

Universal Periodic Review
(25th session, April-May 2016)
Contribution of UNESCO to Compilation of UN information
(to Part I. A. and to Part III - F, J, K, and P)

Ireland

I. BACKGROUND AND FRAMEWORK

Scope of international obligations: Human rights treaties which fall within the competence of UNESCO and international instruments adopted by UNESCO

I.1. Table:

<i>Title</i>	<i>Date of ratification, accession or succession</i>	<i>Declarations /reservations</i>	<i>Recognition of specific competences of treaty bodies</i>	<i>Reference to the rights within UNESCO's fields of competence</i>
Convention against Discrimination in Education (1960)	Not state party to this Convention	<i>Reservations to this Convention shall not be permitted</i>		Right to education
Convention on Technical and Vocational Education. (1989)	Not state party to this Convention			Right to education
Convention concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage (1972)	16/09/1991, ratification	N/A	N/A	Right to take part in cultural life
Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage (2003)	N/A		N/A	Right to take part in cultural life
Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the	22/12/2006	N/A	N/A	Right to take part in cultural life

Diversity of Cultural Expressions (2005)				
--	--	--	--	--

II. INPUT TO PART III. IMPLEMENTATION OF INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS OBLIGATIONS, TAKING INTO ACCOUNT APPLICABLE INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN LAW TO ITEMS F, J, K, AND P

Right to education

1. NORMATIVE FRAMEWORK

1.1. Constitutional Framework

1. According to **Article 42** of the **Irish Constitution of 1937**¹:
 - “1. The State acknowledges that the primary and natural educator of the child is the Family and guarantees to respect the inalienable right and duty of parents to provide, according to their means, for the religious and moral, intellectual, physical and social education of their children.
 - Parents shall be free to provide this education in their homes or in private schools or in schools recognised or established by the State.
 - 1° The State shall not oblige parents in violation of their conscience and lawful preference to send their children to schools established by the State, or to any particular type of school designated by the State.
 - 2° The State shall, however, as guardian of the common good, require in view of actual conditions that the children receive a certain minimum education, moral, intellectual and social.
 - The State shall provide for free primary education and shall endeavour to supplement and give reasonable aid to private and corporate educational initiative, and, when the public good requires it, provide other educational facilities or institutions with due regard, however, for the rights of parents, especially in the matter of religious and moral formation.
 - In exceptional cases, where the parents for physical or moral reasons fail in their duty towards their children, the State as guardian of the common good, by appropriate means shall endeavour to supply the place of the parents, but always with due regard for the natural and imprescriptible rights of the child.

¹ <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/9aea2b8904ac8426adfaf093693970c310ed780c.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

2. **Article 44** adds that “Legislation providing State aid for schools shall not discriminate between schools under the management of different religious denominations, nor be such as to affect prejudicially the right of any child to attend a school receiving public money without attending religious instruction at that school.”

1.2. Legislative Framework

3. “The **Education Act No. 51 of 1998, last amended in 2012**², complements the constitutional provisions relating to education. The Act was the first comprehensive educational legislation in the history of the state, delineating legislation in relation to all aspects of the education system. The Act places the central features of first- and second-level education (i.e. primary and secondary education) on a statutory basis and clarifies the roles and responsibilities of all of those involved in education including school principals and teachers. It promotes the development of partnership at school level and provides a framework for the development of a supportive and dynamic working environment for teachers. It also explicitly recognizes the roles of the partners in education at a national level in the policy-making process, providing for consultation in a wide range of areas. Many of the provisions of the Act simply codify and standardize what is already happening within schools. However, this serves an important purpose in providing transparency and clarity as regards the rights and responsibilities of each of the stakeholders, as well as facilitating best practice and the effective and efficient use of resources. The Act also provided for the establishment of the National Council for Curriculum and Assessment.
4. The **Child Care Act** of 1991 acknowledges the links between health and education measures. It provides for consultation with the Minister for Education in regard to regulations concerning the health, safety, welfare and development of preschool children availing of pre-school services. The **2006 Child Care (Preschool Services) Regulations**³ govern the regulation of preschool services. These preschool services cover a diverse range of provision including full- and part-time daycare, regulated child minding settings and services which operate across a wide range of curricular philosophical bases. Infant classes in the primary schools (age group 4-5 years) come under the same legislative framework as the rest of the primary school system.

² <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/77695e80ef7a976835a5ffbb1159e87d3aeaab85.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

³ <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/407519d7ba67d2d1d1bb42a9bb369064f954c124.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

5. The **Education for Persons with Special Educational Needs Act of 2004**⁴ gives statutory rights to children with disabilities to assessment of their educational needs and provision for those needs in an inclusive setting, unless such a placement is inappropriate or impractical. The Act sets out a range of services which must be provided, including assessments, education plans and support services. The rights of workers with disabilities have been re-enforced by the provisions included in the **Disability Act** of 2006.
6. The legislation relevant to secondary schooling in Ireland includes the **Intermediate Education (Ireland) Act** of 1924 and subsequent amendments, the Vocational Education Act of 1930 and its amendments, and the Education (Welfare) Act of 2000. [...]
7. The **Education (Welfare) Act No. 22 of 2000**⁵ provides a new statutory framework for promoting regular school attendance and tackling the problems of absenteeism and early school leaving. The Act provides for coordinated supports and strategies to ensure that young people remain actively involved in education up to early adulthood. The lead role in this is given to the National Educational Welfare Board, a new statutory agency to develop and implement school attendance policy. [...]
8. The **Teaching Council Act of 2001**⁶, amended in 2006 and 2012, provides for the establishment of a Teaching Council as an independent statutory agency to promote and maintain best practice in the teaching profession and in the education and training of teachers. [...].⁷
9. Ireland has recently adopted instruments, including for instance the following⁸:
 - Residential Institutions Statutory Fund Act 2012,
 - Qualifications and Quality Assurance (Education and Training) Act 2012,
 - Education (Amendment) Act 2012,
 - Student Support Act 2011.

1.3. Institutional Framework

⁴ <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/3fc574db8f832f840ea3058ce4b5d406cd989d1b.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

⁵ <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/9cebe77a0501063f67ce1a47e3b820621898289c.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

⁶ <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/27bd915c9ef13e161cf0b853da6807846bf4b931.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

⁷ World Data on Education, IBE, Seventh Edition, 2010/2011, pp. 4-5, accessible at: http://www.ibe.unesco.org/fileadmin/user_upload/Publications/WDE/2010/pdf-versions/Ireland.pdf, Accessed on 14/04/2015

⁸ Eurydice, Legislation, <https://webgate.ec.europa.eu/fpfis/mwikis/eurydice/index.php/Ireland:Legislation>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

10. “Since its establishment by statute in 2006, the Teaching Council, as the professional body for teaching in Ireland, has taken a lead role in drafting policy on teacher education in consultation with the relevant stakeholders and the Minister.
11. The role of the Teaching Council is inter alia to promote teaching as a profession at primary and post-primary levels, to promote the professional development of teachers and to regulate standards in the profession.
12. The Teaching Council’s functions span the entire teaching career – from entry to initial teacher education programmes; induction of newly qualified teachers into the profession; and the continuing professional development of teachers throughout their careers. Following an extensive consultation process, the Council published its Policy Paper on the Continuum of Teacher Education in July 2011. This provides the guiding framework for the Council's functions relating to teacher education. [...]
13. The continuum of teacher education has traditionally been referred to internationally as the ‘three Is’ of initial teacher education, induction and in-career development. It describes the formal and informal educational and developmental activities in which teachers engage, as life-long learners, during their teaching career. It encompasses initial teacher education, induction, early and continuing professional development and, indeed, late career support, with each stage merging seamlessly into the next and interconnecting in a dynamic way with each of the others.”⁹
14. In 2012, “The [**Strategic Plan of the Higher Education Authority (HEA) for the five year period 2012 to 2016**]¹⁰, prepared in consultation with the HEA’s wide group of stakeholders, radically re-orientates and clarifies the various roles and responsibilities of the HEA. The HEA, now charged with the responsibility of leading the development of a higher education system, must focus on System Development activities that are underpinned by a robust framework for Policy and Planning while Excellence in Higher Education must be supported by a clear understanding of how Sustainability in Higher Education will be achieved. These highlighted strategic objectives will be supported by clear and transformative Governance and Performance Management arrangements and the targeted use of Strategic Programmes.

⁹ Ireland: Teachers and Education Staff, Eurydice, European Commission, accessible at: https://webgate.ec.europa.eu/fpfis/mwikis/eurydice/index.php/Ireland:Teachers_and_Education_Staff, Accessed on 14/04/2015

¹⁰ Higher Education Authority, Strategic Plan of the Higher Education Authority (HEA) – 2012-2016, http://planipolis.iiep.unesco.org/upload/Ireland/Ireland_Higher_Education_Strategy_Plan_2012-2016.pdf, <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/1428c83a4ce44e153d89d0ee3cb821fd912870b7.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

For each of these strategic objectives activities, timeframes and key performance indicators have been identified for which the HEA wishes to be held accountable.”¹¹

1.4. Policy Framework

i) General information

15. “[...] the Department of Public Expenditure and Reform has published a Public Service Reform Plan (2014 to 2016)¹² which outlines key commitments and actions for change across the civil and public service. In response, this Department [of Education and Skills] has developed an **Integrated Reform Delivery Plan (IRDP) 2015**.¹³ More detailed plans for **Shared Services**,¹⁴ including procurement, and **External Service Delivery**¹⁵ have been published separately. A document entitled **Ireland's Education and Training Sector: Overview of service delivery and reform**¹⁶, which gives further information on the various elements of the reform programme underway in the education and training sector, is also available.”¹⁷ “In line with Government policy, shared services and external service delivery models will be core elements of the Education and Training Sector Reform Programme. The purpose of implementing these delivery models is to deliver cost savings, efficiencies and other benefits to enable resources to be focused on service delivery.
16. The mission is to deliver value and benefits to our customers in the Education and Training Sector through:

¹¹ Higher Education Authority, Strategic Plan of the Higher Education Authority (HEA) – 2012-2016, p. 4, http://planipolis.iiep.unesco.org/upload/Ireland/Ireland_Higher_Education_Strategy_Plan_2012-2016.pdf, <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/1428c83a4ce44e153d89d0ee3cb821fd912870b7.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

¹² Department of Public Expenditure and Reform, Annual Progress Report on the Public Service Reform Plan 2014-2016, <http://reformplan.per.gov.ie/>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

¹³ Department of Education and Skills, Education and Training – Integrated Reform Delivery Plan 2015, <http://www.education.ie/en/The-Department/Public-Service-Reform/Education-and-Training-Sector-Integrated-Reform-Delivery-Plan-IRDP-2015.pdf>, <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/19c6c3e29fcdbbeb7ca652bd7dd7fb7a4a0ac8b9.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

¹⁴ Department of Education and Skills, Education and Training Sector – Shared Services Plan 2014 – 2016, 2014, <http://www.education.ie/en/The-Department/Public-Service-Reform/Education-and-Training-Sector-Shared-Services-Plan-2014-2016.pdf>, <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/a3e2d47b127d4562fa9c7cb10ac875917a0bf741.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

¹⁵ Department of Education and Skills, Education and Training Sector – External Service Delivery Plan 2014 – 2016, 2013, <http://www.education.ie/en/The-Department/Public-Service-Reform/Education-and-Training-Sector-External-Service-Delivery-Plan-2014-2016.pdf>, <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/8eb3666ff087e960e334671f7a8272150453a05c.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

¹⁶ Department of Education and Skills, Ireland’s Education and Training Sector – Overview of service delivery and reform, <http://www.education.ie/en/The-Department/Public-Service-Reform/Irelands-Education-and-Training-Sector-Overview-of-service-delivery-and-reform.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

¹⁷ Department of Education and Skills, Public Service Reform, <http://www.education.ie/en/The-Department/Public-Service-Reform/>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

- Customer relationships that are built on quality of service
- People who are skilled, dedicated and enjoy what they do
- Technology that is leading edge
- Optimised business processes
- Focus on delivery of results and continuous improvement
- To ensure that this is achieved we have identified a number of design principles that will underpin our approach to shared services:
- Initiatives will be based on robust data (baselining)
- Initiatives will, where feasible, be cross sector / sub-sectors to achieve requisite scale
- Existing initiatives/infrastructure will be leveraged to the maximum extent possible (subject to business case)
- The focus will be on administrative and corporate processes, but opportunities for smaller scale centers of excellence will also be considered
- The autonomy of all institutions will be respected (including data confidentiality)
- Options assessment will consider all valid scenarios from do nothing through to shared services and external service delivery.”¹⁸

17. Four priority areas for action are identified in the document entitled **“Ireland’s Education and Training Sector – Overview of service delivery and reform”**¹⁹:

- Learning for Life: “We want an education and training system that provides all learners with the knowledge and skills they need to participate fully in society and the economy, one that enables learners to learn how to learn.”
- Improving Quality and Accountability: “We want to deliver high quality education and training experiences for everyone and improve accountability for educational outcomes across the system including reporting to parents and the school community.”
- Supporting Inclusion and Diversity: “We want an education and training system that welcomes and meaningfully includes learners with disabilities and special educational needs, disadvantaged learners, and those with language, cultural and social differences.”

¹⁸ Department of Education and Skills, Education and Training Sector – External Service Delivery Plan 2014 – 2016, 2013, pp. 2-3, <http://www.education.ie/en/The-Department/Public-Service-Reform/Education-and-Training-Sector-External-Service-Delivery-Plan-2014-2016.pdf>, <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/8eb3666ff087e960e334671f7a8272150453a05c.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015 / Department of Education and Skills, Education and Training Sector – Shared Services Plan 2014 – 2016, 2014, pp. 6-7, <http://www.education.ie/en/The-Department/Public-Service-Reform/Education-and-Training-Sector-Shared-Services-Plan-2014-2016.pdf>, <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/a3e2d47b127d4562fa9c7cb10ac875917a0bf741.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

¹⁹ Department of Education and Skills, Ireland’s Education and Training Sector – Overview of service delivery and reform, p. 11, <http://www.education.ie/en/The-Department/Public-Service-Reform/Irelands-Education-and-Training-Sector-Overview-of-service-delivery-and-reform.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

- Building the Right Systems and Infrastructure: “We want a modern, flexible education and training system which makes the best use of available resources.”
18. In the **National Strategy on Education for Sustainable Development in Ireland, 2014-2020**²⁰, the Department of Education and Skills adopted eight priority actions:
- Leadership and coordination,
 - Data collection and baseline measurement,
 - Curriculum at pre-school, primary and post primary,
 - Professional development,
 - Further Education and Training,
 - Higher Education and Research,
 - Promoting participation by young people,
 - Sustainability in action.
19. “48. While reforming the public service to ensure that resources are utilized effectively and services delivered efficiently is an essential measure, particularly in times of crisis, States must ensure that such measures do not impact on the quality and availability of services provided to the most vulnerable segments of society.
20. 49. The independent expert stresses that considerable reductions in public sector staff and wages may severely impede the delivery of social services. Limited or decreased staff numbers, and reduction in remuneration to the providers of public services, particularly education and health care, could drastically impact on individuals’ ability to easily and effectively access such services. These measures may impact disproportionately on people living in poverty, particularly those in rural areas and the most disadvantaged, who already face numerous barriers in accessing health care and education services. By adopting such policies, Ireland may jeopardize its ability to enable the widest possible enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights, and runs a risk of violating the prohibition against unjustified retrogressive measures.”²¹
21. “60. Combating child poverty requires a set of comprehensive measures, including adequate income support and investments in public services such as education and health. Reduction in funding to public services will impact the accessibility and quality of health and education services for children. For instance, the recent cuts to the school transport scheme, and the

²⁰ Department of Education and Skills, National Strategy on Education for Sustainable Development in Ireland, 2014-2020, July 2014, <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/a0b5b82b0e14b72030246935ad6a1bf914f158bc.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

²¹ Report of the independent expert on the question of human rights and extreme poverty, Magdalena Sepúlveda Carmona, Mission to Ireland from 10 to 15 January 2011, p. 12, <http://daccess-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G11/132/17/PDF/G1113217.pdf?OpenElement>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

introduction of additional fees for post-primary pupils, will place additional financial burden on struggling families.”²²

ii) Inclusive Education

22. “436. Proficiency in the English language is of critical importance in ensuring the integration of children from diverse cultural and backgrounds (and is one of the 10 key components of the “Intercultural Education Strategy, 2010-2015”). A major resource for schools is “English as an Additional Language” (“EAL”) teachers. EAL teachers assist schools in working with parents and class teachers, to identify pupils requiring additional language support, to administer the assessment material, to devise appropriate language/socialisation programmes, to deliver the programmes and to record and monitor pupils’ progress.
23. 437. Budget 2011 announced a phased reduction in the numbers of EAL Language Support Teachers. This resource remains a substantial one, and the challenge is to utilise it as effectively as possible. [...]
24. 438. The Department of Education and Skills also provides for the English language and socialisation needs of adult refugees through the Adult Refugee Programme (ARP), an integration programme funded by the Government and open to all those with refugee status. This service is also provided through the VEC sector. Participation in the programme is available for a period of up to 1 year, with 20 hours per week.”²³
25. “443. The Department of Education and Skills and the Office of the Minister for Integration launched the “Intercultural Education Strategy, 2010-2015” in September 2010. The Strategy is designed to assist in the creation of an intercultural, integrated and inclusive learning environment in all sectors of education.”²⁴
26. “445. At the time of Ireland previous reports, there were 42 segregated Traveller pre-schools throughout the country. The TES recommended that segregated pre-schools be integrated into mainstream services within a 10 year period by 2016. The transition from segregated to integrated provision is being managed sensitively, incorporating best practice. The Department of Education and Skills funded 6 segregated Traveller pre-schools in September

²² Report of the independent expert on the question of human rights and extreme poverty, Magdalena Sepúlveda Carmona, Mission to Ireland from 10 to 15 January 2011, p. 15, <http://daccess-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G11/132/17/PDF/G1113217.pdf?OpenElement>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

²³ State reports submitted to the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 2013, p. 78, http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/TreatyBodyExternal/countries.aspx?CountryCode=IRL&Lang=EN, Accessed on 14/04/2015

²⁴ State reports submitted to the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 2013, p. 79, http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/TreatyBodyExternal/countries.aspx?CountryCode=IRL&Lang=EN, Accessed on 14/04/2015

2010. It is anticipated that all young Traveller children will be enrolled in mainstream pre-schools by 2012.”²⁵

27. “446. Integrated provision is provided in primary and post primary schools where Travellers participate on an equal basis with other service users. Resource Teachers for Travellers posts at primary level and equivalent teaching hours for Travellers at post-primary level will be discontinued from September 2011 and Visiting Teacher Service for Travellers will also be discontinued from September 2011. Traveller students who could benefit from additional tuition will receive this tuition through the existing mainstream learning support provision in schools. Schools will be advised to select students for learning support on the basis of priority of educational need and not on the basis of membership of the Traveller community.”²⁶
28. “78. Another crucial area of concern is the Traveller community’s lack of access to, and equal participation in, the education system. More than two thirds of Travellers aged 15 or over have no secondary or tertiary education. While the independent expert acknowledges the Government’s well-intentioned efforts to mainstream Traveller children in the education system, she stresses that mainstreaming is not sufficient to rectify the serious structural lack of inclusion which leads to the imbalance in access to education. The independent expert recognizes that in many cases Travellers make a conscious decision, based on a number of cultural and social factors, not to remain in higher education. The State should be respectful of this decision while removing barriers to education and encouraging Traveller children to remain in education where possible. Ireland should also support efforts by adult Travellers who wish to return to education or training.”²⁷
29. “593. The previous Government deferred the full implementation of EPSEN in light of the difficult economic situation and the significant associated costs (estimated to be at least €235 million per annum). The current Programme for Government 2011-2016 has committed to the publication of a plan for the implementation of the Act to prioritise access for children with special needs to an individual education plan. The priority will be moving to a system in which necessary supports follow a child from primary to second level, and achieving greater integration of special needs-related services.

²⁵ State reports submitted to the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 2013, p. 79, http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/TreatyBodyExternal/countries.aspx?CountryCode=IRL&Lang=EN, Accessed on 14/04/2015

²⁶ State reports submitted to the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 2013, pp. 79-80, http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/TreatyBodyExternal/countries.aspx?CountryCode=IRL&Lang=EN, Accessed on 14/04/2015

²⁷ Report of the independent expert on the question of human rights and extreme poverty, Magdalena Sepúlveda Carmona, Mission to Ireland from 10 to 15 January 2011, p. 18, <http://daccess-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G11/132/17/PDF/G1113217.pdf?OpenElement>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

30. 594. To help achieve this and other educational aims, from September 2012 all children who are transitioning from primary to post-primary schools will have their end-of-year report card sent to their new school. This approach will ensure continuity and progression for students, alert secondary schools if any child will need additional support to improve their literacy and numeracy skills, and improve the arrangements for the transfer of data from preschool to primary, and from primary to post-primary levels.”²⁸
31. “66. A significant number of people with disabilities in Ireland are living in consistent poverty. Persons with disabilities face discrimination in the education system and in the labour market. They are significantly under-represented in the labour market and in the achievement of educational qualifications, which constitute significant areas of exclusion, making them especially vulnerable to poverty, particularly due to the other social and financial burdens that they encounter.
32. 67. Poverty and social exclusion among persons with disabilities is an ingrained, structural problem in Ireland, requiring a comprehensive approach from the State. In this regard, the independent expert welcomes the comprehensive approach of Ireland’s National Disability Strategy (NDS), which includes many of the rights and obligations enunciated in the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. For example, there have been significant developments in special education over the last decade, through enhanced provision, and new structural and legislative frameworks for the delivery of services to pupils with special educational needs. However, further efforts must be made to ensure that the NDS is fully and effectively implemented. In this regard, the independent expert welcomes the commitment in the PGNR to publishing a realistic plan for the implementation of the NDS.”²⁹

iii. Quality education

33. SOLAS (An tSeirbhís Oideachais Leanúnaigh agus Scileanna) developed the **Further Education and Training Strategy 2014 – 2019**³⁰. “The Further Education and Training Act 2013 was signed into law in July 2013. It provided for the dissolution of FÁS and the establishment of SOLAS. SOLAS is required by the Act to propose a five-year strategy for the provision of further education and training (FET). SOLAS operates under the aegis of the

²⁸ State reports submitted to the Committee on the Rights of the Child, p. 116, http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/TreatyBodyExternal/countries.aspx?CountryCode=IRL&Lang=EN, Accessed on 14/04/2015

²⁹ Report of the independent expert on the question of human rights and extreme poverty, Magdalena Sepúlveda Carmona, Mission to Ireland from 10 to 15 January 2011, p. 16, <http://daccess-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G11/132/17/PDF/G1113217.pdf?OpenElement>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

³⁰ SOLAS (An tSeirbhís Oideachais Leanúnaigh agus Scileanna), Further Education and Training Strategy 2014 – 2019, <http://www.education.ie/en/Publications/Policy-Reports/Further-Education-and-Training-Strategy-2014-2019.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

Department of Education and Skills and will, in conjunction with the sixteen Education and Training Boards, be responsible for the integration, coordination and funding of a wide range of further education and training programmes.

34. The SOLAS Action Plan states that SOLAS will be tasked with ensuring the provision of 21st century high-quality FET programmes which are responsive to the needs of learners and the requirements of a changed and changing economy. The FET Strategy is intended therefore to provide a focus for the setting of investment priorities, and to provide a framework for the establishment and development of a strong FET sector.
35. The FET Strategy aims to deliver a higher quality learning experience leading to better outcomes for all those who engage in FET. It presents a roadmap and implementation plan to realise the vision of a world-class integrated system of further education and training in Ireland which will: support economic development; increase social inclusion; and meet the needs of all learners, communities and employers who engage with FET. The FET Strategy is set within a context of Government reform of public services.³¹

iv. Curriculum

33. In 2012, the National Council for Curriculum and Assessment published its **Strategic Plan for 2012 – 2015**³². “The plan sets out the vision and mission of the organisation for the next three years and identifies six strategic goals that set the direction of its work over that time. [...] This strategic plan sets out the work of the Council for that timeframe.”³³ Following the strategic goals set by the Council:
 - “Curriculum and assessment development
 - To develop innovative curriculum and assessment for engagement, progression, quality, inclusion and continuity across sectors
 - Engagement and networks for innovation
 - To work with schools, teachers, practitioners and learners to build capacity for change and to inform curriculum and assessment development and implementation
 - Knowledge and research
 - To generate, use and share knowledge and research to support the development of curriculum and assessment advice and practice in schools and other educational settings

³¹ SOLAS (An tSeirbhís Oideachais Leanúnaigh agus Scileanna), Further Education and Training Strategy 2014 – 2019, p. 3, <http://www.education.ie/en/Publications/Policy-Reports/Further-Education-and-Training-Strategy-2014-2019.pdf>, <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/72576f7e4dc99a6f8e98c0b920cdb5582c3b5c4d.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

³² National Council for Curriculum and Assessment, Strategic Plan for 2012 – 2015, 2012, <http://www.ncca.ie/en/file/ncca/NCCA-Strategic-Plan-2012-2015.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

³³ National Council for Curriculum and Assessment, Strategic Plan, http://www.ncca.ie/en/About_Us/Strategic_Plan/, accessed on 14/04/2015

- Strategic relationships
- To build on existing strategic relationships and develop new ones to support and connect curriculum and assessment development and implementation
- Profile and communications
- To communicate, present and share the work and achievements of the NCCA to improve the profile of the organisation and engagement with its work
- Organisational effectiveness and governance
- To develop the NCCA governance and organisation structures, processes, skills and competences to innovate in the achievement of the vision.”³⁴

v. Gender Equality

34. “Concern over boys’ underachievement in learning outcomes, particularly reading and languages, has grown since 2000. Yet only a few countries with marked gender gaps have comprehensive policy frameworks to address this concern. European countries and economies, such as (...) Ireland (...), have made reducing boys’ underachievement a policy priority. Government concerns have largely been driven by results of national and international assessment tests, such as PISA, which have highlighted the widening gender gap in reading skills and have received significant media attention in some countries.”³⁵

vi. Financing of education

35. “428. The allocation for the student grant schemes in 2010 is €362m. The 2011 allocation compares with €362m in 2010. Some 69,000 students received financial support under the student grant schemes in the 2009/2010 academic year, an increase of some 21% from the 2008/2009 academic year and this number is expected to rise further for the 2010/11 academic year. In 2000-01, a special rate of maintenance grant was introduced to encourage and support the participation of the most economically disadvantaged students in third level education.

³⁴ National Council for Curriculum and Assessment, Strategic Plan for 2012 – 2015, 2012, p. 9, <http://www.ncca.ie/en/file/ncca/NCCA-Strategic-Plan-2012-2015.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

³⁵ GMR EFA: Achievements and Challenges 2000-2015 p. 183

<http://www.google.fr/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=2&ved=0CDEQFjABahUKewjB0-7znYrGAhVCPRQKHakrADI&url=http%3A%2F%2Funesdoc.unesco.org%2Fimages%2F0023%2F002322%2F232205e.pdf&ei=49p6VYHWJcl6UKnXgJAD&usg=AFQjCNEso8XWrRKjEk2uHje6KUzaMmevuw&bvm=bv.95515949,d.d24>

36. 429. It is intended to introduce the unified grant scheme for the 2011/12 academic year and to establish the single grant awarding authority for the 2012/13 academic year.”³⁶
37. “571. The Programme for Government commits to prioritising investment in school building projects. In March 2012, a €2 billion five-year capital investment programme was launched by the Minister for Education and Skills, involving some 275 major school building projects that are planned to proceed to construction over the duration of the programme. The plan will provide over 100,000 permanent school places, of which 80,000 will be new school places. The remainder will be the replacement of temporary or unsatisfactory accommodation. This substantial investment means that over 11% of the total school population will benefit from new permanent places delivered during 2012 2016.”³⁷

vii. Other (as appropriate)

38. In 2011, the Department of Education and Skills adopted a **National Strategy to Improve Literacy and Numeracy among Children and Young People – 2011-2020**.³⁸ “During the period from 2011 to 2020 we will aim to:
39. *Improve our attitudes to literacy and numeracy*
- Promote better understanding of the critical importance of supporting the development of children’s ability to become effective communicators from their earliest years and the key role played by parents, families and communities in this regard
 - Raise public awareness of the importance of oral and written language in all its forms (including print, writing and digital media)
 - Foster an enjoyment of reading among children and young people
 - Create greater awareness of, and more positive attitudes towards, mathematics among the public
 - Promote better attitudes to mathematics among children and young people
40. *Improve outcomes at early childhood level*
- Improve the communication and oral-language competence of young children in early childhood care and education (ECCE) settings and their readiness to develop early mathematical language and ideas

³⁶ State reports submitted to the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 2013, p. 77,

http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/TreatyBodyExternal/countries.aspx?CountryCode=IRL&Lang=EN, Accessed on 14/04/2015

³⁷ State reports submitted to the Committee on the Rights of the Child, p. 112,

http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/TreatyBodyExternal/countries.aspx?CountryCode=IRL&Lang=EN, Accessed on 14/04/2015

³⁸ Department of Education and Skills, National Strategy to Improve Literacy and Numeracy among Children and Young People – 2011-2020, 2011, https://www.education.ie/en/Publications/Policy-Reports/lit_num_strategy_full.pdf,

<http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/8c98abf052c03c54871c5a9eac0032eb707578a1.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

41. *Improve outcomes at primary school level*

- Ensure that each primary school sets goals and monitors progress in achieving demanding but realistic targets for the improvement of the literacy and numeracy skills of its students in a school improvement plan
- Increase the percentages of primary children performing at Level 3 or higher (i.e. at the highest levels) in the National Assessment of Mathematics and English Reading by at least 5 percentage points at both second class and sixth class by 2020
- Reduce the percentage of children performing at or below Level 1 (i.e. minimum level) in the National Assessment of Mathematics and English Reading by at least 5 percentage points at both second class and sixth class by 2020
- Increase awareness of the importance of digital literacy and include assessments of primary students' ability to read digital material as part of the national assessments of English reading

42. *Improve outcomes at post-primary level*

- Ensure that each post-primary school sets goals and monitors progress in achieving demanding but realistic targets for the improvement of the literacy and numeracy skills of its students in a school improvement plan
- Extend the National Assessment of Mathematics and English Reading to assess the performance of students at the end of second year in post-primary education; use data from these assessments to establish the existing levels of achievement and to set realistic targets for improvement, similar to those adopted at the primary level
- Increase awareness of the importance of digital literacy and include assessments of post-primary students' ability to read digital material as part of the national assessments of English reading
- Increase the percentage of 15-year old students performing at or above Level 4 (i.e. at the highest levels) in PISA reading literacy and numeracy tests by at least 5 percentage points by 2020
- Halve the percentage of 15-year old students performing at or below Level 1 (the lowest level) in PISA reading literacy and numeracy tests by 2020
- Increase the percentage of students taking the Higher Level mathematics examination at the end of junior cycle (i.e. Junior Certificate examination or its equivalent) to 60 per cent by 2020
- Increase the percentage of students taking the Higher Level mathematics examination in Leaving Certificate to 30 per cent by 2020.³⁹

³⁹ Department of Education and Skills, National Strategy to Improve Literacy and Numeracy among Children and Young People – 2011-2020, 2011, pp. 17-18, https://www.education.ie/en/Publications/Policy-Reports/lit_num_strategy_full.pdf, <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/8c98abf052c03c54871c5a9eac0032eb707578a1.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

43. “The **National Strategy for Higher Education to 2030**⁴⁰ was announced in January 2011. This sets out a new vision for higher education in Ireland. In the decades ahead, higher education will play a central role in making Ireland a country recognised for innovation, competitive enterprise and continuing academic excellence; an attractive place to live and work with a quality of life, cultural vibrancy and inclusive social structures. At its heart, however, it will still be about people and higher education. Education institutions will have a strong engagement with individual students, communities, society and enterprise; will give students a sense of Irish place and identity; and will equip them with the skills to play a strong part on the world stage, while they will be the source of new ideas through excellent research.”⁴¹
44. “The Human Rights Commission in Ireland provides tailored training to the Civil and Public Service in the field of human rights. Training has been provided to members of the police force, prison service, local authority officials and civil servants. This training is ongoing. In December 2013 the Commission hosted a conference in Dublin to highlight best practice in human rights education and training for civil and public servants. The event was organised in cooperation with the Office of the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights.”⁴²
45. “The Irish Prison Service Three Year Strategic Plan 2012 – 2015 outlines a significant programme of capital works to improve prison conditions. The Irish Prison Service also provides a wide range of rehabilitative programmes that include education, vocational training, healthcare, psychiatric, psychological, counselling, welfare and spiritual services. Renovations are carried out where necessary.”⁴³

2. COOPERATION

46. Ireland is **not party** to the 1960 UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education.
47. Ireland did **not report** to UNESCO on the measures taken for the implementation of the 1960 UNESCO Recommendation against Discrimination in Education within the framework of the:

⁴⁰ Department of Education and Skills, Strategy Group, National Strategy for Higher Education to 2030, January 2011, <https://www.education.ie/en/Publications/Policy-Reports/National-Strategy-for-Higher-Education-2030.pdf>, <http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/8633ceae5fb3b777bc5583156445044946da9e28.pdf>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

⁴¹ Higher Education Authority, National Strategy for Higher Education to 2030, <http://www.hea.ie/en/policy/national-strategy>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

⁴² UPR-info, Universal Periodic Review, Ireland, National Interim Report, March 2014, p. 10, http://www.upr-info.org/sites/default/files/document/ireland/session_12_-_october_2011/upr_national_interim_report_ireland_march_2014.pdf, Accessed on 14/04/2015

⁴³ UPR-info, Universal Periodic Review, Ireland, National Interim Report, March 2014, p. 22, http://www.upr-info.org/sites/default/files/document/ireland/session_12_-_october_2011/upr_national_interim_report_ireland_march_2014.pdf, Accessed on 14/04/2015

- **Sixth Consultation** of Member States (covering the period 1994-1999),
 - **Seventh Consultation** of Member States (covering the period 2000-2005),
 - **Eighth Consultation** of Member States (covering the period 2006-2011).
48. Ireland did **not report** to UNESCO on the measures taken for the implementation of the 1974 UNESCO Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms within the framework of the:
- **Fourth Consultation** of Member States (covering the period 2005-2008),
 - **Fifth Consultation** of Member States (covering the period 2009-2011).
49. Ireland **reported** to UNESCO on the measures taken for the implementation of the 1976 Recommendation on the Development of Adult Education within the framework of the:
- **First Consultation** of Member States (1993),
 - **Second Consultation** of Member States (2011).
50. Ireland is **not party** to the 1989 UNESCO Convention on Technical and Vocational Education.

Freedom of opinion and expression

1. CONSTITUTIONAL AND LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK

51. Article 40 of the Constitution of Ireland guarantees freedom of expression, but calls on the Government to ensure that organs of public opinion are not abused to undermine public order or morality or the authority of the state. The same article states that blasphemous, seditious, or indecent matter is regarded as a punishable offence.⁴⁴
52. Defamation is regarded as a criminal offence according to the 2009 Defamation Act and can be punished by both fines and prison terms not exceeding five years. Publication and uttering of blasphemous matter can be punished by fines.
53. As defense to defamation, the Act mentions truth, absolute privilege, qualified privilege, honest opinion as well as fair and reasonable publication on a matter of public interest.⁴⁵

⁴⁴ See the Constitution of Ireland on the national legal website:
<http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/en/constitution/index.html#article40>.

⁴⁵ See the 2009 Defamation Act on the national legal website:
www.irishstatutebook.ie/2009/en/act/pub/0031/print.html#sec31/.

54. A Freedom of Information Act was introduced in 1997 and amended in 2003 and in 2014. It obliges official institutions to publish information on their activities and to make the information they hold available to citizens.

2. MEDIA SELF-REGULATION

55. The 2009 Defamation Act provides for recognition of a Press Council. The Press Council is a non-statutory body tasked with maintaining minimum ethical and professional standards among the press, including through the establishment of a mandatory Code of Practice for member organizations. It employs the Press Ombudsman who receives, hears and determines complaints concerning the conduct of Press Council members.⁴⁶
56. There is one major press union, the National Union of Journalists.⁴⁷

3. SAFETY OF JOURNALISTS

57. UNESCO recorded no killing of journalists in Ireland so far. Journalists operate in a safe environment.

III. RECOMMENDATIONS

Right to education

58. **Recommendations made within the framework of the first cycle of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review, considered on (please check the date on the following web site: <http://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/UPR/Pages/Documentation.aspx>)**
59. 106. The recommendations formulated during the interactive dialogue and listed below have been examined and enjoy the support of Ireland:
- i. 106.14. Continue to provide support for human rights education and training domestically in order to enhance awareness and respect for human rights (Moldova);

⁴⁶ See the 2009 Defamation Act on the national legal website: www.irishstatutebook.ie/2009/en/act/pub/0031/print.html#sec31 and the website of the Irish Press Council: <http://www.presscouncil.ie/>.

⁴⁷ It is the journalist union for both Ireland and the United Kingdom: <https://www.nuj.org.uk/home/>.

- ii. 106.15. Take measures to make access available to people with disabilities, on an equal footing, to education, employment, housing, transport and cultural life and facilitate their access to public places and services (Costa Rica);
- iii. 106.30. Strengthen the measures to improve the representation, education and protection of Travellers (Chile);
- iv. 106.32. Continue pursuing appropriate policies designed to provide for equal opportunities to members of the Traveller community, with special focus on access to health care, education and housing, including ensuring Travellers' participation in public life related decision-making process (Slovakia);
- v. 106.47. Continue with the implementation of measures to improve adverse conditions in prisons, in particular the renovations required to improve the health situation in prisons and effective programmes for education and rehabilitation of prison inmates (Peru);
- vi. 106.51. Continue efforts with the aim of establishing protection campaigns and programmes for women against domestic violence (Argentina);
- vii. 106.56. Make available adequate budgetary allocations, despite financial constraints, for the continued provision and improvement of education and health services which are essential to protect the rights of the poorest and the most vulnerable members of society (Sri Lanka);
- viii. 106.58. Ensure the national availability and accessibility to contraceptive services and methods, including through the dissemination of information and education to boys, girls and adolescents, taking into account prevention of discrimination based on geographic status, disability or migrant status (Mexico);
- ix. 107.47. Encourage diversity and tolerance of other faiths and beliefs in the education system by monitoring incidents of discrimination on the basis of belief (Turkey);
- x. The following recommendations have been examined and partially enjoy the support of Ireland:
- xi. 107.7. Adopt practical and legal measures to curb racial discrimination and discrimination against migrants and look at the appeal by UNESCO to ratify the Convention against Discrimination in Education (Uzbekistan);

- i. 13. We believe that it is never acceptable for individuals to be targeted and pilloried because of their race, colour, religion or national or ethnic origins or identity and the Government is committed to combating all manifestations of racism. For this reason, robust practical and legal measures against racial discrimination, racism and xenophobia are already in place in existing and forthcoming legislation.

See response under 107.6 in relation to the 1960 Convention.^{48,49}

61. 107.19. Develop provisions of a training programme to raise the awareness of the judiciary to the racial dimension of crime and to ensure that judges take into account racist motivation as an aggravating circumstance when they sentence in criminal cases (Uruguay);

62. "107.19.PARTIALLY ACCEPTED

- i. 27. While the Government accepts the spirit of this recommendation and will draw the attention of the independent Judicial Studies Institute to the recommendation, it is not possible to formally accept this recommendation as Ireland has strict separation of powers. Judicial training is organised by the judiciary itself in order to ensure that their Constitutional independence is fully respected."⁵⁰
- ii. 107.41. Explicitly prohibit any form of corporal punishment in the family and continue developing awareness-raising campaigns and education for parents and for the public in general (Uruguay);

63. "107.41.PARTIALLY ACCEPTED

- i. 53. This matter is under continuous review. A proposal to either prohibit the defence of reasonable chastisement or to further circumscribe the definitions of what constitutes reasonable chastisement would require careful consideration. Details of

⁴⁸ "There are no immediate plans for Ireland to ratify the Convention. Ireland is fully committed to the principles of equality of educational opportunity contained in the Convention."

⁴⁹ Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review, Ireland, Addendum, Views on conclusions and/or recommendations, voluntary commitments and replies presented by the State under review, 6 March 2012, p. 3, <http://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/UPR/Pages/IESession12.aspx>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

⁵⁰ Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review, Ireland, Addendum, Views on conclusions and/or recommendations, voluntary commitments and replies presented by the State under review, 6 March 2012, p. 5, <http://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/UPR/Pages/IESession12.aspx>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

any possible future significant developments in this area will be communicated to the UN CRC.⁵¹

- ii. 107.42. Promote forms of discrimination and non-violent discipline as an alternative to corporal punishment, taking into consideration general comment No. 8 (2006) of the Committee on the Rights of the Child on the protection of children from corporal punishment and other cruel or degrading forms of punishment (Uruguay);

64. The following recommendations have been examined and do not enjoy the support of Ireland:

- i. 107.6. Ratify the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) Convention against Discrimination in Education (1960) (Hungary) and incorporate it into law (Iran);
- ii. 107.48. Eliminate religious discrimination in access to education (Egypt);

65. Analysis:

Ireland took many steps toward an inclusive educational system with: the Integrated Reform Delivery Plan (IRDP 2015) which includes supporting inclusion and diversity for disabled, special educational needs, disadvantaged learners, language, cultural and social differences; the Intercultural Education Strategy (2010-2015) assisting the creation of an intercultural, integrated and inclusive learning environment in all sectors of education; the National Disability Strategy (2011) and a recent implementation plan to set out the practical measures in order to advance the NDS over the period 2013 to 2015; the Further Education and Training Strategy (2014-2019) aiming to an inclusive educational system and the National Strategy for Higher Education to 2030. Ireland took positive steps to improve adverse conditions in prisons and effective programmes for education with the Irish Prison Service Three Year Strategic Plan (2012-2015). Ireland also made a priority to tackle boys' underachievement. Ireland took steps toward human rights education with the National Strategy for sustainable development (2014-2020) including curriculum at pre-school, primary and post primary schools. However, according to available information, the human right education curriculum does not extend to other fields of human rights such as gender equality, freedom of religion... In addition, Ireland has committed to ban corporal punishment against children in all settings; however the common law remains, to the extent of available information, silent on this matter.

⁵¹ Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review, Ireland, Addendum, Views on conclusions and/or recommendations, voluntary commitments and replies presented by the State under review, 6 March 2012, p. 8, <http://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/UPR/Pages/IESession12.aspx>, Accessed on 14/04/2015

66. Specific Recommendations:

1. Ireland should be strongly encouraged to ratify the UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education.
2. Ireland should be strongly encouraged to further submit state reports for the periodic consultations of UNESCO's education related standard-setting instruments.
3. Ireland should be encouraged to continue its work toward inclusive and special education and take further measures in order to improve the representation, education and protection of Travellers, other minorities or disadvantaged social groups.
4. Ireland should be encouraged to continue implementing human rights education toward women's rights, children's rights and religious freedom
5. Ireland should be encouraged to promote forms of non-violent discipline in all settings as well as providing the public with awareness raising campaigns and prohibit all forms of corporal punishment in all settings such as day care, pre-school, after-school childcare, child-minding, day centres...

Cultural rights

67. **Ireland** is encouraged to ratify the Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage (2003). UNESCO's cultural conventions promote access to and participation in cultural heritage and creative expressions and, as such, are conducive to implementing the right to take part in cultural life as defined in article 27 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and article 15 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. In doing so, Ireland is encouraged to facilitate the participation of communities, practitioners, cultural actors and NGOs from the civil society as well as vulnerable groups (minorities, indigenous peoples, migrants, refugees, young peoples and peoples with disabilities), and to ensure that equal opportunities are given to women and girls to address gender disparities.
68. As a State Party to the Convention concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage (1972) and the Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions (2005)⁵², Ireland is encouraged to fully implement the relevant provisions that promote access to and participation in cultural heritage and creative expressions and, as such, are conducive to implementing the right to take part in cultural life

⁵² Periodic report (2012) available at:

file:///C:/Users/k_dagg/Downloads/Ireland_Report_OwnFormat_EN_2012.pdf.

as defined in article 27 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and article 15 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. In doing so, Ireland is encouraged to give due consideration to the participation of communities, practitioners, cultural actors and NGOs from the civil society as well as vulnerable groups (minorities, indigenous peoples, migrants, refugees, young peoples and peoples with disabilities), and to ensure that equal opportunities are given to women and girls to address gender disparities.

Freedom of opinion and expression

69. Ireland is recommended to decriminalize defamation and place it within a civil code that is in accordance with international standards.⁵³ The law on blasphemy could be reviewed in line with the right to freedom of conscience and the 2011 General Comment 34 by the UN Human Rights Committee.⁵⁴

Freedom of scientific research and the right to benefit from scientific progress and its applications

70. Ireland, in the framework of the 2015-2017 consultations related to the revision and monitoring of the Recommendation on the Status of Scientific Researchers is encouraged to report to UNESCO on any legislative or other steps undertaken by it with the aim to implement this international standard-setting instrument, adopted by UNESCO in 1974.

⁵³ See for example, General Comments No 34. of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), 2006 Recommendation of the 87th Session Human Rights Committee, the recommendations of the UN Special Rapporteurs on the Right to Freedom of Opinion and Expression, and Resolution 1577 (2007) of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe.

⁵⁴ <http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/hrc/docs/gc34.pdf>