Strengthening the National Human Rights Institution (NHRI) according to the Paris
Principles

Following multiple evaluations and recommendations by international human rights
institutions, reform of the Moldovan NHRI was included as an objective in the National Human
Rights Action Plan for 2011-2014 and as a strategic area in the Judicial Sector Reform Strategy
for 2011-2016.

The new Law No. 52 on People’s Advocate (Ombudsman) approved by Parliament on
03.04.2014 does not provide adequately for reform of the institution and strengthening its
capacities. Gaps have been also identified in the new regulatory frame work that impede
the execution of the mandate of the Ombudsperson and the institution. Some provisions of the
law have been declared unconstitutional. Upon request of the Ombudsperson, the Venice
Commission delivered its opinion about some issues related to the new NHRI model chosen by
Moldova, and the Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law of the Council of
Europe gave an opinion about the gaps in Law No.52/03/04/2014 regarding the establishment
and operation of the National Preventive Mechanism against Torture. Legal complications
undermine the operation of the Child’s Ombudsperson and the National Preventive Mechanism
against Torture, the rank and the remuneration of the Ombudsperson, his functional independence
and independence from other institutions, and the financial resources of the Ombudsperson’s
Office.

Two major issues for the NHRI are the insufficient funding and the lack of adequate
premises. The institution is located in a damaged building and the Government has, over several
years, not been able to identify, a building that meets the requirements of the institution.

Recommendations:
• Revise Law No. 52 to ensure that it meets international standards and good practice;
• Provide suitable premises and facilities for the Ombudsperson’s Office and properly fund the
activities of the Ombudsperson.

Rights of the Child
Inclusion of children with disabilities

Inclusion of children with special education needs and disabilities (SEND) requires the
development of support services for teaching staff, the parents and the children with special
needs. In 2014-2015, there were 101 deinstitutionalised children with SEND studying, while
in 2015-2016 - there were 591 children. There is an increasing need for support services.

Recommendations:
• Adapt education institutions to respond to the needs of children with disabilities;
• Provide regular training for teaching staff;
• Develop the necessary mechanisms and tools;

Right of the child to being raised in a family environment

The residential childcare system reform is encumbered by: insufficient alternative services to
the residential institutions; inaction by guardianship bodies responsible for the assistance and
protection of orphan children and children without parental care; insufficient funding for social
services (guardianship/trusteeship, professional parental care, family-type houses); and
inadequate allowances for orphan children and children without parental care.

Guardianship authorities fail to monitor properly the situation of deinstitutionalised children.
Contrary to the legislation, the placement of children from residential institutions in accordance
with the minimal care standards has not been revised; orphan children graduates of residential
institutions are not provided with dwelling space/social housing.

Recommendations:
• hold accountable the actors responsible for the social assistance and protection of orphan
children and children without parental care;
• provide sufficient funds for the establishment and operation of alternative services.

Preventing and combating child labour exploitation

The legislation sets out the age and conditions for child employment. During the reporting
period, policies have been developed and implemented for preventing and combating child
labour exploitation and sanctions for the violations related to child labour have been tightened. Official statistics show a decrease of this phenomenon.

Traditionally, minors are involved in labour in agriculture, the processing industry, wholesale and retail trade, etc. They usually come from disadvantaged families.

**Recommendation:**
- Undertake information campaigns, particularly for vulnerable groups, as well as efficient implementation of the existing mechanisms for monitoring the employment and sanctioning employers who violate the law.

**Juvenile justice**

Progress was made in strengthening juvenile justice by establishing new mechanisms and implementing them. However, there is no legal and institutional framework for sanctioning and re-educating minors who commit crimes but who may not be held criminally accountable.

**Recommendations:**
- provide sufficient financial and human resources;
- implement mechanisms for collection and processing of data about the juvenile justice system;
- establish an institutional and legal framework for children who committed crimes stipulated by criminal law but have not reached the age of criminal liability;
- strengthen the role of authorities in re-socializing and reintegrating minors;
- develop and implement a national plan for preventing and combating juvenile delinquency.

**Securing Qualitative Healthcare Services**

The lack of proper tools for implementing health legislation leads to irregularities in the system, which limits access to and the quality of healthcare services. There is a shortage of competent staff in the field of public health, particularly in rural areas, as a result of the exodus of specialists and the unsatisfactory infrastructure and sanitary-hygienic condition of healthcare facilities. Obsolete medical equipment and insufficient technical and material resources impede access by the population to quality medical services and demotivate medical staff. Because the latter have to work in difficult conditions, facing fatigue and insufficient remuneration, many leave the healthcare system.

Another healthcare issue is securing and monitoring the quality and safety of services provided. The procurement of medicines in public healthcare facilities is based on the lowest price, which does not always ensure the best quality. Healthcare facilities, particularly in rural areas, lack sufficient equipment and medicines for quality first aid. This leads to an avoidable high mortality rate. The accreditation of public healthcare facilities is a formality—without thorough control of hospital conditions, the quality and safety of the equipment used, and adequate assessment of patients’ satisfaction. There are no efficient procedures for examination of petitions and medical errors and for centralised monitoring of malpractice cases. Observance by health professionals of patients’ rights, particularly the rights to private life, to choice and to being informed, is low. There is unequal access to some specialised services such as medication for the people suffering from cancer and HIV/AIDS and qualified palliative care. The existing system for control and prevention of tuberculosis, protection of reproductive health and sexual health is inefficient.

The healthcare system is marked by corruption, which is driven by poverty and lack of efficient tools to fight this phenomenon. Around 93% of the Moldovans provide informal payments to doctors and other medical staff. Yearly, such payments amount to the equivalent of 100 million USD. Informal payments are also widespread among people who do not hold a health insurance policy. Around 80% of citizens who address to the Ministry of Health, complain about being forced to make informal payments to doctors.

**Recommendations:**
- the state should develop the necessary tools to create and promote zero tolerance of corruption within the health system;
Quality and Accessibility of Drinking Water
The quality of drinking water and access to it remains a serious problem for Moldova. The volume of water currently available is about 500 m\(^3\) per capita or even less xxiii. The management of water resources is flawed and unbalanced, and the quality poor. The share of Only 62% of inhabitants have permanent access to improved water sources, and only 56.6% have improved sewerage systems. There is a significant difference between rural (22.8%) and urban (68.9%) areas in access to water supply services, while in terms of access to the public sewerage system, the difference is even more alarming – 1% compared to 50.1%. xxiv

Maintenance of water supply and sewerage systems is done within the limits of existing financial and economic resources. Such systems continue to degrade, causing loss of water and energy resources. The institutions working in water supply and sanitation are fragmented, have limited resources to ensure efficient management of current issues and to plan medium and long-term investments. Budgetary constraints mean financing from public funds is low.

Recommendations:
- improve the operational and financial performance of water supply enterprises to increase the safety and quality of services provided to the population;
- increase the efficiency of sectoral policies for the oversight, management and protection of water resources; and
- monitor the water quality at national level in a systematic and coordinated manner.

Independence, Transparency and Efficiency of the Judiciary
Under the Justice Sector Reform Strategy for 2011-2016 xxv(JSRS), a number of laws have been adopted/amended and actions have been undertaken to ensure the accessibility and independence of the judiciary and to increase its transparency and efficiency xxvi. However, no progress has been made in strengthening the integrity of judicial actors: anti-corruption measures and professional conduct standards have not been implemented in all judicial institutions; and there is insufficient promotion of intolerance towards corruption.

The judicial system is perceived by the population as being corrupt. This affects seriously the credibility of the justice delivered and fuels distrust by citizens of the integrity of the individuals working in this field. Bi-annual surveys conducted by the Public Policy Institute xxvii since 2003 show a dramatic decrease of citizens’ confidence in justice, from 26% in May 2012 to 12% in November 2015.

Recommendations:
- eradicate corruption in the system;
- ensure the continuity of the reform by identifying and developing a general framework for future policies after expiry of JSRS; continue efforts to build a justice system that is accessible, efficient, independent, transparent, professional, and accountable to citizens.

Securing Minimal Detention Conditions
Detention conditions in Moldovan penitentiaries have not improved significantly nor yet attained a level to avoid amounting to inhuman or degrading treatment. The Ombudsman has identified a systemic problem with overpopulation of the prisons, hygiene conditions, poor quality and insufficient quantity of food, and lack of proper healthcare xxviii. This is reinforced by the decisions of the European Court for Human Rights xxix.

The economic crisis has resulted in the cessation of capital investments since July 2015, making it impossible to implement policies adopted to improve the infrastructure of
custodial facilities in line with standards, or to develop and implement construction/renovation plans.xxxi

Although the law xxxi sets out detention standards and criminalises intentional inhuman or degrading treatment applied, there are no effective mechanisms to enable the authorities to examine complaints related to detention conditions and to provide effective remedies xxxii.

**Recommendations:**

- speed up the construction of arrest houses and renovate detention facilities;
- take action to guarantee efficient remedies (with preventive and compensatory effect) for improper detention conditions in violation of the law and international treaties.

**Preventing Human Trafficking**

The lack of information and the deplorable social and economic condition of vulnerable groups are key factors that encourage human trafficking. Information campaigns have been conducted to prevent and fight this phenomenon and the Service for Assistance to and Protection of the Victims of Human Trafficking (HT) was established xxxiii. The legal framework has been amended xxxiv to make a distinction between forced labour and HT for purpose of labour exploitation and between pimping and HT for purpose of sexual exploitation. Sanctions have been tightened for child trafficking, pimping and the organisation of begging, and the commission of HT crimes by national and international civil servants. Beneficiaries of services of HT victims have been criminalised, as has the trafficking of organs and the advertising of the sale and purchase of organs.

However, official statistics xxxv do not yet show a consistent trend down wards in the number of crimes in this area xxxvi.

**Recommendation:**

- continue priority actions in the HT area, including information campaigns; measures for economic rehabilitation of socially vulnerable groups; support for the start-up of small and medium businesses, particularly in rural areas.

**Ensuring Gender Equality**

Gender disparity is still an issue. On the labour market, women are overrepresented in low paid occupations and underrepresented in leadership positions. Roma women, women with disabilities, and other vulnerable groups are frequently excluded from public life.

**Recommendation:**

- continue affirmative action to strengthen the legal framework, including by: establishing the a minimum quota for women on the electoral lists of political parties; promoting gender equality; and eliminating gender stereotypes from the educational curriculum.

**Preventing and Combating Domestic Violence**

Official statistics show an increased number of domestic violence cases (2012–6569; 2013-6706; 2014–7338; 2015–9203) and inefficient intervention by the authorities responsible for protection of victims.

**Recommendations:**

- further improve the existing regulatory framework;
- ratify the Council of Europe Convention on preventing and combating violence against women and domestic violence;
- increase information for citizens through permanent awareness campaigns;
- secure sufficient funding for services designed to assist and protect victims of domestic violence.

**Ensuring the Rights of Persons with Disabilities**

During the reporting period, the regulatory framework for ensuring the implementation of the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities was adopted xxxvii. However, insufficient mechanisms for implementing the Convention have been developed.

Persons with disabilities are not treated as equal members of the society: they have low accessibility to social infrastructure, transportation, and information; insufficient social services at community level; low levels of employment; and social benefits under the minimal subsistence level xxxviii. Persons with mental disabilities are denied the right to vote, free access to
justice and the right to establish a family.

**Recommendation:**
- to ratify the optional protocol to the Convention;
- establish an independent mechanism for monitoring the implementation of the Convention;
- eliminate the barriers that deny persons with disabilities an independent life and full participation in all aspects of life;
- develop and implement mechanisms for integration of persons with disabilities on the labour market;
- raise social awareness;
- challenge stereotypes about persons with disabilities;
- ensure the right of each person to exercise his/her legal capacity by abolishing the legal provisions regarding the mechanism for substitution of decisions and replacing it with a mechanism for support in exercising their legal capacity.

**Securing a Decent Standard of Living**

The economic crisis and constant increases in prices and tariffs for consumer goods and services further affect the living standard of the population in general and lead to the impoverishment of the most vulnerable groups.

The existing pension system is unfair and unsustainable. The indicators for calculating the pension are out-dated. The Ombudsman has notified the Government that the average monthly pension does not cover the minimal subsistence level for retired people.xxxix. An analysis of official data for the past 3 years shows that the average pension received by around 98% of the total number of retired persons is below the minimum subsistence levelxl.

The national minimum wagexl does not cover the minimum subsistence levelxl. The Law on Minimal Subsistence Levelxli does not adequately regulate the adjustment of social benefits and the national minimum wage to the minimum subsistence levelxli.

**Recommendations:**
- ratify the Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
- adjust social benefits and national minimum wage to the minimum subsistence level.

**Promoting and Ensuring Human Rights in the Transnistrian Region of Moldova**

During the reporting period, the human rights situation in the Transnistrian region has not improved significantly. Poor treatment in places of detention; systemic violations of the rights to education and to property, and freedom of movement are just a few of the issues faced by the persons residing in the region and in the area with an increased security regimexl. Although some objectives for promoting and securing human rights in the Transnistrian region were included in the National Human Rights Action Plan for 2011-2014xl, many of them have not been achieved.

In October 2012, the Ombudsperson’s Institution opened a representative office in the Varnita village, situated in the area with increased security regime. The representative office monitors, within available sources, the observance of human rights in the Transnistrian region and contributes to promoting human rights by supporting the activity of NGOs in the region.

Following the war of Transnistria in 1992, around 130 thousand people left the region and were internally displaced. The lack of a law about internally displaced people denies them guarantees for protection and creates a legal vacuum. The existing law ignores internally displaced persons and has no mechanisms for their protection.

**Recommendations:**
- include the topics of monitoring, promotion and protection of human rights on the negotiations agenda within existing formats;
- create a sectoral human rights working groupxl;
- actively support civil society efforts in promoting human rights in the Transnistrian region; and
- withdraw reservations about non-observance of international treaties in the Transnistrian region, on signature, acceptance, approval or joining of international treaties.
Law No.152 of 05.07.2012 on the Minimal Subsistence Level
By Government Decision No.1178 of 31.10.2007 for enforcement of the initiatives of the President of Moldova on increasing the confidence and security in the context of settlement of the Transnistrian issue, the list of sectoral working groups and the membership thereof was approved: working group for economy and trade, working group for infrastructure development; working group for ensuring proper operation of the railway, working group for health protection and social issues, working group for education and science, working group for demilitarisation and security strengthening, working group for humanitarian aid, working group for agriculture. The working groups created in Chisinau and Tiraspol aim at implementing jointly specific projects in the social and economic, humanitarian and security areas, including with the support of international partners, as well as at contributing to supporting the population and creating conditions proper for conducting negotiations for the political regulation of the conflict. The Ombudsman recommends creating a sectoral human rights working group starting in 2013 (http://ombudsman.md/ro/advanced-page-type/anuale).