has been able to pass autonomous regulation. In addition, to be able to pass laws, the autonomous regions have to get approval from the Standing Committee of the National People’s Congress, calling into question the true autonomy of the regions.

III. Past UPR Recommendations

2nd Cycle

- Prioritize the implementation of its NHRAP and its 12th Five-Year Plan for Economic and Social Development in the ethnic regions of minority groups as well as for other underprivileged communities - Sierra Leone
- Allocate more educational resources to central and western regions, rural areas, remote and border areas, and in ethnic minority areas - South Sudan
- Permanently lift restrictions on access to minority areas - Australia
- Continue to promote economic development in ethnic minority regions and strengthen their capacity for development - India
- Ensure democratic participation of members of all ethnic minorities and allow unhindered access to all minority areas, including Tibet - Germany
- Protect the rights of ethnic minority groups, including Tibetans, Uighurs, and Mongolians, in accordance with China’s Constitution and international human rights commitment - United States

1st Cycle

- Adopt further measures to ensure universal access to health and education and other welfare for rural communities, minority regions, disadvantaged families and the internal migrant population - New Zealand
- Guarantee all citizens of China, including its minority communities and religions, the exercise of religious freedom, freedom of belief and the freedom of worshipping in private - Germany

IV. Ongoing Violations

A. Civil and Political Rights

The Chinese government claims that there are no political prisoners, however, several sources indicate otherwise. The prisoners include the Panchen Lama (successor to the Dalai Lama), several human rights attorneys, and thousands of other individuals, who are imprisoned, missing, tortured, or executed. Some of the targeted ethnic minorities include Kazaks, Tibetans, and Uyghurs. Ethnic minority human rights defenders are arrested, prosecuted, and charged; they are also detained for longer periods where they may be subject to torture.

Tibet was annexed by China in October 1950, at this time the 15-year old Dalai Lama was the head of state in Tibet. Even though China had agreed not to compel Tibet’s central authorities, by 1959 it broken agreements had led to unrest and the fleeing of the Dalai Lama and most of his ministers to India. Ever since 1959, the relationship between China and its autonomous region Tibet has been marred with violence and unrest where Tibetan Buddhist monks and several other individuals have gone as far as

12 Ibid.
13 Ibid.
15 Ibid.
16 Ibid.
19 Ibid.
self-immolation to express dissent. More recently, Tibetans were arbitrarily detained—without proper charges, tortured, or violently attacked. Some are even deemed separatists and may face imprisonment or the death penalty. Tibetans are also constantly monitored with security cameras, at checkpoints, and by party officials. In addition, even though China officially condemns torture, there have been several reports of political prisoners being tortured. Between 2008 and 2014, there were 29 political prisoners, of which 14 have died as a result of torture. It has also been reported that it is common place for the government to release political prisoners that are ill due to torture, in order to avoid liability.

Another method aiding the Chinese government in its repressive tactics is using its global influence to sway other nations. This aided China in weakening UN human rights mechanisms and ensure that its human rights violations are not discussed in international forums. China made certain that in June 2017, the European Union did not, for the first time, deliver a statement on China to the Human Rights Council, because Greece was dissuaded by China from putting forth its criticism.

China also infringes on the ethnic groups freedom of expression by limiting access to the internet and subsequently banning tools that circumvent government censorship such as virtual network providers (VPNs) and bans online associations, groups, and websites such as Facebook, YouTube, in which pro-ethnic information may be circulated. As of the end of 2017, those that provide such circumvention tools need to be pre-approved and those that were found in violation would be disconnected, warned, or fined. China also has several broad laws that were passed in 2014 such as the Anti-espionage Law, National Security Law, and an Anti-terrorism Law which pose serious threats to human rights. Additionally, thousands of websites have been blocked through the use of the Cyber Security Law, passed in 2017, which required internet service providers to censor content users are able to access. This was later followed by requiring some messaging services to include terms and conditions that require agreement to collection of the user’s personal information. Consequently, several human right defenders have been arrested.

In the Xinjiang Uighur region, as a pretext to increasing social stability, the government has been using detention centers to arbitrarily detained several individuals, for unknown periods of time, in order to teach detainees about Chinese policies and laws. And most recently, by using anti-extremism rhetoric, the Chinese government, enacted the “De-extimification Regulation” to prohibit what it deemed as extremist thought: such extremist thoughts included refusing to watch public television or refusing to listen to public radio programs, and religious practice such as wearing burkas, growing a beards, etc.

---

26 Ibid.
27 Ibid.
30 Ibid.
31 Ibid.
32 Ibid.
33 Ibid.
B. Right to Education

Even though the well-being of the general population has improved, economic standing for ethnic minorities has not improved as much.\textsuperscript{34} It is estimated that about 48\% of poverty is in ethnic minority regions.\textsuperscript{35} One of the factors contributing to the disparity between the ethnic majority and ethnic minorities, is differences in educational attainment.\textsuperscript{36} Minorities are less likely to attain primary, secondary, or tertiary education—the disparities are even greater for women.\textsuperscript{37} Research has shown that attainment level is affected by the primary language of the minority students—if it is not Mandarin; whether they are in mixed schools (Han and minority); and the students’ familial background—if they are from the Hu and Tu ethnic groups. Generally, Mandarin speaking Han students perform better whether they are in mixed schools or not.\textsuperscript{38}

Under China’s Compulsory Education Law, education is compulsory and universal for all ethnic minorities in urban and rural areas. However, this requirement has not eliminated the inequality in education, because resources are not evenly distributed in rural areas.\textsuperscript{39} At the local government level, secondary-level vocational schools are available. However, because primary-level attainment is low, students (Tibetan), are not qualified to attend because they do not attain primary level education. Moreover, these vocational schools follow classroom-oriented curricula which fails to provide marketable skills,\textsuperscript{40} especially those new skills needed in the new labor market.\textsuperscript{41} Another issue in education is in Inner Mongolia and Tibet there is prohibition of regional languages which is expected to worsen with the national educational plan.\textsuperscript{42} In addition to the prohibition of regional dialect and languages, the state is also actively eliminating them.\textsuperscript{43} To address these disparities, schools need to be tailored to fit the specific needs of the ethnic groups that they serve and also ensure that students are able to attain the levels of education which would make them marketable in the existing labor market.

C. Right to Health Care

For historical reasons such as being organized into autonomous regions, ethnic minorities reside in underdeveloped and remote areas, consequently, there is limited access to healthcare—in addition to technology, transportation, and economic resources.\textsuperscript{44} In a 2009 healthcare reform, the government vowed that equalization of basic healthcare to the public will be one of its five main projects.\textsuperscript{45} Even though this reform aided in attracting private investors, because of remoteness and the economy of regions, it does not have considerable impact, requiring the allocation of funds to alleviate the existing problems and

\textsuperscript{36} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{38} Ibid
\textsuperscript{43} https://www.economist.com/blogs/prospero/2016/07/language
\textsuperscript{45} Ibid. pp. 2.
encourage investment.\textsuperscript{46} In addition the geographic impediments, also limit access to doctors, other professional, hospitals and hospital beds, policies that require doctors to work in remote areas for a certain duration, and constructing more roads to increase access could curbing the shortage.\textsuperscript{47}

Although China’s HIV health rate is very low, around 0.1% of the total population with HIV or AIDS,\textsuperscript{48} the incidence rates are the highest in ethnic minority regions such as Sinchaun, Yunnan and Guangxi,\textsuperscript{49} which account for nearly half of China’s HIV victims.\textsuperscript{50} The Guangxi province, has one of the highest rates,\textsuperscript{51} with over 10,000 people living with HIV or AIDS.\textsuperscript{52} In general, HIV prevalence rates are higher for intravenous drug users (IDU), who account for a little over a third of those who have HIV or AIDS.\textsuperscript{53} As a response, the government has instituted detox programs that rehabilitate IDU’s—by detaining them for treatment. The centers in Guangxi prevent the IDU’s from continuing ARV treatments—while in the program, fail to provide effective detox treatments and deny the patients access to HIV prevention and treatment.\textsuperscript{54} The U.N. Special Rapporteur on Torture has indicated that these detox centers can be considered inhumane and degrading treatment.\textsuperscript{55} Under Article 21(1) and 29(3) of the UNDRIP, Indigenous Peoples have the right to healthcare that is free from discrimination, and also requires States to take effective measures to provide healthcare services, respectively. As a result, the above mentioned problems faced by ethnic minorities, either due to discrimination or failure to provide rudimentary healthcare services, are in violation of their rights, requiring the government to take adequate measure to alleviate the existing problems.

\section*{D. Religious and Cultural Freedom}

The official religions that are approved for practice in China are Catholicism, Buddhism, Taoism, Protestantism, and Islam.\textsuperscript{56} Even though practice of other religions is banned, the Communist Party of China is officially an atheist country. It is believed that there are around 650 million people in China practicing traditional religions and on rare occasions, practice of some traditional religions is tolerated.\textsuperscript{57} A government administrative agency, the State Council, passed a new law, in February 2018, which

\textsuperscript{46}Ibid. pp. 9.
\textsuperscript{47}Ibid.
\textsuperscript{53}Ibid.
\textsuperscript{54}Ibid.
\textsuperscript{55}Ibid.
\textsuperscript{57}Ibid.
prohibits discrimination based on state registered religions, however, the law comes with restrictions such as how and where religious practices can be held, restrictions on religious schools, and monitoring of donations made to religious practice and online religious activity.\(^ {58}\) The restrictions on ethnic minorities is greater as these groups are harassed and persecuted for practicing their religion. Tibetan Buddhism are the most persecuted religious group in China, with several of them exiled and their institutions destroyed.\(^ {59}\) Harassment of Tibetan cultural rights also prevent them from displaying their national flag and singing their national anthem.\(^ {60}\) Tibetan Buddhism is considered a threat and in addition to being closely monitored, Buddhist monks are evicted and removed from their temples.\(^ {61}\) Religious persecution also extends to the Uighur Muslims who are tagged by the government as being associated with a neighboring state, Islamist separatist group known as East Turkestan Islamic Movement. As a result they are attacked by government forces by bombs or knife attacks, that appear to be spontaneous.\(^ {62}\) They are also prevented from practicing their cultural and religious traditions by preventing them from fasting during Ramadan and demolition of several mosques.\(^ {63}\) Although the repression was in the form of brutal attacks by the military, recently it has moved towards more restrictive and discriminatory treatment which infringe upon and violate human rights.\(^ {64}\)

E. Restrictions on Movement

Tibetans are prevented from international travel by denying them Chinese passports, and travel with in the region is frustrated by checkpoints and requirement of travel permits.\(^ {65}\) China has also been using the hukou, a passport system, which limits access to public benefits depending the individual’s place of birth.\(^ {66}\) This disenfranchises those who live in rural ethnic minority areas, because they are effectively denied access to health care, housing, education, etc.\(^ {67}\) In 2014, the Xinjiang regional government had passed a law which required all persons to carry identification cards with basic information such as age, ethnicity and hometown.\(^ {68}\) However, the law was abolished, by the regional government, because local residents argued that it was a form of population control to monitor and restrict Uyghurs.\(^ {69}\)

A month after the law was abolished, the Chinese government recalled the Xinjiang residents’ passports claiming it was for “review” and “safekeeping,”\(^ {70}\) which forced Uyghur students abroad to return to China.\(^ {71}\) The students were then arrested upon their arrival.\(^ {72}\) In addition, those who apply for a


\(^{59}\) Ibid.


\(^{61}\) Ibid.


\(^{64}\) Ibid.

\(^{65}\) Ibid.


\(^{67}\) Ibid.


\(^{69}\) Ibid.

\(^{70}\) Ibid.

\(^{71}\) Ibid.

travel permit or a passport are required to give fingerprints, DNA samples, three-dimensional pictures, and voice recordings. This is a violation of Article 9 and Article 12(1) of the UNDRIP which require recognition of Indigenous Peoples’ right to belong to their community and exercise their customs and traditions without fear of discrimination, respectively. Additionally, because the Chinese government has required Xinjiang residents to return their passport—when the regional government clearly abrogated the 2014 law deeming it as a restriction on movement, the government's action is in clear contravention of Article 19 of the UNDRIP, which requires good faith consultation, and Article 18 of the UNDRIP, which confirms that Xinjiang residents “have the right to participate in decision making in matters which would affect their rights.”

V. Questions
- What is being done by the government to promote true self-government of the autonomous regions?

VI. Recommendations
1. Officially recognize Indigenous Peoples in China and in the country’s constitution.
2. Invite the UN Special Rapporteur on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples to visit the country.
5. Permanently lift restrictions on access to minority areas
6. Ensure democratic participation of members of all Indigenous Peoples and allow unhindered access to all minority areas, including Tibet
7. Protect the rights of Indigenous Peoples in accordance with international human rights commitments and UNDRIP.
8. Respect Indigenous Peoples’ rights to land and Free, Prior, and Informed Consent of Indigenous communities before any development is permitted to take place on their lands.