Human Rights Council
Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review
Twelfth session
Geneva, 3–14 October 2011

Summary prepared by the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights in accordance with paragraph 15 (c) of the annex to Human Rights Council resolution 5/1

Togo

The present report is a summary of nine stakeholders’ submissions to the universal periodic review. It follows the structure of the general guidelines adopted by the Human Rights Council. It does not contain any opinions, views or suggestions on the part of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR), nor any judgement or determination in relation to specific claims. The information included herein has been systematically referenced in endnotes and, to the extent possible, the original texts have not been altered. Lack of information or focus on specific issues may be due to the absence of submissions by stakeholders regarding these particular issues. The full texts of all submissions received are available on the OHCHR website. The report has been prepared taking into consideration the four-year periodicity of the first cycle of the review.

* The present document was not edited before being sent to United Nations translation services.
I. Background and framework

A. Scope of international obligations

1. Joint submission 1(JS1) notes that Togo is party to a significant number of international instruments and that it ratified the Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment in July 2010.2


3. OSC reports that the rights and duties established in the international human rights instruments ratified by Togo have been incorporated into the Constitution (art. 50). OSC adds that it is important to consolidate the existing legal instruments by ratifying other texts, bringing domestic legislation into line with the instruments ratified and ensuring that they are implemented effectively.4

B. Constitutional and legislative framework

4. The Commission Nationale des Droits de l’Homme (National Human Rights Commission) (CNDH) notes the delays in the harmonization of texts and the revisions of the Criminal Code and of the Code of Criminal Procedure, as well as in the revision of the Individuals and Family Code, the application of certain provisions of which is a source of discrimination, particularly against women.5

C. Institutional and human rights infrastructure

5. OSC reports that the existing institutional framework has been consolidated to ensure greater respect for human rights since the signing of the Global Political Accord in 2006. OSC mentions in particular the key ministries in charge of human rights and justice, as well as CNDH, whose statute and mandate were revised in 2005.6 OSC also reports that the OHCHR office in Togo assists, amongst other institutions, the Truth, Justice and Reconciliation Commission, which was established by decree in February 2009.7

6. CNDH indicates that it is a member of the International Coordinating Committee of National Institutions for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights (ICC) and is accredited with “A” status.8

7. CNDH refers to some obstacles impeding it from effectively carrying out its mission. It mentions a lack of collaboration and a tendency to fail to reply within a reasonable period on the part of the public administration, which hinders the investigation into petitions. Logistical shortcomings and a lack of funds and material resources are also mentioned.9 CNDH recommends that Togo ensure that the public administration gives it full collaboration, in line with the provisions of its implementing act and that its grant be substantially increased.10
8. JS1 notes that on 4 March 2011 the national monitoring committee for the Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture approved a bill on the establishment of a detention centre observatory, which would serve as a national preventive mechanism.  

D. Policy measures

9. CNDH notes Government efforts in the area of promoting and protecting children’s rights with the implementation of a legal framework conform to international standards.

II. Promotion and protection of human rights on the ground

A. Cooperation with human rights mechanisms

Cooperation with the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights

10. OSC reports that an OHCHR country office was set up in Togo in 2006.

B. Implementation of international human rights obligations, taking into account applicable international humanitarian law

1. Equality and non-discrimination

11. OSC reports that efforts have been made to improve the legal and institutional frameworks for the protection of women. However, Togolese legislation still contains discriminatory provisions against women. The National Assembly has delayed voting on the revised and approved Individuals and Family Code. CNDH recommends that Togo adopt the law containing the new Individuals and Family Code. OSC adds that the ministerial department in charge of such matters does not have sufficient financial resources.

12. CNDH notes that despite the existence of a legal framework for the protection of persons with disabilities, affected individuals continue to face difficulties, particularly in terms of limited access to education, inaccessibility of most public buildings for persons with physical disabilities, and a lack of care facilities for persons with mental disabilities. CNDH recommends that Togo facilitate access for persons with disabilities to education and employment.

13. OSC reports that older persons are a vulnerable sector of society and that Government policy does not allow for their personal development.

2. Right to life, liberty and security of the person

14. JS1 notes with satisfaction that Togo has adopted a law abolishing capital punishment, commuting all death sentences already pronounced to life imprisonment.

15. OSC mentions an increase in lynching and that the media have shown images of the lynch victims who were described as criminals. OSC also mentions that, on 22 June 2010, during the public demonstrations that followed increases in fuel prices, a security official killed one demonstrator and seriously injured another.

16. CNDH indicates that all acts of torture are strictly prohibited by the Constitution. There has been a significant decrease in the number of acts of torture in places of detention, particularly police and gendarmerie stations, thanks to the efforts of human rights
organizations and training by the Ministries of Security and Defence. Inhuman and degrading treatment is nonetheless present in the prison system.23

17. While it welcomes the draft revision of the Criminal Code that will include a definition of torture and establish appropriate penalties, JS1 notes that the bill has been awaiting Government adoption for more than two years.24 JS1 also notes that, owing to the lack of a definition of torture in Togo’s legislation, no sentences have been handed down relating to acts of torture. Likewise, despite the frequency of acts of torture by police and gendarmerie officers, the acts are rarely penalized.25 JS1 recommends that Togo urgently adopt the draft revision of the Criminal Code, including a definition of torture in line with article 1 of the Convention against Torture and penalties proportionate to the seriousness of the crime.26

18. JS1 recommends that Togo regularly conduct training for law enforcement personnel, including members of the police force and prison staff, so as to ensure that all have a thorough knowledge of the provisions of the Convention against Torture.27

19. CNDH reports that there have been imprisonments due to civil or commercial debt, especially within the framework of the National Commission for Bank Loan Recoveries.28 CNDH recommends that Togo dissolve this Commission.29

20. CNDH reports that prison policy has been undergoing improvements with the Emergency Programme to Support the Prison Sector (PAUSEP). Despite the Programme’s ambitious objectives and the changes it has already effected, living conditions and inmate treatment in prisons are still a cause of concern. CNDH mentions overcrowding in some prisons, which is caused by the large number of pretrial detainees; undernourishment of inmates; and unhygienic conditions affecting inmates’ health.30 JS1 reports similar observations.31 JS1 also notes the glaring lack of training for prison guards in fundamental human rights concepts.32

21. OSC reports that detainees are not separated from those who were serving prison sentences, nor are those serving jail terms for minor offences separated from those serving time for criminal offences.33 Both CNDH and JS1 do however, report that all prisons separate male and female prisoners.34

22. OSC reports that detention conditions, overcrowding, and the lack of rehabilitation centres prevent detainees from taking advantage of their right to rehabilitation. OSC notes however that the Government, with the support of the European Union, has undertaken the construction of new prisons for civilians and a rehabilitation centre for detainees after their release.35

23. CNDH recommends that Togo bring conditions of detention in line with the minimum requirements and that the country’s partners continue their support to provide Togo with modern prisons and detention centres.36

24. JS1 reports that non-governmental organizations have had free access to detention centres and prisons for some time. However, certain places such as the National Intelligence Agency’s detention centres for “special” detainees are inaccessible.37 According to the OSC, detainees in those centres are also denied visits from family and lawyers despite the visiting permits issued regularly by the judges in charge of their cases.38

25. JS1 reports that most gendarmerie and police stations do not have temporary detention facilities that meet international standards.39

26. JS1 reports that domestic violence and conjugal rape are not offences under the Criminal Code.40

27. The International Catholic Child Bureau (ICCB) reports that in 2005 Togo adopted a law prohibiting child trafficking, a crime which is also covered under articles 410 et seq. of
the Children’s Code. Trafficking is extensively defined to ensure that the offenders and
their accomplices, including parents, do not go unpunished. ICCB reports that child
trafficking nonetheless persists on the national as well as the international level. Togo is a
country both of origin and of transit for the international trafficking of children. On the
national level, trafficking mainly consists of confinement, and exploitation of children within
the family.41

28. ICCB adds that Togo has implemented a data-collection system on child trafficking
with the National Commission for the Care and Social Reintegration of Child Victims of
Trafficking (CNARSEVT), but that it does not include the selling and kidnapping of
children. CNARSEVT has regional and prefectural branches but they are not always
operational. Togo has also signed multilateral accords on cooperation in the fight against
child trafficking with other countries from the subregion, but they are not always
respected.42

29. ICCB recommends that Togo issue a decree on the organization and functioning of a
national commission to combat the trafficking of children; that it change the name of the
CNARSEVT to conform with Act 2005-009 and expand its powers; that it strengthen the
system to protect children and prevent child trafficking and also ensure that subregional
procedures are operational; and that it include information about the selling and kidnapping
of children in its existing CNARSEVT data-collection system.43

30. ICCB reports that harmful traditional practices (placement of children in voodoo
convents, female genital mutilation, scarification, tattooing, and sale of female children into
servitude to pay off debts) still persist in Togo. Only female genital mutilation is a
punishable offence under the Children’s Code. ICCB recommends that Togo establish
provisions making all harmful traditional practices criminal offences, put in place
decentralized surveillance mechanisms and raise public awareness of the consequences of
harmful traditional practices on the life and health of the child.44

31. ICCB states that Ministry of Labour Order No. 1464 of 12 November 2007
established a list of types of work prohibited to children and that most of the provisions in
International Labour Organization Convention No. 182 have been integrated into domestic
law.45 ICCB notes, however, that the worst forms of child labour still persist, particularly in
rural areas.46 ICCB recommends that Togo publicize current legislation concerning the
worst forms of child labour, fight to punish offenders who exploit children by effectively
implementing the laws in force, and reorganize and work with the informal sector to ensure
recognition of the need to protect children against the worst forms of labour.47

32. ICCB reports that the Children’s Code goes further than the Criminal Code by
prohibiting moral and physical violence towards children, including paedophilia. There is
also a helpline to encourage people to report cases of abuse and ill-treatment in the Golfe
prefecture.48 ICCB notes that some of these acts are not effectively punished, that some
proceedings are never settled, and that violence is not always reported.49 The Istituto
Internazionale Maria Ausiliatrice (IIMA) adds that girls are more vulnerable to violence.50
IIMA also notes that children accused of sorcery suffer violence and recommends that Togo
implement specific measures to eradicate the phenomenon.51

33. ICCB recommends that Togo harmonize all of the provisions relating to the
protection of children against abuse and ill-treatment in Togolese legislation to conform
with the Children’s Code; fight against the impunity of offenders who abuse or ill-treat
children by effectively applying the legislation in force; extend the “Allo III” helpline to
cover the entire country; and put in place a mechanism to provide psychological and social
support, rehabilitation and employment support for victims.52

34. The Global Initiative to End All Corporal Punishment of Children (GIEACPC)
states that it has not been able to obtain official confirmation that the Children’s Code is
interpreted as prohibiting all corporal punishment at home. However, corporal punishment is unlawful in all other settings, although still practiced in schools, as confirmed by ICCB.  

3. Administration of justice, including impunity, and the rule of law

35. ICCB notes the various reform proposals relating to the administration of justice, such as the preliminary draft decree on the reorganization and functioning of the Juvenile Division, the preliminary draft document on legal aid, and the preliminary draft policy for the reintegration of detainees. ICCB recommends that Togo enact the reform laws to consolidate the legal framework for juvenile justice without delay. ICCB also recommends that Togo ensure the provision of training on the particularities of children’s rights for those involved in the legal system.

36. ICCB reports that the legal framework for juvenile justice is laid out in Act No. 2007-017 of 6 July 2007 which establishes the Children’s Code, but that it is not effectively implemented. Lomé has the only youth court, and the judges appointed to youth cases under the jurisdiction of the Kara appeal court do not have any special training in juvenile justice. ICCB recommends that Togo set up youth courts and juvenile divisions and appoint juvenile judges in conformance with article 317 of the Children’s Code.

37. ICCB notes that there is only one Juvenile Division in Togo (in Lomé), that it separates girls from boys and its occupancy rate is acceptable. However, the building is in disrepair and the Division depends on civil society for 80 per cent of the vocational training given to young inmates of an age to learn a trade because it does not receive a budget allocation from the Government.

38. JS1 reports that articles 17 and 18 of the Constitution provide that “any person who has been arrested has the right to be informed immediately of the charges against him or her” and that an individual “is presumed innocent until proven guilty in a court of law”. In practice, these rights are not respected.

39. JS1 adds that the provisions of the Code of Criminal Procedure relating to police custody do not provide for the notification of rights or the presence of a lawyer, and that the medical examination of persons held is merely an option available only at their request or that of a member of their family, subject to the agreement of the prosecution authorities. No provision is made for the detained person to choose the doctor.

40. JS1 notes that the assistance of a lawyer from the stage of the preliminary inquest remains a constitutional provision, the practical organization of which has never been laid down in the Code of Criminal Procedures or any other document.

41. OSC adds that some cases have been delayed more than once due to a lack of interpreters and that defendants are rarely judged within a reasonable period of time.

42. JS1 also notes that the legal time limits for police custody are frequently disregarded. Furthermore, access to justice is still expensive and the legal aid mechanisms have insufficient funds.

43. OSC reports that impunity has been spreading over the past decades to reach alarming proportions. Perpetrators of violence and human rights violations committed since the beginning of the democratic process in Togo in 1990 have not been identified through independent and credible investigations or, in the cases where the perpetrators are known, they have never been held accountable. Some high-ranking security officials suspected of acts of torture continue to advance in the ranks. Furthermore, according to OSC, the authorities do not make any effort to ensure that victims’ complaints to the courts are
investigated and the right to justice is respected. OSC recommends that Togo investigate the complaints submitted by the victims of the 2005 political violence.  

44. OSC also notes that ordinary civilians occasionally used their connections with those in power to threaten other individuals or have them arrested; that prefects continue to threaten the population and prohibit demonstrations without any justification; and that heads of companies continue to commit economic crimes without being called to account.  

4. Right to privacy, marriage, and family life  

45. CNDH reports that, despite Government and civil society organizations’ efforts to raise public awareness of the issue, there is still a problem of low birth registration rates. IIMA notes that this affects the right to education.  

46. CNDH deplores the continued adherence to certain social and cultural practices that result, inter alia, in women being denied inheritance rights. OSC adds the issue of forced and early marriages.  

47. Joint Submission 2 (JS2) reports that article 88 of the Penal Code criminalizes and punishes impudent acts or crimes against nature with an individual of the same sex. JS2 recommends that the Human Rights Council urges Togo to bring its legislation into conformity with its commitment to equality and non-discrimination, and its international human rights obligations, by repealing all provisions which may be applied to criminalize certain sexual activity between consenting adults.  

5. Freedom of movement  

48. OSC notes that article 22 of the Constitution establishes the freedom of movement, but that this right has been violated at certain times by the confiscation of some individuals’ passports.  

6. Freedom of religion or belief, expression, association and peaceful assembly and right to participate in public and political life  

49. CNDH notes with satisfaction that, despite some attempts to curtail the freedom of the press, there is a degree of freedom of expression. It applauds the Government’s efforts, particularly the decriminalization of offences against the press laws.  

50. Media Foundation for West Africa (MFWA) states that the High Authority for Audiovisual and Communication (HAAC) is the country’s media regulatory body, while the Togolese Media Observatory (OTM) is the media self-regulatory body, established by the journalists themselves in 1999.  

51. OSC reports that despite the 1998 Press and Broadcasting Code Act, which establishes the freedom of press and decriminalizes offences against the press laws, privately-run media are constantly facing impediments to the free exercise of journalism. These difficulties include intimidation, threats, physical aggression, and series of complaints against journalists by the political and the administrative authorities and even by HAAC. In this regard, MFWA notes that a law was adopted in 2009 which gave HAAC more powers than it had initially. OSC cites several examples of complaints, threats, publication bans, and interference by the executive in court cases. MFWA also lists examples of freedom of press violations such as attacks on journalists, arbitrary suspension and revocation of licences and criminal defamation suits. MFWA recommends that Togo amend the Criminal Code, the Press Code and all other legislation which infringes on the freedom of the press and the freedom of expression by repealing criminal defamation; provide a legal framework for accessing information by passing an Access to Information Law; withdraw the repressive media regulatory law introduced in October 2009 which
amended Law 2004-021 of 15 December 15 2004 establishing “HAAC”; and guarantee the safety and protection of journalists and conduct independent investigation of any such attack.82

52. CNDH reports that freedom of association is guaranteed by the Togolese Constitution and that recognition of an association is subject to the system of prior declaration, which can create delays.83 OSC adds that this legal system dates back to the colonial period and should be updated.84

53. CNDH states that the Constitution enshrines the principle of the freedom of assembly and public demonstration. In practice, however, the lack of a legal framework and the poor functioning of the administrative courts have made it difficult to verify the legality of some decisions to ban public demonstrations or public assemblies. This was the case of some public demonstrations by political opposition parties and civil society organizations.85 OSC states that the prohibition also affects demonstrations that are not political.86

54. CNDH and OSC recommend that Togo define a legal framework for the exercise of the rights to freedom of assembly and public demonstration. They also recommend that Togo ensure the functioning of the administrative courts.87

55. OSC reports that the exercise of the right to participate in decisions on national policy has been evolving in fits and starts, with a number of shortcomings and failures. Issues of concern related to the demarcation of boundaries of electoral districts, the establishment of a reliable electoral roll, voting by Togolese living abroad and the collection and tallying of the ballots have frequently been reasons for contesting the final results.88

56. OSC adds that these shortcomings, in conjunction with the lack of independence of the institutions responsible for organizing the elections and settling electoral disputes, particularly the Independent National Electoral Commission and the Constitutional Court, inevitably falsified the election results and hence called into question the legitimacy of the elected officials. OSC further notes that the party in power ostentatiously used State funds during electoral periods, exceeding the budget limits established by law.89

57. CNDH deplores the underrepresentation of women in decision-making bodies and recommends that Togo produce a bill establishing a quota for the representation of women in such bodies.90

7. Right to work and to just and favourable conditions of work

58. OSC notes that the right to work is violated by, inter alia, abusive dismissals, nepotism (particularly in recruitment), high unemployment rates, very low wages, the lack of social security, corruption, and poor working conditions.91

59. CNDH reports that the private sector, including the industrial export-processing zone, helps to reduce unemployment. CNDH notes however, the violation of workplace rules by companies in the export-processing zone.92 OSC reports that a new law is under consideration in Parliament.93 CNDH recommends that Togo take the necessary measures to harmonize the legal framework for labour in the export-processing zone with current national legislation.94

8. Right to social security and to an adequate standard of living

60. IIMA notes with concern that 69 per cent of the Togolese population is living under the poverty line, with a very high poverty rate in rural areas.95 OSC reports that approximately 82 per cent of persons with disabilities live under the poverty line.96
61. OSC reports that access to food is a problem due to the low purchasing power of the population despite government efforts to make food products, particularly cereals, more accessible.97

62. OSC notes that the property sector is marked by the absence of regulation, which has resulted in unlawful expropriations of communal property, a lack of housing policies, high rents, uncontrolled occupation of Government-owned land, and property disputes.98

63. CNDH notes the Government’s efforts with regard to health policies but also the shortage of equipment and of specialized physicians in hospitals (apart from the two university hospitals in Lomé), and that the majority of the population cannot afford adequate health care due to their low purchasing power.99 OSC recommends that Togo increase the budget allocation for children and women’s health care.100

64. The Association Femme Plus Togo (AFPT) mentions Act No. 2005-012 on the protection of persons with regard to HIV/AIDS and draws attention to a number of its provisions that protect the rights of infected persons, particularly the provisions regarding discrimination and prevention.101 AFPT adds, however, that no implementing decree has ever been passed for the act and it has never been invoked before a judge.102 AFPT recommends that the courts apply the act and it be publicized in local languages.103 AFPT notes the actions on the behalf of people infected with HIV/AIDS by associations and non-governmental human rights organizations.104 AFPT also recommends that Togo make funds available to the courts and judicial aides for legal assistance to women living with HIV.105

65. OSC reports that some Togolese companies regularly dump waste and garbage into their surrounding environment and that the Government does not take any measures to protect the local population.106

9. Right to education and to participate in the cultural life of the community

66. ICCB reports that the rights to education and to vocational training are enshrined in the Constitution and in the Children’s Code. Education is mandatory for children of both sexes until the age of 15. ICCB also notes that the abolition of tuition fees for preschools and primary schools has resulted in an increased enrolment rate, which in turn has led to an increase in the education budget.107 IIMA notes the adoption in 2009 of a sectoral policy declaration on education (DPSE) and in 2010 of a sectoral plan for education (PSE), which both set ambitious goals to be attained by 2020 in the field of education.108

67. ICCB notes that there are still many obstacles to attaining Millennium Development Goal 2 by 2015. They include very low levels of access to preschool education, high dropout rates, insufficiently adapted textbooks, lack of textbooks, poorly trained teachers, use of volunteers as teachers, insufficient Government monitoring and guidelines, limited school infrastructure, poor sanitary conditions, child exploitation, and the lack of school cafeterias.109 IIMA reports similar findings.110

68. ICCB recommends that Togo increase the national education budget, implement the main recommendations of the national education policy adopted in 2008, ensure better monitoring and guidance for schools, undertake flexible and proactive practical measures and provide adequate funding to organize primary and secondary school education and ensure that it is free.111

69. IIMA also notes that sociocultural and economic factors result in discrimination against young girls in education.112 IIMA recommends that Togo take the necessary measures to promote girls’ emancipation in the collective mentality to give them the same opportunities as men in education, work and society.113

70. OSC reports that children with disabilities have difficulty getting into school buildings and accessing work tools, and also reports that there are no appropriate
educational facilities for students with hearing or visual impairments.\textsuperscript{114} IIMA reports similar findings, adding that some beliefs made parents reluctant to send their disabled children to school.\textsuperscript{115}

III. Achievements, best practices, challenges, and constraints

N/A

IV. Key national priorities, initiatives, and commitments

N/A

V. Capacity-building and technical assistance

N/A

Notes

\textsuperscript{1} The stakeholders listed below have contributed information for this summary; the full texts of all original submissions are available at: www.ohchr.org. (One asterisk denotes a non-governmental organization in consultative status with the Economic and Social Council. Two asterisks denote a national human rights institution with “A” status)

\textit{Civil society}

AFPT Association Femme Plus Togo, Lomé, Togo;

ICCB International Catholic Child Bureau, Geneva, Switzerland;

GIEACPC Global Initiative to End All Corporal Punishment of Children, London, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland;

IIMA Istituto Internazionale Maria Ausiliatrice, Veyrier, Switzerland*;

JS1 Joint Submission 1 presented by: International Federation of Action by Christians for the Abolition of Torture*, Paris, France; Action by Christians for the Abolition of Torture-Togo, Lomé, Togo;

JS2 Joint Submission 2 presented by: ARC International, London, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland; International Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Trans and Intersex Association (ILGA) and ILGA-Europe*, Brussels, Belgium;

MFWA Media Foundation for West Africa, Accra, Ghana;

OSC Civil society organisations platform, Lomé, Togo.

\textit{National human rights institution}

CNDH National Human Rights Commission, Lomé, Togo**.

\textsuperscript{2} JS1 p.1; see also IIMA, para. 1.

\textsuperscript{3} OSC, p. 12.

\textsuperscript{4} OSC, para. 3.

\textsuperscript{5} CNDH, para. 5.

\textsuperscript{6} OSC, para. 4.

\textsuperscript{7} OSC, para. 4.

\textsuperscript{8} CNDH, para. 1.

\textsuperscript{9} CNDH, paras. 34–45.

\textsuperscript{10} CNDH, para. 41.

\textsuperscript{11} JS1, p. 3.

\textsuperscript{12} CNDH, para. 28.

\textsuperscript{13} OSC, para. 4.

\textsuperscript{14} OSC, para. 28.

\textsuperscript{15} CNDH, para. 40.
OSC, para. 28.

CNDH, para. 33.; see also OSC, para. 30.

CNDH, para. 40.

OSC, para. 31.

JS1, p. 1; see also OSC, para. 5.

OSC, para. 5.

OSC, para. 5.


JS1, p. 2.

JS1, p. 2; see also OSC, para. 7.

JS1, p. 4.

JS1, p. 4.

CNDH, para. 17.

CNDH, para. 37.

CNDH, paras. 7–12; see also OSC, para. 6.

JS1, pp. 2–3.

JS1, p. 3.

OSC, para. 6.

CNDH, para. 13; JS1, p. 3.

OSC, para. 32.

CNDH, para. 36; see also OSC, p. 12.

JS1, p. 3.

OSC, para. 17.

JS1, p. 3.

JS1, p. 2; see also OSC, para. 28.

ICCB, p. 5; see also OSC, para. 29.

ICCB, p. 5.

ICCB, p. 5.

ICCB, p. 6; see also JS1, p. 2.

ICCB, p. 2.

ICCB, p. 2; see also IIMA, para. 25.

ICCB, p. 3.

ICCB, p. 5; see also IIMA, para. 25.

ICCB, p. 5; see also IIMA, paras. 23–24.

IIMA, para. 26.

IIMA, paras. 27 and 29 (c).

ICCB, p. 6; see also IIMA, para. 29 (a) (b).

GIEACPC, p. 2; ICCB, p. 4.

ICCB, p. 1.

ICCB, p. 2; see also CNDH, para. 40.

ICCB, p. 2; see also CNDH, para. 40.

ICCB, p. 1; see also CNDH, para. 29; OSC, para. 29

ICCB, p. 2.

ICCB, p. 1.

JS1, p. 4; see also OSC, para. 16.

JS1, p. 4.

OSC, para. 16.

JS1, p. 4; see also OSC, para. 17.

OSC, para. 17.

JS1, p. 4; see also OSC, para. 6.

OSC, para. 18.

OSC, p. 12.

OSC, para. 19.

CNDH, para. 30.

IIMA, para. 8.

CNDH, para. 32.
72 CNDH, para. 28.
73 JS2, p. 1.
74 JS2, p. 3.
75 OSC, para. 26.
76 CNDH, paras. 18–19.
77 MFWA, p. 3.
78 OSC, para. 8.
79 MFWA, p. 3.
80 OSC, paras. 9–12.
81 MFWA, pp. 4–5.
82 MFWA, p. 5.
83 CNDH, paras. 20–21.
84 OSC, para. 13.
85 CNDH, para. 22; see also OSC, para. 14.
86 OSC, para. 15.
87 CNDH, para. 38; OSC, p. 12.
88 OSC, para. 20.
89 OSC, para. 21.
90 CNDH, paras. 32 and 40; see also OSC, para. 28.
91 OSC, para. 22.
92 CNDH, para. 23; see also OSC, para. 23.
93 OSC, para. 23.
94 CNDH, para. 39; see also OSC, p. 12.
95 IIMA, para. 3.
96 OSC, para. 30.
97 CNDH, para. 24.
98 OSC, para. 24.
99 CNDH, paras. 25–27; see also OSC, para. 25.
100 OSC, p. 12.
101 AFPT, p. 4.
102 AFPT, p. 4.
103 AFPT, p. 5.
104 AFPT, p. 4.
105 AFPT, p. 5.
106 OSC, para. 27.
107 ICCB, p. 3.
108 IIMA, para. 4.
109 ICCB, p. 4.
110 IIMA, paras. 5–7 and 9–12.
111 ICCB, pp. 4–5.
112 IIMA, para. 21.
113 IIMA, para. 22 (h)
114 OSC, para. 30.
115 IIMA, paras. 18–20 and 22 (g) (h).