

# **Responses to Recommendations**

## **BULGARIA**

Review in the Working Group: 04 November 2010 Adoption in the Plenary: 17 March 2011

### Bulgaria's responses to recommendations (as of 05.07.2011):

| In the Report of the Working Group: | In the Addendum:   | During the plenary:                | Summary:   |
|-------------------------------------|--|------------------------------------|--|
| No response, all pending            | Out of the 113 pending, 94 were accepted (among which 40 were considered as already implemented or in the process of implementation <sup>1</sup> ), 1 was accepted in part (underlined in blue), 6 rejected, 5 noted (-> pending) and 1 not addressed (2 <sup>nd</sup> part of 80.64) <sup>2</sup> | No additional information provided | Accepted: 95 Rejected: 6 No clear position: 0 Pending: 6 |

### List of recommendations contained in Section II of the Report of the Working Group A/HRC/16/9:

80. The recommendations formulated during the interactive dialogue and listed below will be examined by Bulgaria, which will provide responses in due course, but no later than the sixteenth session of the Human Rights Council, to be held in March 2011:

A - 80.1. Consider the possibility of expressing its consent to be bound by (Argentina)/ratify (Armenia, Spain, Palestine, Switzerland)/accede to the Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, to permit the enable an independent monitoring of prisons and detention centres by the Subcommittee (Czech Republic);

R - 80.2. Comply with recommendation No. 1737 of 17 March 2006 of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe, which calls for the ratification of the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (Algeria); consider the possibility

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Recommendations n° 1, 10, 21, 28, 30, 45, 47, 48, 49, 50, 51, 52, 54, 55, 56, 57, 62, 69, 70, 71, 72, 73, 74, 77, 78, 80, 82, 83, 85, 87, 90, 92, 93, 94, 95, 96, 97, 98, 100 and 106. <sup>2</sup> The total number of recommendations is now 114 as 1 was split.

of expressing its consent to be bound by (Argentina)/ratify (Palestine)/accede to ICRMW (Bosnia and Herzegovina);

- A 80.3. Adhere to the principles of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, with a view to its early ratification (Mexico); ratify CRPD (Spain); consider the possibility of expressing its consent to be bound by (Argentina)/consider ratifying CRPD and the Optional Protocol thereto (Chile), which would result in a higher level of cooperation with international human rights mechanisms, ensuring better safeguards for the rights of people with disabilities (Hungary);
- A 80.4. Consider the possibility of expressing its consent to be bound by the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance (Argentina)/ratify CED (Spain) and accept the competence of the treaty body as provided for in articles 31 and 32 (France);
- P 80.5. Ratify the Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (Spain, Palestine, Switzerland):
- A 80.6. Consider acceding to (Brazil)/accede to the 1954 Convention relating to the Status of Stateless Persons, and the 1961 Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness (Germany, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Azerbaijan, Slovenia);
- A 80.7. Adopt a law guaranteeing equal opportunities for women and men (Canada);
- A 80.8. Adopt legislation to prevent discrimination on the grounds of sexual orientation in the same manner as existing legislation to protect against discrimination on the grounds of ethnicity, gender and religion (United Kingdom);
- P 80.9. Study the possibility of introducing a criminal aggravating factor for racial and religious hatred or hatred against persons with a minority sexual orientation (Spain);
- A 80.10. Adopt a domestic legislation in accordance with the 1951 Convention on the Status of Refugees and the Optional Protocol thereto, guaranteeing efficient access to procedures for determining refugee status to persons requiring international protection (Argentina);
- A 80.11. Consider establishing (Finland)/establish a national human rights institution accredited by the International Coordinating Committee of National Institutions for the promotion and protection of human rights (Algeria, Turkey) in order to raise public awareness and guide the authorities (Finland);
- A 80.12. Establish an independent national human rights institution in accordance with (Indonesia)/ In full compliance with the Paris Principles (Azerbaijan);
- A 80.13. Explore the possibility of consolidating existing Ombudsman institutions and mechanisms into a single national human rights institution in line with the Paris Principles, through accreditation by the International Coordinating Committee of National Human Rights Institutions (Malaysia);
- A 80.14. Strengthen the role of bodies and institutions such as the Ombudsman and the National Council for Cooperation on Ethnic and Demographic Issues, in particular the Commission for Protection against Discrimination, by enhancing their human and logistical capacity (Ghana);
- A 80.15. Establish urgently procedures/mechanisms at the central and local levels to ensure the health and safety of all children in institutions, including a child ombudsman at the national or regional level (Norway);
- A 80.16. Continue to further improve the already existing solid institutional framework regarding the protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms, and share best practices in this field (Greece):
- A 80.17. Further strengthen the role of bodies and institutions with competence to combat discrimination, in particular the Commission for Protection against Discrimination (Azerbaijan);
- A 80.18. Continue and strengthen, when necessary, the implementation of policies and programmes focused on the inclusion of its Roma community (Slovakia);

- A 80.19. Continue pursuing appropriate policies and programmes to accommodate the needs of mentally disabled children (Slovakia);
- A 80.20. Adopt a national strategy to continue and intensify the deinstitutionalization process aimed at replacing current shelters with alternative housing and means of care better suited to meeting the needs of orphans and/or persons with mental disabilities (Belgium);
- A 80.21. Draw up concrete and effective strategies to fight against domestic violence (Switzerland);
- A 80.22. Adopt and implement firmly all necessary measures to improve and ensure respect of the rights of people belonging to minorities (Switzerland);
- A 80.23. Develop and assess its strategies to combat human trafficking (Switzerland);
- R 80.24. Gather statistics on the various groups accessing public services in order to obtain an accurate picture of the use of services by different minorities (United Kingdom);
- A 80.25. Ensure continued emphasis on children's rights and welfare in Bulgaria's budget policy and consider increasing budget allocations for the implementation of the CRC, including in the areas of health, education and family support (Malaysia);
- A 80.26. Ensure necessary resources to facilitate the implementation of programs aimed at improving the situation of Roma people (Canada);
- A 80.27. Establish training programmes addressed to staff members of shelters for orphans and persons with mental disabilities in order to enable them to respond at best to the specific needs of the residents (Belgium);
- A 80.28. Develop and strengthen its human rights training programmes for police forces and the judiciary, addressing among others the appropriate use of force as well as issues relating to discrimination and profiling based on race (Canada);
- A 80.29. Pay special emphasis on informing members of especially the Roma community, the elderly, women and the disadvantaged of their constitutional rights as citizens (Finland);
- A 80.30. Initiate public programmes to increase knowledge and awareness about sexually transferred diseases (STDs) and contraception (Germany);
- P 80.31. Give positive consideration to the request to carry out a visit to the country by the Special Rapporteur on the question of the trafficking of persons (Belarus);
- A 80.32. Continue to take the necessary measures in order to better promote women's rights in all spheres of society (Greece);
- A 80.33. Continue to take concrete measures in accordance with obligations under the relevant international treaties to protect women's rights and raise their social status (China);
- A 80.34. Consider further affirmative action to accelerate equality for women in practice: in working life and in political decision-making (Norway);
- A 80.35. Continue developing policies for effective gender equality and to combat gender violence, conducting special monitoring of cases involving gender-based violence and studying the reasons why such cases are rarely reported to the authorities (Spain);
- A 80.36. Take steps to address the gender segregation in the economy and the gender wage gap in the public sector (Ghana);
- A 80.37. Strengthen the concept of equality between the sexes and nondiscrimination, and open up possibilities for women to participate in public life and have access to high-level positions in leadership and administrative posts (Iraq);

- A 80.38. Continue its efforts to overcome stereotypical attitudes regarding the roles of men and women and existing gender inequality (Ukraine);
- A 80.39. Continue, as a main priority of the Bulgarian legislative and administrative policies, the fight against all forms of religious hatred, discrimination, racism, extremism and xenophobia (Algeria);
- A 80.40. Redouble efforts for the effective implementation of criminal provisions relating to acts of ethnic discrimination so as to prevent discrimination and human rights violations committed against persons belonging to minority groups (Mexico);
- A 80.41. Take more resolute action to prevent, and punish perpetrators, of racially motivated acts and propaganda that targeted ethnic minorities and foreigners (Malaysia);
- A 80.42. Continue in its efforts to tackle manifestation of racism and xenophobia including a review of the respective law to ensure that full and equal rights are guaranteed to all (Czech Republic);
- A 80.43. Support more actively the implementation of the rights of sexual minorities as a means to fight social isolation and discrimination (Norway);
- A 80.44. Develop effective measures to overcome continuing discriminatory patterns against ethnic minorities and lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender persons through education and training (Spain);
- A 80.45. Continue strengthening the legal safeguards against ill treatment, and pursue efforts to reduce incidents of ill treatment by law enforcement personnel (Slovakia);
- A 80.46. Step up its efforts aimed at strengthening its effective implementation of the Convention against Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Argentina);
- A 80.47. Take all necessary measures to ensure that detention conditions fully meet international human rights standards, in accordance with Bulgaria's international obligations (Sweden);
- A 80.48. Make further efforts for combating domestic violence, as the problem of domestic violence is still present (Bosnia and Herzegovina);
- A 80.49. Take concrete measures aimed at effectively fighting against genderbased violence, including social awareness-raising campaigns and training programmes targeting law enforcement officials (Canada);
- A 80.50. Put in place sound policies to ensure a safer environment for children, and implement a more effective system for addressing cases of violence against children (Indonesia);
- A 80.51. Implement policies to prevent and detect cases of child abuse, as well as to ensure accountability and the rehabilitation of child victims (Brazil);
- A 80.52. Further enhance measures to prevent the exploitation of children for the purposes of prostitution and pornography, as well as to prosecute persons who are guilty of the exploitation or ill treatment of children (Belarus);
- A 80.53. Continue to ensure effective implementation of the national and transnational referral mechanism for victims of trafficking, and improve public awareness about the human trafficking issue (Indonesia);
- A 80.54. Step up its effort to combat trafficking in persons, inter alia, through the development of international cooperation with interested Governments, international organizations and non-governmental organizations (Belarus);
- A 80.55. Strengthen its efforts relating to the fight against human trafficking, ensuring that all aspects of the issue, from prevention to the suppression of crimes and the protection of victims, are taken into consideration (Belgium);

- A 80.56. Strengthen awareness-raising campaigns aimed at preventing human trafficking, and increase the protection provided to victims, notably children and newborns, including those of Roma origin, in line with the recommendations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child (Mexico);
- A 80.57. Further develop preventive measures to combat trafficking in human beings, with a special emphasis on children, newborn and pregnant women, as well as strengthen the national referral system and increase the number of centres for victims of trafficking (Republic of Moldova);
- A 80.58. Bring to justice the persons and social institutions for children responsible for 238 reported unaccounted deaths in the period 2000–2010 (Norway);
- R 80.59. Take concrete action to bring to justice those who committed humanrights violations against the members of the Turkish minority in the period 1984–1989 before the natural extinction of both the victims and perpetrators of the said events (Turkey);
- A 80.60. Take concrete measures to remedy the excessive use of force by security forces (Switzerland);
- A 80.61. Continue its efforts to investigate, prosecute and convict trafficking offenders (Ukraine);
- A 80.62. Continue its judicial reforms in the form of amendments to the Judicial Systems Act, the Penal Code and the Penal Procedure Code, the Ministry of Interior Act and the Criminal Assets Forfeiture Act and the like; give attention to more training and professionalism within the judiciary as well as the enhancement of the appraisal and appointment systems, and strengthen the accountability and efficiency of the Supreme Judicial Council (Netherlands);
- A 80.63. Continue to focus political attention and commitment, as well as the necessary administrative resources in Bulgaria, on the crucial issue of promoting efficiency and consistency throughout the justice system, and not least the accountability of the judiciary (Denmark);

#### 80.64.

- R Enshrine in its Constitution the protection of rights of national and ethnic minorities,
- P create an effective juvenile system, and continue to reform its justice system (Nigeria);
- A 80.65. Promote awareness of the National Legal Office and its services to improve confidence in the justice system and to ensure that Bulgarians have adequate legal standing before the courts (United Kingdom);
- A 80.66. Strictly apply all legal and disciplinary means to sanction corruption, conflict of interest and organized crime, and accelerate the implementation of the action plan to implement the National Anti-Corruption Strategy (Netherlands);
- A 80.67. Create an effective juvenile justice system in order to defend children's rights (Hungary);
- A 80.68. Take measures to guarantee effective access to justice, reparation and protection for women victims of gender-based violence (Brazil);
- A 80.69. Increase the budget for prisons to add new bed space and staff, provide training for prison personnel and explore other types of detention for nonviolent offenders to reduce the burden on prison facilities and staff (United States);
- A 80.70. Set up a policy specifically aimed at reducing the number of Roma children placed without valid reasons in establishments for children with disabilities or in rehabilitation centres (Canada):
- A 80.71. Rapidly close social institutions for children and find appropriate solutions for children who cannot live with their families (Norway);
- A 80.72. Allocate sufficient and, if necessary, additional resources for the recruitment and training of personnel in children's institutions, and intensify efforts to raise the number of foster families and provide them with adequate training for foster care (Netherlands);

- A 80.73. Increase the training and staffing levels of institutions for children, improve oversight, and implement incentives to attract higher-quality candidates to fill positions at these institutions (United States);
- A 80.74. Undertake a comprehensive review of the child protection system, social assistance and family policies to ensure coordinated and efficient services (Austria);
- A 80.75. Provide sufficient resources for the effective functioning of the child protection system, including through training of social workers, standards to limit the case load per social worker and their adequate remuneration (Austria);
- A 80.76. Take steps to ensure the provision of appropriate support for parents and families at risk to prevent the abandonment of children (Austria);
- A 80.77. Take urgent steps to end the continuing practice of placing babies and young children under the age of 3 in institutionalized care, and ensure the availability of family-based alternatives (Austria):
- A 80.78. Strengthen efforts to implement the "Vision for Deinstitutionalization", specifically in the light of the United Nations Guidelines for the Alternative Care of Children (Austria);
- P 80.79. Introduce legislation prohibiting secrecy in adoption and guaranteeing the right of the child to know his or her origins (Austria);
- A 80.80. Take steps to end the practice of international adoptions where the adoptive applicants are matched with children without having been introduced or had any opportunity to build any relationship with a child prior to the adoption decision (Austria);
- R 80.81. Take necessary action to address the impediments faced by the Turkish minority in exercising its religious freedoms, including the prevention of choosing religious leaders and their discouragement from restoring the property of the foundations and refusal for construction of mosques in the cities (Turkey);
- A 80.82. Take necessary measures to ensure that local authorities respect the religious freedom of minority religious groups and treat all religious groups equally (United States);
- A 80.83. Work for more diversified ownership of the media, and thoroughly investigate cases of intimidation/harassment against journalists, in order to fully ensure freedom of the press (Norway);
- A 80.84. Strengthen public awareness-raising campaigns relating to racism and intolerance, and adopt measures aimed at fighting racism in the media (Canada);
- A 80.85. Guarantee, without any discrimination, the rights to freedom of expression, association and peaceful assembly and the right to participate in public and political life (former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia);
- A 80.86. Use more actively existing or new platforms for involving the Roma community in policy formulation and implementation at both the local and central levels, and actively pursue an increase in the number of Roma in all public institutions (Netherlands);
- A 80.87. Consider adopting cash grant policies to alleviate poverty of vulnerable groups and to link it with health care, such as vaccination and prenatal care (Brazil);
- A 80.88. Take further measures to combat poverty of elderly women, single mothers with children and women with disabilities (Norway);
- A 80.89. Guarantee to all citizens, without exemptions, equal access to public services and to an adequate standard of living (Finland);
- A 80.90. Identify a set of "universal social services" accessible to all children and families to provide an adequate standard of living (Austria);

- P 80.91. Take effective measures to enhance the health-care sector (Algeria);
- A 80.92. Persist in its national efforts aimed at the systematic inclusion of human rights education in its educational and vocational systems and at all school levels (Morocco);
- A 80.93. Ensure that Roma children are not sent to special schools for the disabled, but instead are schooled together with other Bulgarian children (Finland);
- A 80.94. Evaluate the need for tuition in a special school on the basis of the child's personal characteristics, not on his or her ethnicity (Finland);
- A 80.95. Avoid the practice of the school segregation of Roma children, for example with primary school teachers, who are speaking their mother tongue, with the objective of achieving an effective learning of the Bulgarian language and other subjects taught (Spain);
- A 80.96. Communicate more efficiently to Roma parents the importance of literacy and the positive effect of education on the children's future, and, in this task, use the help of school assistants with a Romani background (Finland);
- A 80.97. Guarantee that the implementation of the law on compulsory preschool education for all children, adopted by Parliament on 23 September, covers the Roma as well as other minorities (Finland);
- A 80.98. Continue its efforts on the issue of inclusion of children with disabilities in the general school system and reducing the number of schools for children with special educational needs (Slovenia);
- A 80.99. Step up all efforts to protect the rights of migrants and also foster their economic and cultural life and improve their standard of living, particularly for large families, and provide them with Government financial support (Iraq);
- A 80.100. Take all necessary measures to fully ensure the enjoyment of human rights by persons belonging to the Romani minority, including with regard to combating discrimination and violence against such persons (Sweden);
- A 80.101. Continue to improve the living conditions of Roma people (Italy);
- A 80.102. Strengthen agreed efforts and the consolidation of existing acquis on the integration of Roma People, particularly relating to budget and coordination of the various programmes established by the authorities (Morocco);
- A 80.103. Continue to give political attention, commitment and concrete action on the issue of combating any discriminatory practices against the Roma minority (Denmark);
- A 80.104. Promote the economic and social integration of Roma individuals and respect for their rights by ensuring that due consideration is given in all policymaking processes to the impact on Roma of proposed legislation (United Kingdom);
- A 80.105. Pursue its integration policy for the Roma population, guaranteeing access to basic health and social services, education, housing and employment (Spain);
- A 80.106. Promote the identity of the Armenian minority by further addressing its educational, religious and cultural needs (Armenia);
- R 80.107. Fully implement the obligations from the Framework Convention for National Minorities of the Council of Europe and allow the registration of OMO Ilinden PIRIN and allow fully enjoyment of all rights to the Macedonian minority and other minorities, by fulfilling cultural and other related rights (former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia);
- A 80.108. Fully respect all international obligations by accepting the legally binding United Nations documents and by its membership in the United Nations, especially articles 1, 3, 6 and 15 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, and by respecting the decisions of the other

<u>United Nations bodies and other organizations at the national level, especially, the decisions of the Human Rights Court in Strasbourg, in regard to minority rights (former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia);</u>

A - 80.109. Further address the human rights challenges and continue its efforts in strengthening national mechanisms, particularly in the field of gender equality and non-discrimination and in the area of preventing and combating human trafficking and protecting the victims thereof (Serbia);

A - 80.110. Undertake a transparent and inclusive process with civil society in the implementation of universal periodic review recommendations (Norway);

A - 80.111. Continue consultations with civil society in the follow-up to this review (Austria);

A - 80.112. Translate, publish and make available to the citizens of the country the assessments and recommendations made by relevant international human rights bodies, including the Human Rights Council's universal periodic review (Norway);

A - 80.113. Assess the recommendation made by the Committee on the Rights of the Child with regard to seeking technical assistance from the United Nations, in order to implement the recommendations of the study on violence against children and the establishment of a juvenile justice system (Chile).

Disclaimer: This classification was made by UPR Info based on United Nations documents and webcast. For more information about this document, read our "Methodology". For questions, comments and/or corrections, please write to <a href="mailto:info@upr-info.org">info@upr-info.org</a>