



ADF INTERNATIONAL

ECOSOC Special Consultative Status (2010)

UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW – THIRD CYCLE

**Submission to the 28th session of the
Human Rights Council's Universal Periodic Review Working Group**

October-November 2017, Geneva, Switzerland

BENIN

Submission by:

ADF International
Chemin du Petit-Saconnex 28
1209 Geneva, Switzerland

Web: www.adfinternational.org
Email: mnavarro@adfinternational.org

Introduction

1. ADF International is a global alliance-building legal organization that advocates for religious freedom, life, and marriage and family before national and international institutions. As well as having ECOSOC consultative status with the United Nations (registered name “Alliance Defending Freedom”), ADF International has accreditation with the European Commission and Parliament, the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe, and the Organization of American States, and is a participant in the FRA Fundamental Rights Platform.
2. This report explains why Benin should reaffirm the sanctity of life on the part of all human beings, including the unborn, and why it should resist calls to liberalize access to abortion due to the fact that there is no international human right to abortion. It also deals with the issue of high levels of maternal mortality and morbidity in Benin.

(a) Abortion

3. Abortion is illegal in Benin except in cases in which the pregnant woman’s life is in danger, with the attending physician being required to seek the opinion of two consulting physicians, one of whom must be from a select list of experts charged with the responsibility of determining whether or not inducing termination of pregnancy is the only option to save the woman’s life.¹
4. Pro-abortion outlets, however, complain that women do not have practical access to abortions in Benin, due to procedural barriers such as needing the approval of three doctors, as well as ignorance about the law, and that they therefore turn to “unsafe providers” or do not seek adequate care after an abortion, and that this has a dire effect on maternal health and mortality.²

The right to life in international law

5. A so-called international “right to abortion” is incompatible with various provisions of international human rights treaties, in particular provisions on the right to life.
6. Article 6(1) of the ICCPR states, “Every human being has the inherent right to life.” The ICCPR’s prohibition of the death penalty for pregnant women implicitly recognizes the right to life of the unborn.
7. Although the ICCPR allows for the death penalty to be imposed on both adult men and women, it explicitly prohibits applying the death penalty to pregnant women. Article 6(5) states that the “sentence of death shall not be imposed for crimes committed by persons below eighteen years of age and shall not be carried out on pregnant women.” This clause must be understood as recognizing the unborn child’s distinct identity from the mother and protecting the unborn child’s right to life

¹ United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Benin Abortion Policy, <http://www.un.org/esa/population/publications/abortion/doc/benins1.doc>.

² Ibid.

8. The *travaux préparatoires* of the ICCPR explicitly state that “the principal reason for providing in paragraph 4 [now Article 6(5)] of the original text that the death sentence should not be carried out on pregnant women was to *save the life of an innocent unborn child*.”³ Similarly, other early UN texts note that the intention of the paragraph “was inspired by humanitarian considerations and by *consideration for the interests of the unborn child*.”⁴
9. The protection of unborn life is also found through an ordinary reading of the language in the preamble of the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC). The preamble states that “the child, by reason of his physical and mental immaturity, needs special safeguards and care, including appropriate legal protection, *before as well as after birth*.”
10. Article 1 of the CRC defines a child as “every human being below the age of eighteen years.” This provides an upper limit as to who is a child, but does not provide a lower limit on when the status of “child” attaches. Moreover, Article 6 of the CRC holds that “States Parties recognize that every child has the inherent right to life. States Parties shall ensure to the maximum extent possible the survival and development of the child.” Viewed in the context of the preamble, both Articles 1 and 6 of the CRC indicate recognition and protection of unborn life.

Legalizing abortion does not make it safe

11. The medical infrastructure in Benin is poor by Western standards, with an inadequate number of trained health professionals and unsanitary, poorly-equipped health facilities. Women who receive abortions will still face the same poor conditions faced by women who give birth and deal with similar complications, such as bleeding and infection. Providing more access to abortion will mean more women will suffer from abortion complications.
12. High rates of maternal mortality have less to do with the legality of abortion per se than with an inability to access obstetric care, lack of information, and lack of health workers, especially in the case of women living in poverty and in rural areas.
13. Further, abortion can never be safe because it takes the life of the unborn child, and harms the mother through the loss of her child.

Reducing recourse to abortion

14. Benin must focus on introducing measures to reduce recourse to abortion, instead of focusing on legalizing it, in line with paragraph 8.25 of the Programme of Action of the International Conference on Population and Development. Measures to reduce abortion include improving access to education, which empowers women

³ A/C.3/SR.819, para. 17 & para. 33; In accordance with the Article 32 of the Vienna Convention, the *travaux préparatoires* are considered to be a “supplementary means of interpretation.”

⁴ Commission on Human Rights, 5th Session (1949), 6th Session (1950), 8th Session (1952), A/2929, Chapter VI, Article 10.

and leads to social and economic development, as well as facilitating healthy decision-making.

15. Benin must also focus on helping women get through pregnancy and childbirth safely, rather than helping women end their pregnancies. Given the maternal health crisis in Benin, resources must focus on improving conditions for pregnant women, women undergoing childbirth, and postpartum women.

(b) Maternal Health

16. Benin's maternal mortality ratio (MMR) in 2015 was 405 maternal deaths per 100,000 live births, down from 576 per 100,000 in 1990.⁵ Every maternal death is a tragedy. It devastates the woman's family, in particular the woman's children, and affects the entire community socially and economically. The high number of maternal deaths in Benin is a human rights crisis.

Necessary maternal health interventions

17. Almost all maternal deaths are preventable, particularly when skilled birth attendants are present to manage complications and the necessary drugs are available, such as oxytocin (to prevent haemorrhage) and magnesium sulphate (to treat pre-eclampsia). Problems include a lack of drugs and poor infrastructure, such as no electricity or running water and inaccessibility of hospitals due to weather conditions.
18. The World Health Organization (WHO) recommends a minimum of four prenatal visits with trained health workers, in order to prevent, detect, and treat any health problems. Although it has been estimated that in 2006 around 88% of pregnant women in Benin received some level of prenatal care during their pregnancies, only 61% received the minimum of four visits recommended by the WHO.⁶
19. UNFPA also documented that with regard to availability of midwives, nurses, clinical officers and medical assistants, physicians, and OB/GYNs, only 38% of the estimated need was met in 2012, and that in rural areas around 25% of births did not involve skilled birth attendants.⁷
20. These issues must be remedied, but frequent calls to increase legal abortion access as a necessary precondition to solving them are misguided. Legalizing abortion also does not guarantee that pregnancy and childbirth will become safer when the real problems with Benin's health-care system do not involve lack of access to abortion. Providing more access to abortion will mean more women will suffer from abortion complications.

⁵ World Bank, Maternal mortality ratio (modeled estimate, per 100,000 live births), 2015, <http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SH.STA.MMRT>.

⁶ USAID, The DHS Program, Benin DHS, 2006 – Final Report, <http://dhsprogram.com/publications/publication-FR197-DHS-Final-Reports.cfm>.

⁷ UNFPA, The State of the World's Midwifery 2014, 60, http://www.unfpa.org/sites/default/files/pub-pdf/EN_SoWMy2014_complete.pdf.

21. In line with paragraph 8.25 of the ICPD, Benin must focus on introducing measures to avoid recourse to abortion by way of investing in social and economic development and by providing women with support throughout and after pregnancy.

(c) Recommendations

22. In light of the aforementioned, ADF International suggests the following recommendations be made to Benin:
 - a. Affirm that there is no international human right to abortion and that the right to life applies from conception until natural death, and as such that the unborn child has the right to protection of his or her life at all points;
 - b. Resist calls to further liberalize abortion, and instead implement laws aimed at protecting the right to life of the unborn;
 - c. Recognize that the legalization of abortion, in a country with high levels of maternal mortality and morbidity and with severe problems with access to proper health-care, will not make pregnancy and childbirth any safer;
 - d. Improve health care infrastructure, access to emergency obstetric care, midwife training, and resources devoted to maternal health; and
 - e. Focus on safely getting mothers and babies through pregnancy and childbirth, with special attention paid to improving health-care access for women from poor and/or rural backgrounds.