

Recommendation from Second Cycle	Corresponding Themes	Position	Assessment/comments on level of implementation	Recommendation from 2018 Mid-Term Report	Recommendation for Third Cycle
<i>Theme: A41 Constitutional and legislative framework</i>					
166.59 Further implement international human rights norms into the national legislation (Uzbekistan); Source of position: A/HRC/32/17/Add.1	A41 Constitutional and legislative framework Affected persons: - general	Supported	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> While Singapore has ratified several key human rights treaties such as CEDAW, CRC, CRPD and ICERD, it has entered reservations to significant articles of CEDAW and ICERD.¹ Singapore has also not acceded to many other human rights conventions². 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Remaining reservations to Articles 2 and 16 of CEDAW should be removed, in order to more incisively bridge the divide between Civil and Sharia law 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Much more effort needs to be undertaken by the government to institutionalise obligations to respect and protect human rights, while refraining from actions that hinder their protection.

¹ *Summary of Stakeholders' Information* (pp. 1-14, Rep. No. A/HRC/WG.6/24/SGP/3). (2011). Human Rights Council Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review; Association of Women Action and Research CEDAW Shadow Report (pp. 1-275, Rep.). (2011). Singapore: AWARE; Report on CEDAW and the Republic of Singapore "Many Voices, One Movement" Coalition Report of National NGOs (pp. 1-38, Rep.). (2017). Singapore.

² These are most notably: the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, the International Convention on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination; and the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, The Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment

Recommendation from Second Cycle	Corresponding Themes	Position	Assessment/comments on level of implementation	Recommendation from Mid-Term Report	Recommendation for Third Cycle
<i>Theme: Institutions & policies - General</i>					
<p>166.115 Continue taking effective policy and other measures to build a fair and inclusive society (Bhutan);</p> <p>Source of position: A/HRC/32/17/Add.1</p>	<p>A42 Institutions & policies - General B32 Racial discrimination G1 Members of minorities</p> <p>Affected persons: - general - minorities/ racial, ethnic, linguistic, religious or descent-based groups</p>	<p>Supported</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In March 2020, a High Court judge dismissed three men's court actions against Section 377A³, in line with Prime Minister Lee Hsien Loong had stated in June 2019 that Section 377A will be around 'for some time'⁴ • No laws to protect specifically LBGTO persons from discrimination, even while Home Affairs Minister K. Shanmugam explicitly stated that the LGBTQ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Similar to third cycle recommendation</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We acknowledge the amendment made to the MRHA. But we ask again that Section 377A be repealed, we enact an Anti-Discrimination law in Singapore to protect LGBTQ Singaporeans and become inclusive.

³ Justice See Kee Oon said, in a case summary released by the court, Section 377A "serves the purpose of safeguarding public morality by showing societal moral disapproval of male homosexual acts".

Lam, L. (2020, March 30). High Court judge dismisses all three challenges to Section 377A. Retrieved from: <https://www.channelnewsasia.com/news/singapore/377a-challenge-dismissed-high-court-judge-penal-code-12588738>. Accessed 5 August 2020

⁴ Ng, J. (2019, June 26). 377A will be around 'for some time', will not inhibit how S'pore attracts tech talent: PM Lee. Retrieved from: <https://www.todayonline.com/singapore/377a-will-be-around-some-time-will-not-inhibit-how-spore-attracts-tech-talent-pm-lee>. Accessed 5 August 2020

			<p>community is protected under the Maintenance of Religious Harmony Act</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Nonetheless, we are heartened that the court has made decisions in favour of the well-being of dependents over archaic beliefs on sexual orientation and see this as a small step in the right direction⁵. 		
<p>166.123 Carry out general awareness-raising campaigns aimed at combating discrimination in all its forms (Chile); Source of position: A/HRC/32/17/Add.1</p>	<p>A5 Human rights education, trainings and awareness raising B31 Equality & non-discrimination Affected persons: - general</p>	Supported	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • COVID-19 has brought to the forefront issues related to race and ethnicity. Facebook had to remove a few vile postings. These postings also triggered experiences of prejudice and discrimination that Singaporeans – mainly the 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Similar to third cycle recommendation</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The MRHA is not adequate enough. We ask for an Anti-Discrimination law, sensitised training for teachers and human resource personnel and on human rights as a value system.

⁵ In a landmark case in 2018, the High Court granted a gay man to legally adopt his five year old biological son who was born through a surrogate mother in the United States. However, the court emphasized that this decision was ultimately made in the best interest of the child's well-being. Ong, J. (2018, December 17). Gay father permitted to adopt biological son born via surrogacy, in first for Singapore.

			Indians and Malays – have experienced. ⁶		
--	--	--	---	--	--

Recommendation from Second Cycle	Corresponding Themes	Position	Assessment/comments on level of implementation	Recommendation from Mid-Term Report	Recommendation for Third Cycle
<i>Theme: D43 Freedom of opinion and expression</i>					
166.202 Ensure that freedom of opinion and expression are encouraged and protected, including for individuals and organizations communicating via online public platforms (New Zealand);	D43 Freedom of opinion and expression Affected persons: - general	Supported	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Defamation remains a criminal offence under the Penal Code in Singapore⁷ Government Ministers in Singapore have also frequently filed civil suits for defamation against their critics⁸. The Government recently enacted the Prevention of 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Amend section 78B of the Parliamentary Elections Act such that violations of the restrictions on election advertising are no longer arrestable offenses, so as to stop the use of warrantless search, arrest and seizure Section 78B(2) should be 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> We reiterate our stance that Parliamentarians and Ministers ought to respect and have regard for freedom of expression by different communities in Singapore. We continue to recommend that all stakeholders have more capacity building on negotiation

⁶Mathews, Mathew & Pereira, Shane, Today, August 2020. Why Singapore needs new ways to tackle racism more effectively. Retrieved from: <https://www.todayonline.com/commentary/why-singapore-needs-new-ways-tackle-racism-more-effectively>. Accessed 13 October 2020

⁷ Chapter XXI, Penal Code (<https://sso.agc.gov.sg/Act/PC1871?ProvIds=pr499-.pr500-.pr501-.pr502->)

⁸ Summary of stakeholder's information prepared for second cycle of Singapore UPR, 2016, <https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G15/252/06/PDF/G1525206.pdf>

<p>Source of position: A/HRC/32/17/Add. 1</p>			<p>Online Falsehoods and Manipulation Act (POFMA) which is ostensibly aimed at "fake news" but lacks safeguards against abuse by the Government.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>⁹On 23 March 2021, Prime Minister Lee Hsien Loong won a defamation suit against blogger Mr Leong Sze Hian, with the Singapore high court awarding the Prime Minister S\$133,000 in damages.¹⁰</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ <i>It is notable that Mr Leong was the only person with a suit launched against him by the Prime Minister, despite “thousands” of others who had shared the same article that eventually led to the suit against him.</i> 	<p>amended to allow online news sites to publish news about an election during the cooling off period, just as how newspapers covered by the Newspaper and Printing Presses Act are permitted to do.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Authorities should also improve their engagement with responsible online news outlets; for instance, by responding to their queries. 	<p>and formalised human rights education.</p>
--	--	--	--	---	---

⁹ text in blue and in italics (for grayscale) shows updated information till April 6, 2021.

¹⁰ “PM Lee Wins Defamation Suit against Blogger Leong Sze Hian; Awarded S\$133,000 in Damages.” *TODAYonline*, www.todayonline.com/singapore/pm-lee-wins-defamation-suit-against-blogger-leong-sze-hian-awarded-s133000-damages

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ <i>This is also in addition to how Mr Leong had in fact complied prior to the Info-Communications Media Development Authority (IMDA) telling him to remove the link he shared¹¹.</i> 		
--	--	--	---	--	--

Recommendation from Second Cycle	Corresponding Themes	Position	Assessment/comments on level of implementation	Recommendation from Mid-Term Report	Recommendation for Third Cycle
<i>Theme: D44 Right to peaceful assembly</i>					
166.201 Ensure freedom of assembly and association, freedom of opinion and expression, including on the Internet, and protect	D44 Right to peaceful assembly D45 Freedom of association D43 Freedom of opinion and expression Affected persons:	Supported	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● A programme titled “Dissent and Resistance in Singapore” slated programme at Yale-NUS College, was abruptly cancelled in September 2019.¹² 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● While we recognise that some regulation of public assembly and procession is necessary to safeguard public order and safety, the regulatory need should be legitimate and restrictions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Parliamentarians and Ministers ought to respect and have regard for freedom of expression by different communities in Singapore.

¹¹ Han, Kirsten. “Lee Hsien Loong V Leong Sze Hian, Day 1.” *We, the Citizens*, We, the Citizens, 6 Oct. 2020, wethecitizens.substack.com/p/lee-hsien-loong-v-leong-sze-hian.

¹² Yi, Seow Bei. “Yale-NUS Cancels Course on Dissent and Resistance.” *The Straits Times*, 15 Sept. 2019. Retrieved from: www.straitstimes.com/singapore/education/yale-nus-cancels-course-on-dissent-and-resistance. Accessed on 18 Sept 2020

<p>freedom of the press (France); Source of position: A/HRC/32/17/Add.1</p>	<p>- general</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>Three students were arrested on 26 January 2021 for holding placards protesting against transphobia in Singapore schools¹³.</i> ● <i>Activist Jolovan Wham was fined S\$8000 for holding a protest on an MRT train which consisted of eight Singaporeans wearing blindfolds and holding up the book “1987: Singapore’s Marxist Conspiracy 30 years on”, of which he chose to serve a jail term rather than paying the full amount¹⁴</i> 	<p>should be compatible with international standards.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● We ask that the Public Order Act be amended to uphold the government’s obligation to facilitate peaceful assemblies. ● Specifically, sections 12 and 13 of the act should be amended to limit the discretion of the Minister of Home Affairs to ban public assemblies to instances where the ban is necessary to prevent imminent violence or harm, or serious public disorder. ● Criminal penalties are disproportionate for indiscretions rooted in peaceful assembly. Sections 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● We continue to recommend that all stakeholders have more capacity building on negotiation and formalised human rights education.
--	------------------	--	---	---	---

¹³ Min, Ang Hwee. “3 Arrested over Protest against Transphobia Outside MOE Building.” CNA, 27 Jan. 2021, www.channelnewsasia.com/news/singapore/moe-transphobia-protest-3-arrested-student-hormone-therapy-14045320.

¹⁴ “Activist Jolovan Wham Chooses 22 Days’ Jail over Fine for Holding Illegal Public Assembly on MRT Train.” *TODAYonline*, www.todayonline.com/singapore/activist-jolovan-wham-chooses-22-days-jail-over-fine-holding-illegal-public-assembly-mrt

				<p>15 and 16 of the act should be repealed to eliminate criminal penalties for organising or participating in peaceful assemblies or processions without a permit or holding them at a date and time that deviate from the notice.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Public Order (Unrestricted Area) (Amendment) Order 2016 should be amended to eliminate restrictions on participation by non-citizens. 	
--	--	--	--	--	--

Recommendation from Second Cycle	Corresponding Themes	Position	Assessment/comments on level of implementation	Recommendation from Mid-Term Report	Recommendation for Third Cycle
<i>Theme: D7 Right to participation in public affairs and right to vote</i>					

<p>166.209 Strengthen efforts to promote women's participation in public life, particularly at the higher corporate levels (Bahamas); Source of position: A/HRC/32/17/Add.1</p>	<p>D7 Right to participation in public affairs and right to vote Affected persons: - women</p>	<p>Supported</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Women in Singapore are still under-represented politically¹⁵ and in the workforce¹⁶. • Even while the 2020 General Elections resulted in women gaining 29 per cent of the seats- the highest number in Singapore's history, this is still a highly disproportionate number. • We note however that in a positive step, the marital immunity for rape was repealed as part of the changes to Singapore's penal code¹⁷ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Similar to third cycle recommendation</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The State needs to actively ensure that gender parity is the norm in Singapore. It is not enough for Ministers to highlight that societal mind sets should change¹⁸.
--	---	------------------	---	--	--

¹⁵ From 2006 to 2019, the representation of women parliamentarians has remained consistent at slightly more than 20%.

Hirschmann, R. (2020, January 27). Singapore: Proportion of seats held by women in national parliament 2019. Retrieved from: <https://www.statista.com/statistics/730313/singapore-proportion-of-seats-held-by-women-in-national-parliament/> . Accessed 1 Aug 2020

¹⁶ McKinsey Global Institute: The power of parity: advancing women's equality in Asia Pacific, Focus Singapore (April 2018). Retrieved from: <https://www.mckinsey.com/~media/McKinsey/Featured%20Insights/Gender%20Equality/The%20power%20of%20parity%20Advancing%20womens%20equality%20in%20Asia%20Pacific/MGI-The-power-of-parity-Advancing-womens-equality-in-Asia-pacific-Executive-summary.pdf>. Accessed 18 Aug 2020

¹⁷ Kwang, K. (2019, February 11). Marital immunity for rape set to be repealed as part of changes to Singapore's Penal Code. Retrieved from: <https://www.channelnewsasia.com/news/singapore/marital-immunity-for-rape-set-to-be-repealed-as-part-of-changes-11229224>. Accessed 1 Aug 2020

¹⁸ Li, T. W. (2017, September 23). Mindsets must shift to close gender pay gap. Retrieved from: <https://www.straitstimes.com/singapore/mindsets-must-shift-to-close-gender-pay-gap>. Accessed 1 Aug 2020

Recommendation from Second Cycle	Corresponding Themes	Position	Assessment/comments on level of implementation	Recommendation from Mid-Term Report	Recommendation for Third Cycle
<i>Theme: E21 Right to an adequate standard of living - general</i>					
<p>166.216 Continue implementing its social policies and programmes with a view to strengthening social harmony, in particular to help the elderly and the low-income citizens (Cambodia);</p> <p>Source of position: A/HRC/32/17/Add.1</p>	<p>E21 Right to an adequate standard of living - general G9 Older persons E24 Right to social security</p> <p>Affected persons: - older persons</p>	<p>Supported</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Singapore does not have a minimum wage provision, preferring instead a Progressive Wage Model (PWM) • This does not address the root cause of a cheap influx of foreign labour, and the associative impact on low-income citizens • In 2018, Singapore ranked 149 out of 157 countries in the "Commitment to Reducing Inequality Index" released by Oxfam¹⁹ This was a sharp drop from the 86th position out of 152 countries, as held in 2017. The drop has been attributed to "harmful tax practices". 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • While the government has supported some recommendations to improve the social welfare of people, those who fall through the gaps include those who are homeless, single parents, and divorcees with families 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The government has implemented some policies to improve the social welfare of people but there are still some gaps as highlighted. • We recommend that the government be more open to alternative criticisms on policies as they could also possibly be solutions. • The government also needs to review its policies to meet people's 'adequate standard of living' which means having: a roof over one's head; a sustainable

¹⁹ Oxfam, "Commitment to Reducing Inequality Index", October 2018. Retrieved from: <https://www.oxfam.org/en/research/commitment-reducing-inequality-index-2018>. Accessed 5 August 2020.

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In 2020, the pandemic has further exacerbated existing inequalities in Singapore. 		livelihood; food and affordable healthcare.
--	--	--	---	--	---

Recommendation from Second Cycle	Corresponding Themes	Position	Assessment/comments on level of implementation	Recommendation from Mid-Term Report	Recommendation for Third Cycle
<i>Theme: D23 Death penalty</i>					
166.157 Re-establish a moratorium on executions, with a view to the complete abolition of the death penalty, and prohibit the imposition of the death penalty against persons with mental and intellectual disabilities (South Africa); Prohibit the execution of persons with mental and intellectual disabilities (Spain); Source of position: A/HRC/32/17/Add.1	D23 Death penalty Affected persons: - general	Noted	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> During the 2011 Universal Periodic Review, Singapore accepted a recommendation from Finland to “[m]ake available statistics and other factual information on the use of the death penalty” and a recommendation from France to “[m]odify its legislation in such a way as to shift the burden of proof of the guilt of a person facing the death penalty, to the prosecution instead of requesting the person to prove their own innocence. To date, these recommendations have not 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Similar to third cycle recommendation</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> We continue to reiterate our recommendations to abolish the death penalty and be transparent, giving access to information and respecting the families of those to be hanged.

			<p>been substantially carried out. Eight executions were carried out in 2017, double the number of executions that took place the previous year.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">● Though the Singapore Prison Service publishes the number of executions that take place each year in its annual report, these executions are not always made available to the public via press releases from government agencies.● There is a lack of accessible information related to the use of the death penalty in Singapore, for example, the total number of inmates on death row, for instance, is not made public● There is now less time between the rejection of a death row inmate's appeal for clemency, and the scheduling of an execution. Previously, there was a gap of over a week or two between the rejection of clemency and the scheduling of		
--	--	--	---	--	--

			an execution. However, as families of death row inmates have observed, in recent cases, the inmates had been executed either on the same day of the rejection of clemency or very soon after the failed appeal for clemency		
--	--	--	---	--	--

Recommendation from Second Cycle	Corresponding Themes	Position	Assessment/comments on level of implementation	Recommendation from Mid-Term Report	Recommendation for Third Cycle
----------------------------------	----------------------	----------	--	-------------------------------------	--------------------------------

Theme: D7 Right to participation in public affairs and right to vote

166.207 Establish an independent electoral commission with a mandate to determine constituency boundaries and monitor election fundraising and campaigning (United States of America); Source of position: A/HRC/32/17/Add.1	D7 Right to participation in public affairs and right to vote Affected persons: - general	Noted	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In 2020, changes to electoral boundaries were released while Singapore was still in its lockdown, called a "Circuit Breaker", caused by the COVID-19 pandemic. The government implemented Constituency Political Broadcast (CPBs) to give parties and candidates more airtime to put their messages out to voters. But independent candidates and political parties fielding fewer than six candidates were not eligible for party political 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Similar to third cycle recommendation</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> While we understand that the pandemic is an evolving situation and a certain degree of uncertainty is inevitable, we still note the unequal access to information between the ruling party and opposition parties in terms of changes to electoral boundaries and campaigning rules. We recommend that decision-making processes be made transparent to level the playing ground
---	--	-------	---	--	---

			<p>broadcasts. This limits the avenues available for alternative voices to bring their messages across to the public. The amount of airtime allocated to each party is also dependent on the number of fielded candidates, which gives the ruling People's Action Party (PAP), a significantly longer allocation in time compared to other political parties with fewer candidates²⁰.</p>		<p>between the ruling party and opposition parties and that the Elections Department becomes an independent entity, not be in the Prime Minister's Office.</p>
--	--	--	--	--	---

Recommendation from Second Cycle	Corresponding Themes	Position	Assessment/comments on level of implementation	Recommendation from Mid-Term Report	Recommendation for Third Cycle
<i>Theme: F34 Children: Juvenile justice</i>					
166.196 Harmonize domestic law regarding the minimum age of criminal responsibility, and raise it (Uruguay);	F34 Children: Juvenile justice Affected persons: - children	Noted	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Singapore still has not made much progress with regards to the minimum legal working age of 13 years old and the minimum age of criminal responsibility of 7 years old, 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Similar to third cycle recommendation</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We continue to reiterate our recommendations on the minimum working age and age of criminal responsibility, abolish the death penalty, be transparent, giving access

²⁰ Lee, D. (2020, July 01). Singapore GE2020: Political broadcasts to air daily from July 2-9. Retrieved from: <https://www.straitstimes.com/politics/singapore-ge2020-political-broadcasts-to-air-daily-from-july-2-9>. Accessed 8 August 2020.

Source of position: A/HRC/32/17/Add.1			issues which were previously highlighted ²¹ .		to information and respecting the families of those to be hanged.
---	--	--	--	--	---

²¹ *Universal Periodic Review Mid-Term Report (2018)* (p. 23, Rep.). (2018). Singapore, Singapore.