

Universal Periodic Review
(25th session, April-May 2016)
Contribution of UNESCO to Compilation of UN information
(to Part I. A. and to Part III - F, J, K, and P)

Papua New Guinea

I. BACKGROUND AND FRAMEWORK

Scope of international obligations: Human rights treaties which fall within the competence of UNESCO and international instruments adopted by UNESCO

I.1. Table:

<i>Title</i>	<i>Date of ratification, accession or succession</i>	<i>Declarations /reservations</i>	<i>Recognition of specific competences of treaty bodies</i>	<i>Reference to the rights within UNESCO's fields of competence</i>
Convention against Discrimination in Education (1960)	Not state party to this Convention	<i>Reservations to this Convention shall not be permitted</i>		Right to education
Convention on Technical and Vocational Education. (1989)	Not state party to this Convention			Right to education
Convention concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage (1972)	28/07/1997, acceptance	N/A	N/A	Right to take part in cultural life
Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage (2003)	12/09/2008, ratification	N/A	N/A	Right to take part in cultural life
Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the	N/A		N/A	Right to take part in cultural life

Diversity of Cultural Expressions (2005)				
--	--	--	--	--

II. INPUT TO PART III. IMPLEMENTATION OF INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS OBLIGATIONS, TAKING INTO ACCOUNT APPLICABLE INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN LAW TO ITEMS F, J, K, AND P

Right to education

1. NORMATIVE FRAMEWORK

1.1. Constitutional Framework

1. The Constitution of Papua New Guinea of 16 September 1975¹ does not specifically provide the right to education.
2. Nevertheless, the Preamble stipulates that the People of Papua New Guinea calls for “education to be based on mutual respect and dialogue, and to promote awareness of our human potential and motivation to achieve our National Goals through self-reliant effort”.
3. With regard to religion, **Article 45** provides that “(2) No person shall be compelled to receive religious instruction or to take part in a religious ceremony or observance, but this does not apply to the giving of religious instruction to a child with the consent of his parent or guardian or to the inclusion in a course of study of secular instruction concerning any religion or belief.”
4. According to **Article 55** “all citizens have the same rights, privileges, obligations and duties irrespective of race, tribe, place of origin, political opinion, colour, creed, religion or sex.”

1.2 Legislative Framework

5. “The main laws regulating the education system are: the **Education (Amendment) Act of 1995**, which established the new structure of the education system; the **Teaching Service**

¹ <http://www.parliament.gov.pg/images/misc/PNG-CONSTITUTION.pdf>,
<http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/600e78096209b63b86f0135f52694b257b4b0c0e.pdf>, Accessed on 20/04/2015

(Amendment) Act of 1995; the **Higher Education Act of 1983**² (Consolidated to No. 45 of 2000), which provides for the establishment of the Commission for Higher Education and the Office of Higher Education; and the **Organic Law on Provincial and Local-level Governments** of 1995.

6. In addition, the **National training Council Act of 1991**³ established the National Training Council (NTC) which has wide powers including the development of training, the coordination of training institutions, the relevance and standards of training as well as access to training. The **Apprenticeship and Trade Testing Act of 1986**⁴ provides for the training of apprentices and other skilled workers. [...]
7. There are no legal provisions regarding free or compulsory education, or any age limits set. In principle, the (elementary) preparatory year is for children aged 6. Free and compulsory education is a very long-term goal of the Government. A number of Provincial Education Plans have included a recommended age of entry to elementary schools. The overarching goal of Universal basic Education is that all children of school age must enroll in school, complete nine years of basic education and should have learnt skills, knowledge and values covered in the basic education curriculum.”⁵ “According to the Education (Amendment) Act of 1995, the programme of primary education lasts six years, covering grades 3 to 8. [...] Secondary education lasts four years and is divided into two cycles: lower (grades 9 and 10) and upper secondary (grades 11 and 12).”⁶
8. Papua New Guinea has recently adopted the following instruments:
 - **Lutheran University of Papua New Guinea Act 2014**⁷,
 - **Teaching Service (Amendment) Act 2014**⁸,
 - **Higher Education (General Provisions) Bill 2014**⁹.

² http://www.paclii.org/pg/legis/consol_act/hea1983153/,

<http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/d0e2f45f87117d54542bc2339842c9f3755d4203.pdf>, Accessed on 20/04/2015

³ http://www.paclii.org/pg/legis/consol_act/ntca1991253.rtf,

<http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/8ae068062b9eb577b446144bb2a4e51d7ff4ef6c.pdf>, Accessed on 20/04/2015

⁴ http://www.paclii.org/pg/legis/consol_act/aatta1986312/

<http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/7c36af78214627780e85f9cfe2a8b85cc886ac72.pdf>, Accessed on 20/04/2015

⁵ IBE, World Data on Education, 7th ed., 2010-2011, Papua New Guinea, p. 3,

http://www.ibe.unesco.org/fileadmin/user_upload/Publications/WDE/2010/pdf-versions/Papua_New_Guinea.pdf, Accessed on 20/04/2015

⁶ IBE, World Data on Education, 7th ed., 2010-2011, Papua New Guinea, p. 7,

http://www.ibe.unesco.org/fileadmin/user_upload/Publications/WDE/2010/pdf-versions/Papua_New_Guinea.pdf, Accessed on 20/04/2015

⁷ <http://www.parliament.gov.pg/uploads/acts/14A-55.pdf>, Accessed on 20/04/2015

⁸ <http://www.parliament.gov.pg/uploads/acts/14A-52.pdf>, Accessed on 20/04/2015

⁹ <http://www.parliament.gov.pg/uploads/acts/14A-34.pdf>, Accessed on 20/04/2015

1.3. Policy Framework

i) General information

9. In October 2010, Department of National Planning and Monitoring adopted the **Papua New Guinea Medium Term Development Plan 2011-2015**¹⁰. “The immediate focus of the Government within the next five years will include: implementing education reforms to improve service delivery; strengthening and coordinating partnerships with stakeholders at all levels; enhancing universal access to primary education, ensuring effective distribution of education materials and supplies and implementing necessary legislative reforms. These interventions will be supported by curriculum reform across all levels of schooling and legislative changes to ensure educational materials can be easily distributed throughout the country. Another legislative change critical during the next five years is the centralising and standardising of education functions as part of a process of developing effective management and administration.”¹¹

10. “In the next five years institutions of higher education will be moving down the path towards self-financing with the establishment of a Higher Education Endowment Fund. The Higher Education Endowment Fund Trust will become a major source of funding for new capital investment, maintenance of faculties, twinning arrangements with foreign institutions, industrial partnership, course field work and a wide range of scholarships to meet the needs of both industry and the public service. The priority expenditure areas of the Fund will be clearly outlined and managed by the Commission for Higher Education, under the general supervision of the Department of National Planning and Monitoring. The Fund will be financed by contributions from the universities business’ arms, contributions from the private sector, revenue from a Higher Education Contribution Scheme (HECS), the 2 per cent training levy, and assistance from development partners. The Government will provide support for the Fund during the first MTDP while the HECS scheme is set up and until the HECS scheme generates sufficient revenues.”¹²

11. In December 2009, the National Executive Council of the Department of Education adopted the **Achieving Universal Education for a Better Future – Universal Basic Education Plan 2010 – 2019**.¹³ “The Universal Basic Education Plan 2010-2019 builds

¹⁰ Department of National Planning and Monitoring, Papua New Guinea Medium Term Development Plan 2011-2015, http://www.education.gov.pg/QL_Plans/plans/medium-term-development-plan.pdf, Accessed on 20/04/2015

¹¹ Department of National Planning and Monitoring, Papua New Guinea Medium Term Development Plan 2011-2015, p. 34, http://www.education.gov.pg/QL_Plans/plans/medium-term-development-plan.pdf, Accessed on 20/04/2015

¹² Department of National Planning and Monitoring, Papua New Guinea Medium Term Development Plan 2011-2015, p. 38, http://www.education.gov.pg/QL_Plans/plans/medium-term-development-plan.pdf, Accessed on 20/04/2015

¹³ Department of Education, National Executive Council, Achieving Universal Education for a Better Future – Universal Basic Education Plan 2010 – 2019, http://www.education.gov.pg/QL_Plans/plans/ube-plan-2010-2019.pdf, Accessed on 20/04/2015

on the progress made in the National Education Plan 2005-2014. It was developed to ensure that all school-aged children have equal access to quality basic education which provides them with life-long skills in order to contribute to the development of the country. A basic education is therefore critical for Papua New Guineans to participate in modern society.”¹⁴ “Papua New Guinea is currently implementing the Universal Basic Education Plan 2010 – 2019, which holds primary education to be compulsory. Fees exist, but are planned to be removed.”¹⁵

12. “On 30/01/2013 the Papua New Guinea government released US\$112 million of funds for the proposed free education programme. The funding covers fees for students attending elementary schools up to grade 12 and vocational centres, as well as subsidised fees for permitted schools. However about 5000 schools throughout PNG are in danger of missing out on the funding for 2013.”¹⁶
13. The **National Education Plan 2005–2014**¹⁷ “builds on progress made under the NEP 1995-2004”. “The Plan is guided by the National Goals and Directive Principles as established in the Constitution:
 - **Integral human development**
 - We declare our first goal to be for every person to be dynamically involved in the process of freeing himself or herself from every form of domination or oppression so that each man or woman will have the opportunity to develop as a whole person in relationship with others.
 - **Equality and participation**
 - We declare our second goal to be for all citizens to have an equal opportunity to participate in, and benefit from, the development of our country.
 - **National sovereignty and self-reliance**
 - We declare our third goal to be for Papua New Guinea to be politically and economically independent, and our economy basically self-reliant.
 - **Natural resources and environment**

¹⁴ Department of Education, National Executive Council, Achieving Universal Education for a Better Future – Universal Basic Education Plan 2010 – 2019, p. i, http://www.education.gov.pg/QL_Plans/plans/ube-plan-2010-2019.pdf, Accessed on 20/04/2015

¹⁵ UPR-info, Papua New Guinea Mid-tem Implementation Assessment, p. 17, http://www.upr-info.org/sites/default/files/document/papua_new_guinea/session_11_-_may_2011/mia-papua_new_guinea.pdf, Accessed on 20/04/2015

¹⁶ UPR-info, Papua New Guinea Mid-tem Implementation Assessment, p. 18, http://www.upr-info.org/sites/default/files/document/papua_new_guinea/session_11_-_may_2011/mia-papua_new_guinea.pdf, Accessed on 20/04/2015

¹⁷ http://planipolis.iiep.unesco.org/upload/Papua%20New%20Guinea/Papua_New_Guinea_Education_Plan_2005-2014.pdf, <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/5b04afa49ebb8fb33a735c25becfc915f4daa94f.pdf>, Accessed on 20/04/2015

- We declare our fourth goal to be for Papua New Guinea's natural resources and environment to be conserved and used for the collective benefit of us all, and be replenished for the benefit of future generations.
- **Papua New Guinea ways**
 - We declare our fifth goal to be to achieve development primarily through the use of Papua New Guineans forms of social, political and economic organizations.”¹⁸

ii) Gender equality

14. “The **Gender Equity in Education Strategic Plan (2009-2014)**¹⁹ has been developed to support, assist and facilitate implementation of the **Gender Equity in Education Policy**.”²⁰ Some **guidelines for its implementation** were then adopted.²¹
15. “The plan is available throughout the National Department of Education, Head Office, Provincial Offices and Local Education Authorities, to all schools, elementary, primary, secondary, tertiary and all teacher training institutions to support and assist all personnel, education systems and institutes to implement the Gender Equity in Education Policy in accordance with the following aims to:
- Educate female and male students for a satisfying, responsible and productive life, including work inside and outside the home.
 - Provide a curriculum which, in content, language and methodology meets the educational needs and rights of female students as well as male students.
 - Acknowledge and respect positive cultural values and individual differences.
 - Provide a curriculum which challenges unfair cultural practices and which recognizes the contribution to society of the full range of women as well as the contributions of diverse groups of men.
 - Encourage the development of positive attitudes and behaviours in male and female students which promote social responsibility, empathy, and sensitive, equal and non-violent relationships.

¹⁸ National Education Plan 2005–2014, p. 5,

<http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/5b04afa49ebb8fb33a735c25becfc915f4daa94f.pdf>, Accessed on 20/04/2015

¹⁹ [http://planipolis.iiep.unesco.org/upload/Papua%20New%20Guinea/Papua New Guinea gender equity strategic plan.pdf](http://planipolis.iiep.unesco.org/upload/Papua%20New%20Guinea/Papua%20New%20Guinea%20Gender%20Equity%20Strategic%20Plan.pdf), <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/20a2235639bfc9a680ab848b5f07ba0cfa6149f.pdf>, Accessed on 20/04/2015

²⁰ Gender Equity in Education Policy, Guidelines for implementation, p. 5,

<http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/3d8a72f1400ca043fef9c1c23bcf8b78ab74b94d.pdf>, Accessed on 20/04/2015

²¹ [http://planipolis.iiep.unesco.org/upload/Papua%20New%20Guinea/Papua New Guinea gender equity guidelines.pdf](http://planipolis.iiep.unesco.org/upload/Papua%20New%20Guinea/Papua%20New%20Guinea%20Gender%20Equity%20Guidelines.pdf), <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/3d8a72f1400ca043fef9c1c23bcf8b78ab74b94d.pdf>, Accessed on 20/04/2015

- Provide a challenging learning environment which is socially and culturally supportive and physically comfortable for female as well as male students.
- Prepare female students and male students for their rights to personal respect and safety and provide an environment that is safe and free from all forms of harassment and violence.
- Provide finances and personnel resources to ensure that the capacities of male and female students are fully and equally realized.
- Acknowledge that effective change and lasting improvements needed in schools will require awareness, understanding and acceptance of the educational needs of female students on the part of students, parents, teachers and administrators.
- Ensure institutional support for addressing the educational needs of female students.
- Encourage support of parents and community members.
- Ensure women are supported in areas where curriculum is the responsibility of the community both financially and materially through NDoE professional development and other strategies.”²²

iii) Other (as appropriate)

16. “United Nations Human Rights Task Team (UNHRTT) response: Some international actors conduct human rights training to the Royal PNG Constabulary. This included training by UNICEF on juvenile justice and the rights of the child, by IOM on human trafficking, and by the ICRC on humanitarian law. OHCHR/UNDP in collaboration with the Bomana Police Training Academy are taking steps to enhance human rights training in the new recruit and in-service curriculum.”²³

2. COOPERATION:

17. Papua New Guinea is **not party** to the 1960 UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education.
18. Papua New Guinea did **not report** to UNESCO on the measures taken for the implementation of the 1960 UNESCO Recommendation against Discrimination in Education within the framework of the:
- **Sixth Consultation** of Member States (covering the period 1994-1999),
 - **Seventh Consultation** of Member States (covering the period 2000-2005),

²² Gender Equity in Education Policy, Guidelines for implementation, pp. 5-6, <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/3d8a72f1400ca043fef9c1c23bcf8b78ab74b94d.pdf>, Accessed on 20/04/2015

²³ UPR-info, Papua New Guinea Mid-tem Implementation Assessment, p. 6, http://www.upr-info.org/sites/default/files/document/papua_new_guinea/session_11_-_may_2011/mia-papua_new_guinea.pdf, Accessed on 20/04/2015

- **Eighth Consultation** of Member States (covering the period 2006-2011).
19. Papua New Guinea did **not report** to UNESCO on the measures taken for the implementation of the 1974 UNESCO Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms within the framework of the:
- **Fourth Consultation** of Member States (covering the period 2005-2008),
 - **Fifth Consultation** of Member States (covering the period 2009-2012).
20. Papua New Guinea did **not report** to UNESCO on the measures taken for the implementation of the 1976 UNESCO Recommendation on the Development of Adult Education within the framework of the:
- **First Consultation** of Member States (1993),
 - **Second Consultation** of Member States (2011).
21. Papua New Guinea is **not party** to the 1989 UNESCO Convention on Technical and Vocational Education.

Freedom of opinion and expression

1. CONSTITUTIONAL AND LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK

22. Freedom of conscience, expression, information and of assembly and association are considered as basic rights in Papua New Guinea.²⁴ Freedom of expression has constitutional protection (Article 46).
23. Freedom of information, including access to official documents, is guaranteed by the Constitution (Article 51).
24. Defamation constitutes a legal crime in Papua New Guinea, specified in the Defamation Act from 1962.²⁵ The penalty for defamation is either a fine and/or imprisonment for a term not exceeding three years.

2. MEDIA SELF-REGULATION

25. Self-regulatory mechanisms of the media exist through an entity such as the Papua New Guinea Press Council, which guarantees non-interference from the part of the

²⁴ <http://www.parliament.gov.pg/images/misc/PNG-CONSTITUTION.pdf>

²⁵ www.paclii.org/pg/legis/consol_act/da196299.rtf

government, reinforces journalists in their profession and provides training to them.²⁶ The board of the Papua New Guinea Press Council is made up of members of various national media organizations.

26. The Papua New Guinea Press Code of Ethics was adopted in 1975.²⁷

3. SAFETY OF JOURNALISTS

27. UNESCO recorded no killing of journalists in Papua New Guinea so far. Journalists operate in a safe environment.

3. RECOMMENDATIONS

Right to education

28. **Recommendations made within the framework of the first cycle of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review, considered on (please check the date on the following web site: <http://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/UPR/Pages/Documentation.aspx>)**

29. 78. The recommendations listed below have been examined by Papua New Guinea and enjoy its support:

- i. 78.53. Consider prohibiting by law corporal punishment within the family and other institutions (Chile);
- ii. 78.56. Enhance human rights training for police forces and ensure their accountability for respecting human rights (Slovenia);
- iii. 78.57. Ensure comprehensive human rights training for its law enforcement personnel with a view to prevent any excessive use of force and to investigate, prosecute and punish the perpetrators of such human rights violations, in accordance with international standards (Slovakia);
- iv. 78.59. Conduct relevant human rights training for senior police (New Zealand);

²⁶ <http://www.rjionline.org/MAS-Press-Councils-Papua-New-Guinea>

²⁷ <http://www.rjionline.org/MAS-Codes-Papua-New-Guinea-Journalists-Association>

- v. 78.67. Continue implementing programmes and measures aimed at ensuring universal and quality health and education services for all its population (Cuba);
- vi. 78.68. Prioritize efforts to achieve the maternal health and basic education Millennium Development Goals (Australia);
- vii. 78.73. Take appropriate measures, in accordance with its international obligations, aimed at ensuring universal education, including free and compulsory primary education (Malaysia);
- viii. 79.26. Consider including the component of human rights education and training in its national education programme and in the training programmes for the police and those who administrate justice (Costa Rica);
- ix. 79.27. Develop proactive strategies for economic development and social cultural transformation, with priority given to addressing the problems of discrimination against women, gender-based violence, the HIV/AIDS epidemic, child labour, corporal punishment of children, and sorcery-related killings (Thailand);
- x. 79.37. Prohibit corporal punishment of children in all settings and ensure protection against child labour and child prostitution (Slovenia);
- xi. 79.40. Take stronger measures to professionalize the police force by demanding accountability and retraining key personnel, including seeking the assistance of international law enforcement experts (United States);
- xii. 79.57. Step up efforts to improve and conserve the environment, including by strengthening the relevant laws and providing the public with the necessary information, education and awareness regarding the impacts of climate change and environmental pollution and degradation (Malaysia);
- xiii. 79.59. Review its legal measures and, if necessary, request the necessary technical assistance so as to ensure that boys and girls of all regions of the country have access to free and compulsory primary education (Mexico);
- xiv. 79.61. Consider the possibility of ensuring free and compulsory education, at least at the primary level (Algeria);
- xv. 79.62. Guarantee universal basic education, in accordance with the international human rights treaties it has ratified, and ensure that primary education is compulsory and free for all (Indonesia);

- xvi. 79.63. Ensure compulsory, free and accessible primary education for all. Enhance also the availability and accessibility of secondary and higher education and close the gender gap at all levels of education (Slovenia);
 - xvii. 79.64. Ensure that primary education is free and compulsory and prioritize the accessibility of secondary education, making it progressively free in accordance with the new Universal Plan on Basic Education (Spain);
 - xviii. 79.65. Adopt further measures to ensure universal primary education, free of charge (Brazil);
 - xix. 79.66. Continue working towards the elimination of the user-pay policy for education with the aim of providing free primary education, as per Millennium Development Goal 2 (South Africa);
30. The following recommendations have been examined and do not enjoy the support of Papua New Guinea:
- i. 79.44. Provide comprehensive human rights training for law enforcement officers, including on issues related to forced eviction and violence against detainees and to racial discrimination and xenophobia (Canada);
 - ii. 79.60. Ensure that education is accessible to all children, including by providing the educational system with necessary resources (Slovakia);

31. Analysis:

Papua New Guinea adopted several legislations aimed at improving the quality of education notably with the Higher Education (General Provisions) Bill (2014). In line with the objectives of Achieving Universal Education for a Better Future – Universal Basic Education Plan 2010-2019, Papua New Guinea is implementing a compulsory primary education. In 2013, Papua New Guinea released funds to achieve free education programmes, however and according to available information, not every educational institution could benefit from it. Papua New Guinea also prepared guidelines for the implementation of the Gender Equity in Education Policy aiming to improve the quality of education as well as human rights training programmes for the authorities. Nevertheless and to the extent of available information, human rights education remains limited in school, and no additional steps were taken toward special education for disabled persons.

32. Specific Recommendations:

1. Papua New Guinea should be strongly encouraged to ratify the UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education.
2. Papua New Guinea should be strongly encouraged to submit state reports for the periodic consultations of UNESCO's education related standard-setting instruments.
3. Papua New Guinea should be encouraged to continue its efforts toward achieving its goals of universal education and gender equality
4. Papua New Guinea should be encouraged to include special education in the development of its educational mainstream system
5. Papua New Guinea should be encouraged to continue its efforts regarding free education programmes for all the educational institutions

Cultural Rights

33. **Papua New Guinea** is encouraged to ratify the Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions (2005). UNESCO's cultural conventions promote access to and participation in cultural heritage and creative expressions and, as such, are conducive to implementing the right to take part in cultural life as defined in article 27 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and article 15 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. In doing so, Papua New Guinea is encouraged to facilitate the participation of communities, practitioners, cultural actors and NGOs from the civil society as well as vulnerable groups (minorities, indigenous peoples, migrants, refugees, young peoples and peoples with disabilities), and to ensure that equal opportunities are given to women and girls to address gender disparities.
34. As a State Party to the Convention concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage (1972) and the Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage (2003), Papua New Guinea is encouraged to fully implement the relevant provisions that promote access to and participation in cultural heritage and creative expressions and, as such, are conducive to implementing the right to take part in cultural life as defined in article 27 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and article 15 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. In doing so, Papua New Guinea is encouraged to give due consideration to the participation of communities, practitioners, cultural actors and NGOs from the civil society as well as vulnerable groups (minorities, indigenous peoples, migrants, refugees, young peoples and peoples with disabilities), and to ensure that equal opportunities are given to women and girls to address gender disparities.

Freedom of opinion and expression

35. UNESCO recommends Papua New Guinea to decriminalize defamation and place it within a civil code that is in accordance with international standards.²⁸

Freedom of scientific research and the right to benefit from scientific progress and its applications

36. Papua New Guinea, in the framework of the 2015-2017 consultations related to the revision and monitoring of the Recommendation on the Status of Scientific Researchers is encouraged to report to UNESCO on any legislative or other steps undertaken by it with the aim to implement this international standard-setting instrument, adopted by UNESCO in 1974.

²⁸ See for example, General Comments No 34. of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), 2006 Recommendation of the 87th Session Human Rights Committee, the recommendations of the UN Special Rapporteurs on the Right to Freedom of Opinion and Expression, and Resolution 1577 (2007) of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe.