

Egypt

Mid-term Implementation Assessment



*Promoting and strengthening
the Universal Periodic Review*
<http://www.upr-info.org>

Introduction

1. Purpose of the follow-up programme

The second and subsequent cycles of the review should focus on, inter alia, the implementation of the accepted recommendations and the development of the human rights situation in the State under review.

A/HRC/RES/16/21, 12 April 2011 (Annex I C § 6)

The Universal Periodic Review (UPR) process takes place every four and half years; however, some recommendations can be implemented immediately. In order to reduce this interval, we have created an update process to evaluate the human rights situation two years after the examination at the UPR.

Broadly speaking, *UPR Info* seeks to ensure the respect of commitments made in the UPR, but also, more specifically, to give stakeholders the opportunity to share their opinion on the commitments. To this end, about two years after the review, *UPR Info* invites States, NGOs, and National Institutions for Human Rights (NHRI) to share their comments on the implementation (or lack thereof) of recommendations adopted at the Human Rights Council (HRC) plenary session.

For this purpose, *UPR Info* publishes a Mid-term Implementation Assessment (MIA) including responses from each stakeholder. The MIA is meant to show how all stakeholders are disposed to follow through on, and implement their commitments. States should implement the recommendations that they have accepted, and civil society should monitor that implementation.

While the follow-up's importance has been highlighted by the HRC, no precise directives regarding the follow-up procedure have been set until now. Therefore, *UPR Info* is willing to share good practices as soon as possible, and to strengthen the collaboration pattern between States and stakeholders. Unless the UPR's follow-up is seriously considered, the UPR mechanism as a whole could be adversely affected.

The methodology used by UPR Info to collect data and to calculate index is described at the end of this document.

Geneva, 9 November 2012

Follow-up Outcomes

1. Sources and results

All data are available at the following address:

<http://followup.upr-info.org/index/country/egypt>

We invite the reader to consult that webpage since all recommendations, all stakeholders' reports, as well as the unedited comments can be found at the same internet address.

34 stakeholders' reports were submitted for the UPR. 31 NGOs were contacted. 2 UN agencies were contacted. The Permanent Mission to the UN was contacted. The domestic NHRI was contacted as well.

19 NGOs responded to our enquiry. No UN agency did respond. The State under Review did not respond to our enquiry. The domestic NHRI did not respond to our enquiry either.

IRI: 114 recommendations are not implemented, 3 recommendations are partially implemented, and 7 recommendations are fully implemented. No answer was received for 45 out of 171 recommendations (full list of unanswered recommendations is available at the end of this document).

2. Index

Hereby the issues which the MIA deals with:

| rec. n° | Issue | page | IRI |
|---------|--|---------|-----------|
| 1 | Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity, Racial discrimination, Freedom of religion and belief, | page 36 | not impl. |
| 2 | Torture and other CID treatment, International instruments, | page 32 | not impl. |
| 4 | General | page 54 | not impl. |
| 5 | UPR process, International instruments, Human rights defenders, Civil society, | page 7 | not impl. |
| 6 | Torture and other CID treatment, International instruments, | page 32 | not impl. |
| 7 | Freedom of the press | page 8 | not impl. |
| 8 | Women's rights | page 43 | not impl. |

| rec. n° | Issue | page | IRI |
|---------|---|---------|-----------|
| 9 | General | page 55 | not impl. |
| 10 | Torture and other CID treatment | page 37 | not impl. |
| 12 | Counter-terrorism, Special procedures, Detention conditions, | page 33 | not impl. |
| 13 | Special procedures | page 33 | not impl. |
| 14 | Civil society | page 10 | not impl. |
| 15 | Torture and other CID treatment, International instruments, | page 37 | not impl. |
| 16 | Women's rights | page 44 | not impl. |
| 17 | Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity, Racial discrimination, Freedom of religion and belief, | page 30 | not impl. |
| 20 | Death penalty | page 37 | not impl. |
| 21 | Torture and other CID treatment | page 37 | not impl. |
| 22 | Women's rights | page 44 | not impl. |
| 23 | Women's rights | page 46 | not impl. |
| 24 | Death penalty | page 37 | not impl. |
| 25 | International instruments, ESC rights - general, | page 33 | not impl. |
| 26 | Women's rights, Torture and other CID treatment, Justice, International instruments, Disabilities, CP rights - general, | page 33 | not impl. |
| 27 | Detention conditions | page 38 | not impl. |
| 28 | Women's rights, Rights of the Child, | page 46 | not impl. |
| 29 | International instruments, Death penalty, | page 38 | not impl. |
| 30 | Women's rights, International instruments, | page 33 | not impl. |
| 35 | Women's rights | page 47 | not impl. |
| 36 | Civil society | page 11 | not impl. |
| 38 | International instruments | page 33 | not impl. |
| 39 | Women's rights, Rights of the Child, Right to education, | page 47 | not impl. |
| 40 | Trafficking, Civil society, | page 38 | not impl. |
| 41 | Migrants | page 31 | not impl. |
| 44 | Women's rights | page 48 | not impl. |
| 46 | Women's rights, Torture and other CID treatment, Rights of the Child, | page 49 | not impl. |
| 47 | Women's rights | page 49 | not impl. |
| 49 | Counter-terrorism | page 39 | not impl. |
| 50 | International instruments | page 33 | not impl. |
| 51 | International instruments | page 34 | not impl. |
| 52 | Right to food | page 30 | not impl. |
| 53 | Women's rights | page 48 | not impl. |
| 59 | Women's rights | page 48 | not impl. |
| 60 | Women's rights | page 48 | not impl. |
| 61 | Freedom of religion and belief | page 11 | not impl. |
| 62 | Special procedures | page 34 | not impl. |
| 63 | Other | page 56 | not impl. |
| 64 | Right to housing | page 30 | not impl. |
| 70 | International instruments, Freedom of opinion and expression, Freedom of association and peaceful assembly, | page 13 | not impl. |

| rec. n° | Issue | page | IRI |
|---------|---|---------|-----------------|
| 71 | Freedom of religion and belief | page 14 | not impl. |
| 72 | Freedom of religion and belief | page 15 | not impl. |
| 73 | Freedom of the press, Freedom of opinion and expression, | page 16 | fully impl. |
| 74 | Elections | page 16 | fully impl. |
| 75 | Justice | page 39 | not impl. |
| 76 | Justice | page 40 | fully impl. |
| 77 | Death penalty | page 37 | not impl. |
| 79 | Counter-terrorism | page 39 | not impl. |
| 80 | Torture and other CID treatment, International instruments, | page 40 | not impl. |
| 82 | Elections | page 17 | partially impl. |
| 83 | UPR process | page 56 | not impl. |
| 84 | Torture and other CID treatment, Detention conditions, | page 40 | not impl. |
| 85 | Death penalty | page 37 | not impl. |
| 86 | Minorities | page 31 | not impl. |
| 87 | Torture and other CID treatment, International instruments, | page 41 | not impl. |
| 88 | Torture and other CID treatment, Special procedures, | page 34 | not impl. |
| 89 | Torture and other CID treatment, International instruments, | page 41 | not impl. |
| 90 | International instruments | page 34 | not impl. |
| 91 | Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity, International instruments, | page 34 | not impl. |
| 92 | Women's rights, Rights of the Child, Civil society, | page 50 | not impl. |
| 93 | Other | page 56 | not impl. |
| 95 | Minorities, Freedom of religion and belief, | page 17 | not impl. |
| 96 | Other | page 56 | not impl. |
| 97 | Freedom of opinion and expression, Detention conditions, | page 18 | partially impl. |
| 99 | Rights of the Child, Labour, | page 52 | - |
| 100 | UPR process, Civil society, | page 35 | not impl. |
| 101 | Freedom of religion and belief | page 19 | not impl. |
| 102 | Treaty bodies | page 35 | not impl. |
| 105 | Women's rights | page 52 | not impl. |
| 106 | Racial discrimination, Freedom of religion and belief, | page 20 | not impl. |
| 107 | Torture and other CID treatment, Human rights violations by state agents, | page 41 | not impl. |
| 109 | Rights of the Child | page 30 | not impl. |
| 112 | Death penalty | page 37 | not impl. |
| 113 | Justice | page 41 | not impl. |
| 114 | Elections | page 21 | not impl. |
| 115 | Torture and other CID treatment, Special procedures, | page 34 | not impl. |
| 116 | Special procedures | page 35 | not impl. |
| 117 | Torture and other CID treatment, Special procedures, | page 35 | not impl. |
| 118 | Death penalty | page 41 | not impl. |
| 120 | Counter-terrorism | page 40 | fully impl. |
| 122 | Civil society | page 21 | not impl. |
| 123 | Justice, International instruments, | page 41 | not impl. |

| rec. n° | Issue | page | IRI |
|---------|---|---------|-----------------|
| 125 | Labour, Freedom of association and peaceful assembly, Civil society, | page 22 | not impl. |
| 127 | Freedom of religion and belief | page 22 | fully impl. |
| 129 | Counter-terrorism, Justice, | page 42 | fully impl. |
| 130 | Treaty bodies | page 35 | not impl. |
| 131 | Torture and other CID treatment, International instruments, | page 32 | not impl. |
| 132 | Torture and other CID treatment, Justice, International instruments, CP rights - general, | page 35 | not impl. |
| 133 | Minorities, Freedom of religion and belief, | page 23 | not impl. |
| 134 | Torture and other CID treatment, Impunity, | page 42 | not impl. |
| 135 | Women's rights, Rights of the Child, | page 45 | not impl. |
| 136 | Torture and other CID treatment | page 42 | not impl. |
| 137 | Freedom of association and peaceful assembly, Detention conditions, | page 24 | - |
| 138 | Women's rights, International instruments, | page 35 | not impl. |
| 139 | Freedom of religion and belief | page 24 | not impl. |
| 140 | Justice | page 42 | not impl. |
| 141 | Freedom of the press, Freedom of opinion and expression, | page 25 | not impl. |
| 142 | Torture and other CID treatment, Special procedures, | page 36 | not impl. |
| 143 | Human rights violations by state agents | page 42 | not impl. |
| 145 | Special procedures | page 36 | not impl. |
| 146 | Justice | page 25 | not impl. |
| 148 | International instruments, Freedom of opinion and expression, | page 26 | not impl. |
| 149 | Civil society | page 26 | not impl. |
| 152 | Counter-terrorism | page 42 | fully impl. |
| 154 | Women's rights | page 53 | not impl. |
| 155 | Rights of the Child | page 53 | not impl. |
| 158 | Rights of the Child | page 53 | not impl. |
| 159 | Impunity, Minorities, | page 32 | not impl. |
| 160 | Treaty bodies | page 35 | not impl. |
| 161 | Treaty bodies, Freedom of opinion and expression, | page 27 | not impl. |
| 162 | Women's rights | page 45 | not impl. |
| 163 | Freedom of the press | page 27 | not impl. |
| 164 | Public security | page 43 | partially impl. |
| 165 | Women's rights | page 54 | not impl. |
| 166 | Counter-terrorism, Special procedures, | page 43 | not impl. |
| 167 | Counter-terrorism | page 43 | not impl. |
| 168 | Justice, Human rights defenders, Freedom of the press, Freedom of association and peaceful assembly, Civil society, | page 28 | not impl. |
| 169 | Freedom of religion and belief | page 28 | not impl. |
| 171 | Women's rights, International instruments, | page 36 | not impl. |

3. Feedbacks on recommendations

CP Rights

Recommendation n°5: Act in accordance with the standards included in the UN International Declaration on Human Rights Defenders in 1998 and cooperate seriously with human rights organizations, particularly through in-depth discussion of their reports and recommendations in the follow-up of this universal periodic review (Recommended by Germany)

IRI: *not implemented*

Christian Solidarity Worldwide (CSW) response:

There was a general lack of cooperation with human rights defenders or organisations during the Mubarak regime, and the dichotomy between government rhetoric and actual adherence to and support of human rights principles was evident. Under SCAF [*editor's note: the Supreme Council of the Armed Forces*], some 12000 civilians, including several minors, were imprisoned following summary trials before military tribunals, including prominent bloggers commenting on human rights issues or military excesses. SCAF also pressurised human rights and democracy groups under the Mubarak-era Law on Associations (Law 84 of 2002) for allegedly receiving foreign funding - despite the army itself being in receipt of some \$US 1.3 billion a year from the United States government. The country's new President had promised to release these, however, they remain imprisoned. Furthermore, President Mursi has failed to address human rights in his '100 day plan', leading human rights activists to produce their own 'Our Rights in 100 days Campaign' which is designed to monitor, provide recommendations and hold the new President to account. The President has shown a willingness to work with human rights organisations and promised to 'respect' human rights during his victory speech in Tahrir Square. Worryingly, hostility to foreign funding or training appears to persist.

Habi Center for Environmental Rights (HCER) response:

The Egyptian NGOs have been attacked for more than one year by the state, especially in the context of the transitions that Egypt is witnessing currently. This is completely contradicted with what is mentioned in the international declaration of human rights defenders. So it is necessary that the current regime implement this recommendation immediately.

Cairo Institute for Human Rights Studies (CIHRS) response:

The government did not act according to the standards included in the UN international Declaration on Human Rights Defenders. Instead, attacks against human rights defenders and independent human rights NGOs escalated in the past two years. In February 2, 2011, prior to Mubarak's removal from power, Military

Police, aided by thugs, stormed the office of an Egyptian NGO, confiscated computers and documents, and arrested several of its members as well as staff members of other international organizations who were working on documenting rights violations and offering legal aid to protesters. Activists arrested were held in illegal military detention for several days until released. No investigations were opened in the incident to date.

Starting June 2011, the government launched a fierce defamation campaign against NGOs, mostly human rights ones. State owned, and affiliated, media outlets launched an aggressive media campaign by leaking defaming news that NGOs would face charges of high treason, conspiracy against Egypt, and the compromise of national security through the implementation of 'foreign agendas'.

In August 8, media reported that State Security Prosecution started investigation into receipt of foreign funding by civil society organizations. On December 29, the campaign reached its most odious peak with the raiding of over six national and international NGOs' premises by Egyptian security forces, including military, in uniform and in civilian clothes, as well as public prosecutors. Police forces searched and confiscated documents, books, and computers from the stormed offices.

The investigations yielded the referral of 43 individuals from international human rights and democracy groups to court on criminal charges. The trial is still ongoing, with possibilities of referring additional national NGOs to trial, as stated by the investigating judges responsible for the case in February 2012.

Recommendation n°7: Adopt all necessary measures to provide for a free and independent media which reflects the religious, ethnic and political plurality of opinions in Egypt (Recommended by Germany)

IRI: not implemented

CSW response:

There have recently been concerns of a growing restriction on freedom of the press following the appointment of a member of the Muslim Brotherhood as Information Minister and the appointment of editors who are allegedly sympathetic to the movement. Television and newspapers that have been critical of the President have either been ordered off air, or have had lawsuits filed against them. Currently, a television owner and a newspaper editor are facing trial for allegedly insulting the Egyptian president.

Coptic Solidarity (CS) and Jubilee Campaign (JC) (CS-JC) response:

The Egyptian government continues to censor independent media. In August 2012 the regime suspended a satellite television channel Al-Faraeen that featured a program by its owner and host is Tawfik Okasha for criticizing the Egyptian President Mohammed Mursi and the Muslim Brotherhood. In the same month, authorities confiscated copies of the daily newspaper Al Dustour for criticizing the Islamist group.

Meanwhile, state sponsored media continues to portray religious, ethnic, and political minorities negatively. During the clashes of Maspero on October 9 2011, 25 people were killed, 12 of them were run over by armored military police vehicles and over 300 were wounded. State television anchor Rasha Magdy called on "honorable

Egyptians to defend the army against the violent Christian demonstrators.” As far as we know, no one was punished for this incitement.

The U.S International Religious Freedom Report for 2011 stated: “Twenty-one prominent Egyptian human rights organizations criticized the “inflammatory role played by the official state media,” charging that a “direct link can be traced between the outright incitement against demonstrators by state media and the events at Maspiro.” Religious and Ethnic minorities in Egypt are rarely represented in the media and when they do, it is predominantly negative. State sponsored religious media continues to incite hatred against religious minorities.

The minister of information, who directs the audiovisual media, has been replaced by a leading Muslim Brotherhood (MB) figure.

The heads of all 13 public press publishing establishments owned by the state, as well as some 50 chief-editors have been replaced; about a third are known Islamists and most of The rest are sympathizers. The “press supreme council” has been recomposed, with MB dominance.

Open Doors International (ODI) response:

Not implemented. Lately, the Shoura Council – with its Islamist majority – appointed new CEOs & Chief editors for the national newspapers; most of them are related to Muslim Brotherhood. The government also closed a satellite TV channel (AL-faraeen).

Association for Freedom of Thought and Expression (AFTE) response:

The government didn’t take any action under the protection of media independence and support of diversity and plurality, whether before or after the revolution. Despite the existence and emerge of free spaces for expression achieved by the revolution and people’s struggle, yet there is an absence of the political will of the government to take any effective measures on this regard. The laws, that allows the government’s control over the media, are still valid and being used from time to time.

CIHRS response:

The Egyptian government did not take any of the necessary measures to provide for a free and independent media. On the contrary, attacks against the media escalated dramatically, especially in the recent months following the election of President Mohamed Morsi to power. Documented violations in the past 100 days included confiscation of newspapers and opinion articles, bringing legal charges against journalists, including a recent prison sentence against a talk show host on charges of defaming the President, prevention of a satellite channel from airing, in addition to a number administrative measures taken to limit free speech in media outlets.

Previous documented human rights violations against the media over the last two years included direct physical attacks against media professionals, legal measures against journalists and bloggers – in some cases leading to prison sentences – storming offices of independent media outlets, closing down satellite channels, imposing restrictions and interfering in the editorial policies of certain papers,

dominance of certain media sectors, and preventing some programs and presenters from airing. These violations are fostered by an atmosphere of legal impunity aided by an arsenal of draconian laws, which are yet to be reviewed or amended.

For an example, see [\[the article\]](#) “The Muslim Brotherhood Following Mubarak’s Footsteps Human Rights NGOs and Parties express their solidarity with journalists and media professionals against attempts of a new authoritarian domination”

More information on the status of media through 2010 and 2011:

See CIHRS 2010 annual report, [Roots of Unrest](#), (p 131-154),

See CIHRS 2011 annual report, [Fractured Walls... New Horizons](#), (p 83-102)

Recommendation n°14: *Amend article 11, 17 and 42 of the current NGO law 84 of 2002 so as to ensure that NGOs activities and activities of all human rights defenders not be inhibited or their ability to raise finance be impeded (Recommended by Ireland)*

IRI: *not implemented*

CSW response:

NGOs in Egypt have operated under some of the most restrictive conditions. Unfortunately, proposals for an amendment of the current NGO law 84 seek to further restrict the work of NGOs, limiting their fundraising capabilities and effectively bringing NGOs under the control of the government. Many NGOs have voiced their opposition to a draft of the 'local and international civil society organisations'. There are reports that new legislation will prevent Egyptian NGOs from applying for foreign funding, will mean that at least 100,000 Egyptian pounds will be needed to start an NGO, and they will have to have at least ten members. This will result in many NGOs having to disband. The draft law also contravenes international standards, as NGOs can only be disbanded by its founders or by a court decision.

CIHRS response:

The provisions of the law weren't amended. The existing non-governmental organizations (NGO) law 84/2002 continues to put civic associations under the control of the state and allows for great interference from the security apparatus. It is worth mentioning that the mentioned articles are not the only ones in need of amendment. The same law is currently paving the way before state authorities to carry on with the legal cases against NGOs. Other impediments provided within the law include Article 6, which state that civic associations can only be formed upon the approval of the Ministry of Social Affairs, which can plainly demonstrate the degree of control the administrative authority has over the registration and establishment of NGOs in Egypt. Article 34 also grants the Ministry of Social Affairs, and indirectly the security apparatus, the right to object to board elections within civic associations and to disqualify candidates for the board.

There are attempts by the government and the NGOs to change the existing law. Several draft laws were proposed by the Ministry of Social Affairs, other government entities, the Freedom and Justice Party, and NGOs, but no concrete steps were taken to date to change the provisions of the law government NGOs. There are additional threats pertaining to a recent draft submitted for consideration by the

Ministry of Insurance and Social Affairs, which includes provisions prohibiting NGOs from engaging in any political activities or fielding candidates in elections, and require the registration and approval of all foreign NGOs, and the new proposed law includes articles to guarantee state sovereignty.

The abovementioned brief illustration of the current NGO law provisions highlights the nature of the relationship between the administrative authority and NGOs in Egypt, which appears to continue after the revolution unabated.

See "[39 Human Rights and Development Organizations Propose Alternative NGO Law](#)".

Recommendation n°36: *Continue efforts to reform in the short term Law 84-2002 in order to establish a procedure for setting up NGOs, which is nimble, fast and not subject to administrative discretion* (Recommended by Spain)

IRI: *not implemented*

CSW response:

NGOs have operated in some of the most restrictive conditions. Unfortunately, proposals for an amendment of the current NGO law 84 seek to further restrict the work of NGOs and their fundraising capabilities, and effectively bring them under the control of the government. Many NGOs have voiced their opposition to a draft of the 'local and international civil society organisations'. There are reports that new legislation will stop Egyptian NGOs from being able to apply for foreign funding; at least 100,000 Egyptian pounds will be required to start an NGO, and it will have to have at least ten members. This will result in many NGOs having to disband. The draft law also contravenes international standards, as NGOs can only be dismantled by their founders or by a court decision.

CIHRS response:

As aforementioned, the law wasn't amended.

Recommendation n°61: *Continue to create conducive environment for the enjoyment of freedom of religion and belief including through introduction of further measures for promoting equal rights and social harmony among followers of different religions* (Recommended by Armenia)

IRI: *not implemented*

CSW response:

As occurred under the Mubarak regime, the current government maintains control over all Muslim religious institutions, including mosques and religious endowments, which are encouraged to promote an officially-sanctioned interpretation of Islam. Egyptian law forbids blasphemy through Article 98(f) of its Penal Code, which prohibits citizens from "ridiculing or insulting heavenly religions or inciting sectarian strife." This provision has been applied to detain and prosecute individuals and members of religious groups whose practices deviate from mainstream Islamic beliefs or whose activities are alleged to jeopardize "communal harmony" or to insult the three "heavenly religions:" Judaism, Christianity, and Islam. No measures have been introduced to promote equal rights among religions and often when attacks or insults against Christians have occurred, the Egyptian courts acquit those (often

Muslims) who have made the attacks or insults. For example, when Mr Mitri's ear was cut off in March 2011 following a false accusation of housing prostitutes in his apartment, he was unable to seek proper compensation since an agreement was reached through a reconciliation meeting (which are usually presided over by Salafi imams) obliging him to drop all charges against his Salafi attackers.

CS-JC response:

The Egyptian government made little progress, if any. In fact a general atmosphere of religious frenzy is fast spreading. Authorized Islamist TV stations (mostly following the Salafist trend) are spreading outright hate speech against non-Muslims and occasionally against Shia Muslims.

ODI response:

Partially implemented. Not in case of MBBs (Muslim Background Believers). As MBBs are considered apostates, they don't have the right to marry a Christian husband (for girls), can't prevent teaching their kids Islam in religion classes at schools and can't avoid all kinds of discrimination. They can't also go to churches and worship publicly. Officially in their IDs, they are still Muslims.

/ Obligation of Christian families to leave their homes and villages after each sectarian clash as a result of threats and absence of protective measures.

CIHRS response:

The government did not take any steps towards creating a healthy environment where citizens are able to enjoy practicing their ritual in a free manner. Several violations to Coptic Egyptians continue with little interference from the state to ensure accountability and non reoccurrence. For the past two years, dozens of major sectarian incidents resulted in the death of several Coptic Egyptians in addition to the burning down and destruction of a number of churches and the forced displacement of Christian families from their homes in at least three incidents. This is in addition to the killing of at least 27 Coptic protesters by Military Police during a protest in October 2012. Religious freedoms and promoting social harmony and tolerance among followers of different religions and belief systems have been particularly hindered by ongoing discussions- and official statements- pertaining to provisions granting supremacy to one religion, namely Islam, over other religions- while refusing to acknowledge or reference other non Abrahamic beliefs, including Baha'i, in the draft constitution currently finalized by the constituent assembly. This is in addition to an increase in rhetoric, tolerated and fostered by the government, which could amount to incitement to hatred against followers of other religions.

Restrictions over laws governing the establishments of places of worship continue to hinder promoting equal rights to followers of different religions dramatically in Egypt.

Additionally, several non Muslim individuals were referred to trial, some receiving initial prison sentences, over charges related to defaming Islam

See ["Enshrining Religion in the Egyptian Constitution The new constitution restricts public liberties, human rights, and civil society The constitution should protect freedom, not those who oppress it"](#)

Recommendation n°70: *Effectively guarantee the exercise of freedom of expression, association and peaceful assembly and the right to participate in public life and politics, in line with the obligations set forth in the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights* (Recommended by Chile)

IRI: *not implemented*

CSW response:

No guarantees of the exercise of the above rights are currently in place. During the 2011 elections, SCAF [*editor's note: the Supreme Council of the Armed Forces*] tightened its grip on opposition groups. SCAF used deadly force against public protestors, including Coptic Christians; arrested, tried, and imprisoned democracy activists; raided pro-democracy non-governmental organizations (NGOs), imposed travel bans on their American and European personnel, and fostered xenophobia through state-run media. Although positive steps to promote equality of religion and thus uphold the freedom of expression are being taken via the "Bill of Rights", in reality, those who speak against the authorities and/or Islam are quickly quietened. Al-Dostor, a daily newspaper and website, came under investigation by Egypt's Public Prosecution following complaints over its criticism of the Muslim Brotherhood. The paper is known for its editorial stand against the movement. An issue of al-Dostor published on 11 August was confiscated by the authorities after it claimed the Muslim Brotherhood was trying to establish an "Islamic state" in Egypt. More recently, on 18 September 2012, an Egyptian court sentenced a Christian teacher to six years in prison for blasphemy, insulting the country's president and insulting a plaintiff lawyer.

ODI response:

Not implemented. Maspero massacre happened October 2011, 27 killed and more than 300 injured when they tried to demonstrate peacefully.

AFTE response:

We can say that there were no political will for the government to take the necessary measures to insure freedom of expression, whether on the level of the failure of the government to take any actions or practices in support freedom of expression, or on the level of their role in protecting individuals from abuse and violations of their right by other individuals or groups within the community.

There have been many protests, demonstrations or strikes that were suppressed or attacked by using excessive force against them, which led to the killing of peaceful protestors on by the hand of security services (The ministry of interior forces, military police).

There has been the confiscation of an issue of a newspaper and the accusation of its chief editor of insulting the president and spreading false news, in addition, satellite channels have suffered censorship and attempts to interfere in their content which has reached a peak by the decision of the administrative court in stopping the broadcasting of a channel.

Moreover, there has been an attempt to pass a new law of civil society, which is more restrictive than Mubarak law for NGOs, a side with the continuing media campaign against NGOs with its security nature.

Also the student regulation of 2007 has not been modified, which restrict the student's right in fair and free election and in forming students unions that represent the students' will. The regulation is a restriction on exercising the student's right to organization.

CIHRS response:

As aforementioned, several rights and freedoms continue to be hindered in Egypt, with minimal political will to promote and protect such

For compilation of violations against civil and political rights in Egypt during the first 100 days of President Mohamed Morsi in office [\[see this report\]](#)

For compilation of major violations against civil and political rights in Egypt in 2011, See CIHRS annual report "[Fractured walls New Horizons](#)"

For compilation of major violations against civil and political rights in Egypt in 2011 and 2010, See CIHRS annual reports previously cited.

Recommendation n°71: Eliminate all legal provisions and policies which discriminate against adherents of other religions than Islam and adopt a unified law for places of worship (Recommended by Netherlands)

IRI: not implemented

CSW response:

Article 2 of the 2011 Provisional Constitution of Egypt states, Islam is the primary religion of Egypt and all legislation shall follow from Shari'a law. Egyptian law forbids blasphemy through Article 98(f) of its Penal Code, which prohibits citizens from "ridiculing or insulting heavenly religions or inciting sectarian strife." This provision has been applied to detain and prosecute individuals and members of religious groups whose practices deviate from mainstream Islamic beliefs or whose activities are alleged to jeopardize "communal harmony" or to insult the three "heavenly religions:" Judaism, Christianity, and Islam. Places of worship continue to be attacked and Christians for example have been stopped from building homes or other buildings on suspicion that they are erecting a Christian place of worship. In January 2012, however, Al-Azhar Grand Sheikh Ahmed Al-Tayeb put forward a "Bill of Rights" that discussed the importance of freedom of belief and expression, among other things, ahead of the drafting of the constitution. The statement asserts that "freedom of belief" and equal citizenship rights for all Egyptians are the cornerstones of a new modern society. The statement reportedly took three months to gain support of a number of diverse religious and political leaders in Egypt, as well as other domestic and international actors. Despite this, discriminating legal provisions and policies have still not been eliminated.

CS-JC response:

The government failed to amend the laws that prevent Copts and other minorities from building and repairing places of worship, Christians and Jews are still required to obtain a presidential decree to build their houses of worship and the provincial

governor's permission to repair or renovate existing buildings, on a case by case basis.

The government also failed to prevent violence against Christians or the destruction of churches and Christian owned property and none of the perpetrators have been brought to justice. The most recent incident took place on June 31 2012, where 120 Christian families forcefully displaced from their homes Dahshour in Giza, as organized mobs looted and vandalized their properties and no one was prosecuted for it. In August 2012, Egyptian authorities shut down the last working Synagogue, the Eliyahu Hanavi Synagogue in Alexandria.

ODI response:

Not implemented. Postponement of passing a law for construction and repair of churches is the main cause of many sectarian clashes.

CIHRS response:

The SCAF proposed a draft law for places of worship and the ex-cabinet of Dr. Essam Sharaf discussed the draft after the edits of the Church and Al Azhar, yet the law wasn't ratified or adopted. "[Egyptian government re-thinks unified law on places of worship](#)" See Arabic press release: "[Unified Places of Worship Law: Promises renewed. Failure Assured](#)"

Tandem Project (TP) response:

US Department of State International Religious Freedom Report for 2011: Article 46 of the constitution and article 11 of the Constitutional Declaration of 2011, the new provisional fundamental law of the country adopted on March 30 by the Supreme Council of the Armed Forces (SCAF), provide for freedom of belief and the practice of religious rites. On October 16, the SCAF issued a decree to amend provisions of the Penal Code to explicitly prohibit religious and other forms of discrimination. However, some laws, government restrictions, and court rulings limit freedom of religion, and courts ruled in previous years that the constitution's provisions for freedom of religion do not apply to Baha'is. Islam is the official state religion, and Sharia (Islamic law) is the primary source of legislation.

Recommendation n°72: *Eliminate legal and bureaucratic restrictions affecting an individual's right to choose his or her religion* (Recommended by United States)

IRI: *not implemented*

CS-JC response:

A modest improvement took place whereby a number of converts to Islam were allowed by the administrative court to return to their original (Christian) faith, and new ID cards issued accordingly.

ODI response:

Not implemented.

CIHRS response:

No step has been taken so far.

TP response:

US State Department International Religious Freedom Report for 2011: Religious laws, both Islamic and Coptic, prevent Coptic men and Muslim women from marrying each other. When a male Christian and a female Muslim marry outside the country, their marriage is not legally recognized in the country. Additionally the woman could be arrested and charged with apostasy, and any children from such a marriage could be taken and assigned to the physical custody of a male Muslim guardian, as determined by the government's interpretation of Islamic law.

Recommendation n°73: *Emergency powers should not be abused or used against journalists and bloggers in their exercise of their right to freedom of expression* (Recommended by Ireland)

IRI: *fully implemented*

CSW response:

The state of emergency was finally ended by the military in May 2012. Having said this, journalists and bloggers are still monitored by authorities and have reason to be fearful. Journalists who fell foul of SCAF [*editor's note*: the Supreme Council of the Armed Forces] - article 184 of the penal code makes 'insulting the military establishment' a crime - faced prosecution in a military rather than civilian court. Under the current regime, journalists have come under pressure for allegedly insulting the president.

AFTE response:

The state of emergency was already cancelled; however, many journalists and bloggers are facing the same violations under other laws.

CIHRS response:

Throughout the application of the state of emergency, bloggers and journalists have been arrested and detained. Some bloggers were referred to military courts. See [written intervention by CIHRS](#) presented before the HRC 19 session.

Recommendation n°74: *Enable human rights organizations to monitor general elections* (Recommended by Germany)

IRI: *fully implemented*

CSW response:

The SCAF [*editor's note*: the Supreme Council of the Armed Forces] allowed the Carter Centre Witnessing Mission to observe parliamentary elections in early 2012.

CIHRS response:

Though the Supreme Electoral commissions of the parliamentary and the presidential elections allowed the Human Rights organizations to monitor and observe the elections, the two commissions nevertheless, set some restrictions on this right by limiting the issuance of the permits to the registered NGOs that have previous expertise in the monitoring of the elections. See below the Supreme commission's decrees to allow for national observation of the elections.

[[First](#)] - [[Second](#)]

Recommendation n°82: *Establish a fully independent electoral commission allowing for open participation of all political parties and objective certification of election results* (Recommended by Canada)

IRI: *partially implemented*

CIHRS response:

After the 2010 forged parliamentary elections, the SCAF [*editor's note: the Supreme Council of the Armed Forces*] appointed two supreme electoral commissions to supervise the parliamentary and the presidential elections. The judicial component was dominant in the composition of the two bodies nevertheless this didn't guarantee the full independence of such commissions as the SCAF intervened in the commissions' work several times.

See pages 85, 86, and 87 of CIHRS annual report 2011 "[Fractured walls New Horizons](#)".

Recommendation n°95: *Guarantee freedom of religion and belief to all groups and minorities, including in relevant legislation, without discrimination* (Recommended by Finland)

IRI: *not implemented*

TP response:

US Department of State International Religious Freedom Report for 2011: The law prohibits the formation of political parties or the conduct of political activities on a religious basis. Unlike during previous years, however, the Muslim Brotherhood's political arm, the Freedom and Justice Party, was registered and allowed to participate fully in elections. Four Salafi-oriented parties also were allowed to register and operate. However, authorities denied registration to the reportedly Shia-oriented Tahrir Party in October, and again in December, on the grounds that the party was based on religious principles.

CSW response:

Using Article 98(f) of the Penal Code, the Egyptian authorities continue to prohibit citizens from "ridiculing or insulting heavenly religions or inciting sectarian strife." This provision has been used to detain and prosecute individuals and members of religious groups whose practices deviate from mainstream Islamic beliefs or whose activities are alleged to jeopardize "communal harmony" or to insult the three "heavenly religions:" Judaism, Christianity, and Islam. Discrimination is common, particularly with converts from Islam to Christianity. These converts face the choice of either maintaining a Muslim identity card or not having an ID card, which causes serious consequences for day-to-day life. ID cards are necessary for accessing government services such as medical care in a public hospital, processing title deeds, accessing employment, education, banking services, and even clearing police checkpoints. Moreover, in the case of converts, it is needed for marriages to be recognised, and children of converts are often obliged to study Islamic religious education as their parent's conversions are not recognised. Although the 2012 proposed "Bill of Rights" discussed the importance of freedom of belief and expression, in practice those belonging to religious minority groups continue to be discriminated against.

CS-JC response:

The Egyptian governments continue to forbid Muslims from converting to another religion. The government also sometimes detains, harasses or abducts Muslims from Shia' sect, as well as converts from Islam to Christianity, atheists, as well as, Baha'is. Government authorities refused to provide converts with identification cards, and sometimes government hospitals declined issuing death certificates to members of the Baha'i faith and other document that require representing their faith.

Egyptian government continues to legislatively discriminate against minorities. For example: If a Christian parent converts to Islam, his or her marriage with their Christian partner is instantly annulled and the Muslim parent is automatically granted full custody of the children. Egyptian law bans adoption and is also forcibly imposed upon non-Muslims as well. Sharia inheritance laws that only allow females to inherit half of the share of a male are imposed upon Copts and other non-Muslims.

ODI response:

Partially implemented. Not applied on MBBs. It is still impossible for a Muslim to leave Islam and to convert to any other or no religion or belief.

CIHRS response:

The government didn't adopt any policies that could guarantee the free practice of religion and belief to all the minorities in Egypt. For example, the state doesn't recognize, until now, the Baha'I as a religion and accordingly set restrictions on the practice of the Baha'I religious rituals publicly.

Recommendation n°97: *Immediately release persons detained or imprisoned for exercising their freedom of expression on the Internet* (Recommended by Sweden)

IRI: *partially implemented*

CSW response:

Although the situation has improved in the past few years, some bloggers still remain in prison to carry out their sentences. Blogger Maikel Nabil Sanad was arrested in March 2011, and later sentenced to two years in prison for criticizing the interim military regime on his blog and spent much of his incarceration on hunger strike. Alaa Abd El Fattah, who was released on December 25 2011 after nearly two months in prison, still faces trial on a number of trumped-up charges, a clear indication of his being a target for his outspokenness against the military. Another blogger, Ayman Youssef Mansour, was sentenced in October 2011 by a civilian court to three years in prison for insulting religion on his Facebook page. Several other citizens have faced military questioning for online postings.

CS-JC response:

The Egyptian government continues to stifle freedom of speech by intimidation, threats and arrests of bloggers, citizens and children, for exercising their freedom of speech online. In 2011 there has been a number of arrests and cases. Liberal blogger Maikel Nabil Sanad was arrested on March 2011, and faced trial in a military tribunal for criticizing the ruling military council and the Egyptian army in his latest article before he went to prison. Maikel was released on January 2011.

Last August, 2011, State Security Services arrested an Egyptian young man, Ayman Mansour, for “insulting” Islam on Facebook, and sentenced him on October to three years in prison.

State Security Services arrested Gamal Abdallah Masoud, a 15-year-old Coptic Christian teenager, who was arrested on December, 2011 for “insulting” Islam on Facebook. Masoud denied being the source of the “insult” to Islam, stating that he was tagged in the picture and did not post it himself. Egyptian liberal Christian media tycoon Naguib Sawiris was also targeted after he posted on Twitter last June the same Mickey and Minnie Mouse picture, which also resulted in a blasphemy lawsuit against him, but the court threw out the case on February 2012, saying the plaintiffs had no legal standing. On February 2, 2012, Egypt's most renowned comedian, Adel Eman was sentenced to three months in prison with hard labor for “defaming Islam” in absentia, as well as paying a 1000 L.E. fine.

AFTE response:

The only taken action regarding this issue was taken by the elected-president, Mohamed Morsi; he formed a committee specialized in the affairs of civilians who suffered military trials, detainees and prisoners as well, in the period from January 2011 to June 30th 2012. And the committee has done its work; nearly 700 from the jailed citizens were released from prison, and the president as well issued a law that provides a complete amnesty for whoever was charged because of the revolution.

CIHRS response:

Not all of those whom were detained for excersing their freedom of expression on the internet were released. The last incident that shows the restrictive approach the state adopts in that regard is the case of Alber Saber, the activist who was detained due to [his critical views on Islam and Christianity](#).

Recommendation n°101: Implement the guarantee established in Article 46 of the Constitution, regarding freedom of belief and freedom of religious practice, in order to prevent in practice discriminations which affect this guarantee (Recommended by Chile)

IRI: not implemented

CSW response:

Discrimination continues. In legal cases Muslims who have attacked Christians are generally acquitted. Consequently, Article 46 of the Constitution has not being implemented. Although Article 6 of the 2011 Provisional Constitution states that there shall be not discrimination on religious grounds, in practice, because Islam remains the religion of the state, attacks on religious minorities are being effectively sanctioned by authorities who consistently take no action to end them in a timely manner, or ensure that perpetrators of violence are punished regardless of religious background.

CS-JC response:

The Egyptian government failed to establish or enforce Article 46 of the (now abolished) constitution. Article 46 in the constitution is abrogated by Article 2, which gives Islamic law a hierarchal power over Article 46. Although Egypt does not have

laws that directly prohibit apostasy and conversion from Islam, they are incriminated by Article 98(f) which serves as Egypt's anti-blasphemy law that criminalizes "defamed a heavenly religion."

ODI response:

Partially implemented. Last incident happened in mid-August a church in Beni Sweif was pressured into suspending some construction work. The church had permission to replace their building's wooden roof with a more substantial structure. However, objections were raised and an angry protest ensued. In response, the church leaders suspended the work.

CIHRS response:

As aforementioned, the state didn't take any steps to guarantee and respect the right of the free practice of religious rituals by all the religious minorities including Baha'is and Shiites whom "Huseiniya" mosque was shut down by the authorities. "[Egypt shuts down newly-opened Shiite mosque in Cairo](#)"

Recommendation n°106: *Increase efforts to end discrimination and violence against religious minorities and prosecute those involved in incitement to religious hatred and violence* (Recommended by Austria)

IRI: *not implemented*

CSW response:

During the transition period, Egypt has witnessed an increase in crime and lawlessness due to a decrease in police and security presence. There have been numerous legal cases following attacks on religious minorities where the perpetrators have not been punished, or where sentences have been passed in accordance with the defendants religion. For example, on 21 May 2012, twelve Christians were sentenced to life imprisonment for their alleged involvement in disturbances in Minya Province that had occurred in April 2011, while eight Muslims jointly charged were acquitted. Included amongst the twelve Christians was the owner of the house where the altercation had occurred, who had been in Cairo at the time of the violence. In the months leading up to the November 2011 parliamentary elections, an increase in incitement to violence in Egyptian media and government-funded mosques exacerbated sectarian tensions between Muslims and Coptic Christians. The ongoing violence, and the failure to prosecute those responsible, continued to foster a climate of impunity, especially in Upper Egypt. There continues to be intolerance of Jews and Baha'is in both the independent and government-controlled media. More generally, human rights activists inside Egypt increasingly are concerned that extremist groups that support policies aimed at destroying the religious and other freedoms and rights continue to advance unchallenged, with detrimental effects on the prospects for genuine democratic reform or improvements in freedom of religion or belief.

ODI response:

Not implemented. No one is prosecuted in violent incidents against Christians in Dahshour last July in spite of damaged 22 homes and 7 shops belong to Christians. In Beni-mazar, Minya incident: all Christians (12) were sent to life sentence and all Muslims (8) were released (proved to be not guilty!). / Obligation of Christian families

to leave their homes and villages after each sectarian clash as a result of threats and absence of protective measures.

CIHRS response:

The SCAF passed a law October 2011 to penalize any act of discrimination against religious minorities; however the state didn't take serious measures to end the sectarian clashes and to prevent the spread of hate speech among. It's worth mentioning that the state incited sectarian violence last year in Maspero clashes when the state-owned TV called the citizens to defend the army from the attacks of the Coptic protesters. It's worth mentioning that none of those involved in the incitement to religious hatred and violence were brought to justice as they enjoy impunity from the crimes they commit. See CIHRS press release on Maspero massacre "[Maspero: state incitement of sectarian violence and policy of extrajudicial killings](#)"

Recommendation n°114: *Invite independent national and international election monitoring teams to the upcoming elections* (Recommended by Austria)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

As of yet, there are no laws organizing future elections, therefore there is no guarantee of future monitoring by independent national or international observers. As noted in response to recommendation 11 and 74, the previous elections monitoring teams were only given permission to "witness" the election.

Recommendation n°122: *NGOs should be consulted widely and have a substantive role in drafting the new NGO law* (Recommended by Ireland)

IRI: not implemented

CSW response:

NGOs have operated in some of the most restrictive conditions. Unfortunately, proposals for an amendment of the current NGO law 84 seeks to further restrict the work of NGOs and their fundraising capabilities, and to effectively bring NGOs under the control of the government. Many NGOs have voiced their opposition to a draft of the 'local and international civil society organisations'. There are reports that new legislation will stop Egyptian NGOs from being able to apply for foreign funding, and that they will need at least 100,000 Egyptian pounds to start an NGO and have to have at least 10 members. This could result in many NGOs having to disband. The draft law also contravenes international standards whereby NGOs can only be dismantled by its founders or by a court decision.

HCER response:

It is necessary to activate this recommendation taking into consideration the content of this recommendation and being included in the new constitution which is preparing now by a specialist committee.

CIHRS response:

The current government has held several consultative meetings between government deputies and the NGOs representatives to the new NGO law. The deputies of the Ministry of Social affairs have met with the NGOs representatives on that matter.

There is a continuing dialogue between NGOs and the government but the Ministry of Insurance and Social Affairs has tried to sideline NGO recommendations as well as the recommendations of other Ministries and Presidential Advisors and continues to Push for the most repressive of the draft NGO bills.

See response to recommendation 14 and "[In an open discussion with the legal consultant of the Ministry of Social Affairs: NGOs describe the new draft law as Authoritative](#)"

Recommendation n°125: *Pass legislation that allows NGOs to accept foreign funding without prior government approval, legislation that allows for increased freedom of association and assembly, and legislation allowing labour unions to operate without joining the Egyptian Trade Union Federation* (Recommended by United States)

IRI: not implemented

ODI response:

Not implemented.

CIHRS response:

The legislation nom. 84/2002 is still existing which doesn't allow the NGOs to receive foreign funding without administrative approval.

See response to recommendation 14

Recommendation n°127: *Promote inter-religious dialogue and other educational measures to increase the understanding and tolerance in society among all religious communities* (Recommended by Austria)

IRI: fully implemented

CSW response:

The Egyptian authorities have responded to sectarian incidents by conducting "reconciliation" meetings between Muslims and Christians as a supposedly traditional means of easing tensions and resolving disputes. In the majority cases, authorities compel victims to abandon their claims to any legal remedy, effectively preventing them from accessing real justice. Moreover they are generally overseen by Salafi imams. The fact that in many cases the violence is instigated by members of the Salafi movement also [militates] against justice. The "Bill of Rights" proposed in 2012, took positive steps in discussing the importance of freedom of belief and expression, among other things, ahead of the drafting of the constitution. The statement asserts that "freedom of belief" and equal citizenship rights for all Egyptians are the cornerstones of a new modern society. The statement reportedly took three months to gain support of a number of diverse religious and political leaders in Egypt, as well as other domestic and international actors. It is evidence, however, that promotion of ideals such as freedom of religion is just starting to be had. At present, however, it is evident that Egyptian authorities uphold a one-way dialogue in which Islam dictates legislation and it is the ultimate source of authority, as demonstrated in Article 2 of the 2011 Provisional Constitution. Understanding and tolerance is thus not being fostered in Egypt, demonstrated by incidents such as burning of several Christian homes in Sharbat village near Alexandria in January 2012. The Christian villagers

were ordered to leave the village and no arrests for the attacks have yet been made. Clearly, equality before the law and of citizenship are yet to be achieved

ODI response:

Implemented. "Beit El-Ela = The family Home" is formed from Al-Azhar and the Church leaders to take care of these issues. / The practice of reconciliation meetings instead of law enforcement results in both loss of the Copts' rights and repetition of attacks on them due to absence of deterrent punishment. / Obligation of Christian families to leave their homes and villages after each sectarian clash as a result of threats and absence of protective measures.

Recommendation n°133: *Redress laws and government practices that discriminate against members of religious minorities, and in particular urgently pass a unified law that makes construction and repair requirements equal for the places of worship of all religious groups* (Recommended by United States)

IRI: not implemented

TP response:

US Department of State International Religious Freedom Report for 2011: The government failed to pass a law that would remove long standing discrimination from the process by which Christians build and repair places of worship. The government promised to consider such a law after both the Imbaba riots in May and the Maspiro violence in October. The Coptic Orthodox Church and Al Azhar, along with at least some Protestant churches, reportedly agreed to a draft in late October, but the Cabinet did not send it to the SCAF for approval by year's end.

CSW response:

Evoking Article 98(f) of the Penal Code, Egyptian authorities continue to prohibit citizens from "ridiculing or insulting heavenly religions or inciting sectarian strife." This provision has been used to detain and prosecute individuals and members of religious groups whose practices deviate from mainstream Islamic beliefs or whose activities are alleged to jeopardize "communal harmony" or to insult the three "heavenly religions:" Judaism, Christianity, and Islam. Discrimination is common, particularly with regard to converts from Islam to Christianity who face life either with no ID card; or with a card that does not recognise their new faith. ID cards are also used to discriminate in employment. A common occurrence throughout Egypt is attacking those building a new church or expanding an existing one. Although the 2012 proposed "Bill of Rights" discussed the importance of freedom of belief and expression, in practice those belonging to religious minority groups continue to be discriminated against. Although a unified law was drafted under SCAF, it proved unacceptable to both religious groups and a fresh law has yet to be enacted.

CS-JC response:

Currently there is a rapid expansion in applying the blasphemy law (Art. 98-f of the Penal Code) against Copts accused (often without proof) of "insulting Islam," but never applied to Muslim extremists who attack Christianity (and Judaism) as false religions and spread hate speech against their followers.

The Egyptian government continues to hinder passing a unified law for all places of worship. On October 2011, a committee formed under the leadership of Sheikh of Al-Azhar, Ahmed al-Tayyeb, rejected the draft on unified law on places of worship on the grounds that the religious rituals of Islam differ from those of Christianity.

ODI response:

Not implemented. Postponement of passing a law for construction and repair of churches is the main cause of many sectarian clashes.

CIHRS response:

The discussions on the law were suspended and the last draft law wasn't enacted. See Arabic press release: "[Unified Places of Worship Law: Promises renewed. Failure Assured](#)"

Recommendation n°137: *Release bloggers and activists currently detained under the Emergency Law and cease its arrests and detentions of political activists* (Recommended by United States)

IRI: -

CIHRS response:

The Emergency Law has currently been suspended, but there are efforts by the Ministry of the interior to reinstate it. The Emergency Law along with 5 other proposed laws by the Ministry of the Interior has the cumulative effect of criminalizing the intention to publicly decent. These 5 laws alone would in fact reinstate of the basic elements of the state of emergency, without the need to declare it. They would restore some of the exceptional police powers enjoyed before the revolution.

See [CIHRS analysis of Presidents first 100 days](#) and [Criminalizing the Egyptian Revolution](#) (Arabic).

Recommendation n°139: *Remove any categorization by religion on State documents including ID cards* (Recommended by Canada)

IRI: *not implemented*

CS-JC response:

The Egyptian government continues to state religious affiliations in ID cards, which make apostasy, conversion from Islam some interfaith marriages not possible. Exceptions are made if the man is Muslim and the woman is Christian, but not the opposite. The Egyptian government rarely restores the identities of Christian women who have been forcibly converted to Islam. NGOs reported that there are currently "960 women petitioning to have their Christian identities restored."

The Egyptian government through State Security intimidates and refuses to give converts from Islam to Christianity ID cards that state their new religious affiliations. For example Maher El-Gohary lost a court battle to change his ID card in Egypt and 2008. In addition to being intimidated and targeted by State Security, Islamist mobs attempted to behead him in the street and threw acid on his daughter in 2010, forcing him to live in hiding for two and half years. El-Gohary and his 18-year-old daughter fled Egypt in early 2011 to Syria are currently residing in France.

The Egyptian Baha'i community still remains subjected to collective punishment and face challenges in Egyptian government institutions.

ODI response:

Not implemented.

CIHRS response:

National ID cards still include information about citizen's religions. The State only recognizes the Abrahamic Faiths.

Recommendation n°141: Repeal of articles in the penal code which allow the imprisonment of journalists for their writing and amend the press provisions of the penal code so that they explicitly state that journalists not be imprisoned or otherwise punished for the sole exercise of their right to free expression (Recommended by Norway)

IRI: not implemented

CSW response:

No repeal of the articles allowing such action has taken place. After the overthrow of President Mubarak, the SCAF continued to prosecute journalists under the vast array of anti-media freedom laws. Following the advent of Mursi, a move by the authorities to put two of his critics on trial and actions against Al-Dustour, a small independent newspaper, and the Al-Faraeen channel have been criticised as heralding an increase in restrictions on freedom of expression.

AFTE response:

No amendments were made to the Penal Code regarding the imprisonment of journalists. The same articles are still applicable including articles 102 bis and 188 for publishing false news, article 179 the one focuses on insulting the president of the republic. And also the articles 181, 184, 185, 302, 302, 306, 307 and 308 that criminalize Libel speech.

There are still many trials against journalists, for example, the case of the "dostor" newspaper in June 2012, where the chairman and the chief editor of the newspaper are accused of committing crimes of libel, defamation and publishing of false news. The case was raised by Dr.Esaam El-Erian, deputy chairman of the ruling party (Freedom and Justice Party).

CIHRS response:

The provisions of the penal code that include imprisonment charges for publication offences weren't yet modified or reviewed. However, pre-trial administrative detention for the publication offences was recently abolished by presidential decree.

See response to recommendation 7.

Recommendation n°146: Review its legislation to complete the abolition of imprisonment penalties for publication offences (Recommended by Netherlands)

IRI: not implemented

CSW response:

Legislation has not been reviewed. After the overthrow of President Mubarak, the Information ministry, which controls all press returned and the SCAF continued to prosecute journalists under the vast array of anti-media freedom laws. Following the advent of Mursi, a move by the authorities to put two of his critics on trial and actions against Al-Dustour, a small independent newspaper, and the Al-Faraeen channel have been criticised as heralding an increase in restrictions on freedom of expression.

AFTE response:

No decisions on the abolition of imprisonment in publication cases were taken except the decision law issued by the president of the republic to amend the press law, according to which the remand in crime insulting the president was cancelled. A decision that was issued in the evening of the same day the court has imprisoned the chief editor of “dostor” newspaper on the custody of the pending case.

CIHRS response:

See responses to recommendations 7, 97, 137,141

Recommendation n°148: *Revise relevant laws and practice to ensure compliance with ICCPR including for bloggers and public access to internet* (Recommended by Czech Republic)

IRI: not implemented

CSW response:

Journalists and bloggers, however, continue to be imprisoned. Earlier this year, following the Presidential elections, the SCAF resumed its prosecution of journalists under Egypt's vast array of anti-media freedom laws. Blogger Ayman Youssef Mansour was sentenced in October 2011 by a civilian court to three years in prison for insulting religion on his Facebook page. In early 2011, the majority of the internet and cell phone services were shut down and the SCAF, which, along with the Information Ministry, not only perpetuated Hosni Mubarak's ways of controlling information, but strengthened them.

CIHRS response:

Nothing done on this effect.

Recommendation n°149: *Revise the procedures governing registration of civil society organizations to ensure transparent, non-discriminatory, expeditious and affordable procedures that conform to international human rights standards* (Recommended by Norway)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

None of the procedures that govern the registration of the civil society organizations have been changed or modified.

See response to recommendation 14

Recommendation n°161: *Take action to secure that the enjoyment of human rights extends to the Internet, as pronounced by the Human Rights Committee and relevant United Nations resolutions* (Recommended by Sweden)

IRI: not implemented

CSW response:

From February 2011, the SCAF not only perpetuated Hosni Mubarak's methods of controlling information, but strengthened them. Numerous civilian journalists and bloggers seeking to expose the abuses committed during the pro-democratic uprising by certain elements of the army or the military police were prosecuted in military courts, and sometimes jailed for several months. Netizen Ayman Youssef Mansour was sentenced in October 2011 by a civilian court to three years in prison for insulting religion on his Facebook page and continues to serve his sentence. Although rights such as freedom of expression are being positively talked about in the "Bill of Rights", in practice, little is being done to uphold these ideals.

CIHRS response:

See responses to recommendations 7, 97, 137, 141

Recommendation n°163: *Take further steps to promote an open and free press where journalists may report on a full spectrum of political, social and economic issues without fear of retribution* (Recommended by Canada)

IRI: not implemented

CSW response:

The January 2012 "Bill of Rights" proposed by Al-Azhar Grand Sheikh Ahmed Al-Tayeb discusses the importance of freedom of belief and expression, among other things, ahead of the drafting of the constitution. Although it reportedly took three months to gather support for this bill, it does mark a positive change. However, while positive steps to promote equality of religion and tangentially to uphold the freedom of expression are being taken, those who currently speak against the authorities and/or Islam are quickly repressed. Al-Dostor, a daily newspaper and website, came under investigation by Egypt's Public Prosecution following complaints over its criticism of the Muslim Brotherhood. The paper is known for its editorial stand against the movement. An issue of al-Dostor published on 11 August in which it claimed the Muslim Brotherhood was trying to establish an "Islamic state" in Egypt was confiscated by the authorities.

AFTE response:

The government didn't take clear steps to protect journalists; on the contrary, there have been many assaults for journalists while covering events by the soldiers of the interior minister and the military police. Also referring journalist and media members to exceptional military prosecutions and trials is a violation of their civilian right to natural and justice trials.

In addition, there has been the confiscation of the issue of the "Dostor" newspaper, and the accusation of its chief editor of insulting the president and spreading false news. In this case the court decided to imprison the chief editor on the custody of the pending case.

This incident has moved the president of the republic to issue a formal decision to amending the press law, according to which the remand in the crime of insulting the president was cancelled.

According to this presidential decision, the editor chief was released in the same day, however, he is still facing a case of imprisonment in a publication case.

CIHRS response:

Law nom. 96/1996 on regulating the press hasn't been repealed or amended. The government still utilizes the same security-centred mechanisms to limit opposition in the press. Last August, the editor-in-chief of Al Dostour Newspaper was accused of insulting the president for his critic articles and then referred to the criminal prosecution. Although the president ordered the charges be dropped, no serious steps were taken to repeal or amend the provisions of the penal code that allows imprisonment of the journalists.

See [CIHRS Press Release on Al Dostour Newspaper](#) (Arabic) and response to recommendation 7.

Recommendation n°168: *Thoroughly investigate all instances of the persecution of lawyers, members of the judiciary, human rights defenders, and journalists, for legitimate activities in the defence of human rights as well as lift restrictions within national legislation or practice that limit NGO registration and activity* (Recommended by Israel)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

Impunity for Human Rights violation continues to be prevalent in Egypt. So far prosecutions of all those accused of the HR violations since the Jan 25th protests were acquitted due to a lack of evidence. The legislation nom. 84/2002 is still existing which doesn't allow the NGOs to receive foreign funding without administrative approval.

For information on NGO legislation see response to recommendation 14.

Recommendation n°169: *Undertake all necessary measures to guarantee the freedom of religion of all religious orientations, in particular the Copts, including the right to practice religion in public* (Recommended by Germany)

IRI: not implemented

CSW response:

Following the Revolution there was an increase in sectarian violence and targeting of the Coptic community, for the most part led by members of the Salafi movement. Since the overthrow of Mubarak there have been over 44 serious incidents of sectarian violence against Copts, which have included murder, mutilations and the burning down and looting of businesses and homes. To put this in perspective, eighteen incidents were recorded by Egyptian human rights organisations between 2006 and January 2011. There has also been a continuation in discrimination, continuing difficulty in accessing justice within the legal system, and a lack of protection from security services during sectarian incidents. This has led to a climate where perpetrators of sectarian violence are able to commit such crimes with

impunity. Consequently, throughout the interim military rule of the Supreme Council of the Armed Forces (SCAF), the Coptic community continued to experience discrimination, even from the very people who should have protected their rights as citizens. Attacks on Copts have continued under President Morsi, but despite a show of support following the most recent incident, perpetrators have yet to be brought to justice. Investigations into events during the Maspero incident in 2011, when 27 Copts were killed and hundreds more injured, many after being run over by military tanks during a peaceful demonstration, have now been closed, due to an alleged lack of evidence, despite the existence of comprehensive video evidence of the massacre. Furthermore, Copts still require permission to build churches or extensions to current property without seeking the permission, since a draft law proposed by SCAF to unify regulations pertaining to the construction of places of worship was rejected as unsatisfactory by both religious communities. There are also increasing reports of Coptic women being abducted and forced to convert to Islam.

CS-JC response:

Coptic freedom to worship can be revoked at any time, by officials or Muslim leaders with mobs. Apostasy, conversion from Islam, blasphemy, and some interfaith marriages are always prohibited.

After the Muslim Brotherhood seized presidential power, the recomposition of the National Council for Human Rights (NCHR) is now comprised of radical Islamists with the exception of only two members with Human Rights background in the Islamists-dominated council where some members are champions of hate speech. For example: Sfawat Hegazy, who systematically spreads hate speech and has on numerous occasions incited the death of infidels on national Television.

ODI response:

Partially implemented. It is not applied on MBBs. Churches are still afraid of baptising converts from Islam and to admit them to their services.

CIHRS response:

See response to recommendation 61

TP response:

US Department of State International Religious Freedom Report for 2011: The government used violence against demonstrators, including against mostly Coptic Christian demonstrators at the Maspero radio and television building in Cairo in October, killing 25 persons and injuring approximately 330. On other occasions, through inaction, the government failed to prevent violence against Christians or stop the destruction of churches and religious minority-owned property. The government generally failed to investigate and prosecute effectively perpetrators of violence against Coptic Christians and continued to favor informal “reconciliation sessions,” which generally precluded criminal prosecution for crimes against Copts and contributed to a climate of impunity that encouraged further assaults.

ESC Rights

Recommendation n°52: *Continue its policies aimed at ensuring the enjoyment by all segments of society of their rights to food and social services* (Recommended by Azerbaijan)

IRI: not implemented

HCER response:

The agriculture is still dependent on using pesticides and sometimes depends on using sewage. Also the irrigation water is generally with bad quality because of the deterioration of the Nile River environmentally. In addition, nowadays GM seeds are being used which, in turn, affects citizens' right to food. As for social services, large ratio of citizens, especially in rural regions (56%), suffer from lack of drinking water continuously, and also citizens' complaints of the water's quality are increasing. This is accompanied with the high costs that citizens bear because of buying drinking water by high prices. Thus it is necessary to commit to this recommendation.

Recommendation n°64: *Continue to strengthen its efforts in ensuring housing for all Egyptian citizens* (Recommended by Saudi Arabia)

IRI: not implemented

HCER response:

Still the dream to access to safe house, where pure drinking water, sanitation and good ventilation are available and being far away from pollutants, whether they are factories or garbage piles, is far away. Also slums have been spread in most of the regions, the matter which threatens the services flow to other buildings, so the house transfers to unsuitable one environmentally.

Recommendation n°109: *Intensify employment programs for youth* (Recommended by Algeria)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

The prime minister stated this week that the unemployment rate reached 13% which is 3% higher than the official rate two years ago.

Indigenous & Minorities

Recommendation n°17: *Apply national legislation to individuals without discrimination based on their belonging to a religious minority or on sexual orientation* (Recommended by Switzerland)

IRI: not implemented

CSW response:

There is still inadequate protection for religious minorities. Christians and Baha'is are particularly discriminated against. The Baha'is faith is still not considered as an official religion and adherents are, therefore, denied basic rights. They also are

required to write 'other' or mark the religion field with a dash under the religion category in their national ID cards. Many Christians who have converted from Islam are not able to change the religion category on their identity cards and are often told to either continue maintain their Islamic identity, or not to have one at all. Some refuse to state they are Muslims and live without ID cards. However, not having an identity card is problematic in Egypt as it is needed for every area of life, including employment and marriage. As a result, many Christian converts are denied access to employment opportunities, education, health provision, voting rights as well as other basic rights, such as the right to a passport. During 2011 the Sufi community also experienced discrimination, as shrines were attacked by members of the Salafi movement, with limited government intervention.

ODI response:

Partially implemented in most of the sectarian conflict incidents against Christian, officials prefer reconciliation meetings, rather than to pursue legal action against the perpetrators.

Recommendation n°41: *Continue its effort to ensure rights of migrants in the country as well as abroad* (Recommended by Kyrgyzstan)

IRI: not implemented

CSW response:

Egypt has failed to provide the protection and rights of migrants in the country. It is particularly disturbing to note the extent of this in the Sinai region, where there the law is not properly enforced. This has resulted in the trafficking, sexual abuse and torture of many migrants entering the country - particularly from Eritrea and Ethiopia. Credible sources in Cairo report that 53 Eritreans have been abused in the Sinai by armed gangs in the past five months alone. Migrants are exploited by armed gangs who kidnap them and subject them to the most inhuman treatment before releasing them after a ransom has been met by a member of their family. To date, the Egyptian authorities are yet to address this widespread issue, despite Egypt having a strong anti-trafficking law (law 64), showing a major failure in their commitment to ensuring the rights of migrants.

Recommendation n°86: *Expedite the provision of all official documents, particularly identity documents to all members of its Baha'i community* (Recommended by United States)

IRI: not implemented

TP response:

US Department of State International Religious Freedom Report for 2011: Law 263 of 1960, still in force, bans Baha'i institutions and community activities and strips Baha'is of legal recognition. Despite the ban Baha'is are able to engage in community activities such as Naw-Ruz, the Baha'i new year's celebration. During the Nasser era, the government confiscated all Baha'i community properties, including Baha'i centers, libraries, and cemeteries. During the year Baha'is generally were able to secure new identity cards with a dash, but in several cases authorities refused to issue identity cards that state the correct marital status of married Baha'is on the grounds that Baha'i marriages are not recognized by Egyptian law. Baha'is reported that, in other cases, the government issued national identity papers indicating the

correct marital status of married Baha'is on the basis of civil marriage documents obtained outside of the country. The lack of formal recognition for the Baha'i Faith also continued to present obstacles in registering births and inheritance

CSW response:

Members of the Baha'i faith are still not allowed to class themselves as such in their identity cards. They are only allowed to describe themselves as 'other' in the religion section of their identity card.

CIHRS response:

The state doesn't recognize the Bahai's marriages until now in the national IDs in the which contradicts with the Administrative court ruling in 2009.

Recommendation n°159: *Strengthen the protection of minorities and ensure an end to impunity in this context* (Recommended by Finland)

IRI: ~~not~~ *partially* *fully implemented*

CIHRS response:

Though the SCAF issued a new legislation in October 2011 to combat discrimination against Copts and other religious minorities by penalizing all acts of discrimination by imprisonment and harsh fines, the implementation of the law is still questionable especially after the consecutive attacks by extremist Muslim Jihadists on Churches and Coptic communities in several incidents. This state didn't take firm actions to put an end to this violence which is largely believed to be one of the core reasons behind the spread of sectarian clashes. "[EIPR investigative report on the sectarian violence in Dahshur](#)".

International Instruments

Recommendation n°2: *Accede to the Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment* (Recommended by Czech Republic)

IRI: *not implemented*

+

Recommendation n°6: *Adhere to the Optional Protocol to the Convention Against Torture* (Recommended by France)

IRI: *not implemented*

+

Recommendation n°131: *Ratify the Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment* (Recommended by Switzerland)

IRI: *not implemented*

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°12: *Allow the Special Rapporteur on the promotion and protection of human rights while countering terrorism free access to detention centers and communication with persons in detention during his next visit* (Recommended by Spain)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°13: *Allow the visits of human rights special procedures that are pending to take place in a timely manner and consider issuing a standing invitation to the human rights special procedures* (Recommended by Czech Republic)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°25: *Consider prompt accession to the Optional Protocol on the Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights* (Recommended by Bolivia)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°26: *Consider ratifying the Rome Statute, Optional Protocols to the International Covenant on civil and Political Rights, the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discriminations against Women, the Convention against Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment and to the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities* (Recommended by Brazil)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°30: *Consider withdrawing the reservations to CEDAW articles 2, 16 and 29 and ratify OP-CEDAW* (Recommended by Norway)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°38: *Continue harmonizing its legislation with international human rights treaties by taking into consideration specificities of its society and requirement of modernization* (Recommended by Algeria)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°50: *Continue its ongoing review of national laws to ensure that they are in line with its international human rights law obligations* (Recommended by Bangladesh)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°51: *Continue its ongoing review of reservations entered to international human rights instruments* (Recommended by Bangladesh)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation n°90: *Fulfill its pledge to review the reservations which it has entered to human rights treaties with a view to withdrawing them* (Recommended by Japan)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°62: *Continue to expand the cooperation with the special procedures of the Human Rights Council* (Recommended by Sudan)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°88: *Extend an early invitation to the UN Special Rapporteur on Torture* (Recommended by Ireland)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation n°115: *Invite the Special Rapporteur on torture without delay and facilitate his visit to the country* (Recommended by Netherlands)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°91: *Fully implement Article 2 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, which provides that Everyone is entitled to all the rights and freedoms set forth in this Declaration, without distinction of any kind, such as race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status, and to recognize that sex also includes sexual orientation* (Recommended by Canada)

IRI: not implemented

TP response:

US State Department International Religious Freedom Report for 2011: The constitution and the Constitutional Declaration of 2011 provide for freedom of belief and the practice of religious rites, but the government places restrictions on these rights in policy and practice, such as forbidding Muslims from converting to another religion. Islam is the official state religion, and Sharia (Islamic law) is the primary source of legislation. Despite the ouster of former president Hosni Mubarak, the government's respect for religious freedom remained poor.

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°100: *Implement the accepted recommendations of the universal periodic review in cooperation with the National Council on Human Rights, NGOs, and the civil society* (Recommended by Indonesia)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°102: *Improve its cooperation with the United Nations Treaty Bodies by submitting overdue reports as a matter of priority* (Recommended by Norway)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation n°160: *Submit overdue reports to the treaty bodies* (Recommended by Austria)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°116: *Issue an open and standing invitation to all special procedures* (Recommended by Spain)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation n°117: *Issue an open and standing invitation to all special procedures, particularly to the Special Rapporteur on Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Punishment or Treatment* (Recommended by Belgium)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°130: *Ratify individual complaint mechanisms of United Nations treaty bodies* (Recommended by Austria)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°132: *Ratify the Optional Protocols to the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, the Optional Protocol to the Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment and the Rome Statute* (Recommended by Chile)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°138: *Remove all reservations to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women* (Recommended by Ireland)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°142: *Reply favorably to the request by the UN Special Rapporteur against torture for a visit and extend its full support to such a mission* (Recommended by Sweden)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°145: *Respond positively to the repeated requests for a visit by the Special Rapporteurs on torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment on the independence of judges and lawyers on the situation of human rights defenders, on freedom of religion or belief on extrajudicial, summary or arbitrary executions on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography and by the Working Group on Arbitrary Detention* (Recommended by Spain)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°171: *Withdraw the reservations to articles 2 and 16 of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discriminations Against Women* (Recommended by France)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Justice

Recommendation n°1: *Abolish prison terms for incitement to discrimination regarding sex, origin, language, religion or belief, and for acts damaging to an individual's honour* (Recommended by United States)

IRI: not implemented

AFTE response:

The government didn't take any decisions in this regard; the law is still criminalizing incitement speech and is regularly referred to the court. The court has issued several rulings against individuals under the alleged commission of a crime of defamation of religions, in cases of criticizing religions or for expressing some ideas or beliefs that are not recognized in Egypt.

CIHRS response:

No steps were taking on this effect

Recommendation n°10: *Allegations of torture be effectively and independently investigated at earliest in view of prosecuting the authors of these offences* (Recommended by Switzerland)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No serious steps have been taken.

Recommendation n°15: *Amend article 126 of the Penal Code to bring into line with the UN Convention against Torture* (Recommended by Ireland)

IRI: not implemented

CSW response:

Article 26 has not as yet been amended to bring it in line with UN instruments. Proposals to broaden the definition of torture by the Egyptian Organization for Human Rights in 2003 remain at that stage, and there seems to be no apparent willingness on the part of the current government to make amendments to article 126.

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°20: *Consider a moratorium on death penalty with a view to abolishing it in the future* (Recommended by Brazil)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation n°24: *Consider introducing a moratorium on the death penalty with a view to abolishing it in the near future* (Recommended by Greece)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation n°77: *Engage towards the abolition of the death penalty by adopting a moratorium, commuting all sentences already pronounced and by reducing the number of offences punishable by this penalty* (Recommended by France)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation n°85: *Establish, as a first stage, a moratorium on all executions and then fully abolish the death penalty* (Recommended by Switzerland)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation n°112: *Introduce at the earliest a moratorium on the death penalty* (Recommended by Belgium)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°21: *Consider confessions obtained through torture or ill-treatment as inadmissible* (Recommended by Switzerland)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No real measures were adopted by the Egyptian Authorities to stop obtaining confessions under torture or ill-treatment as the Human Rights reports monitors systematic torture inside the military prisons and in the police stations before and after the oust of Mubarak. See [HRW report on the ill-treatment](#) suffered by the imprisoned protesters of Abasseya clashes last May.

Recommendation n°27: Consider repealing the provisions, which allow administrative detention and guarantee to all detainees immediate access to lawyers, doctors and family members (Recommended by Chile)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

Administrative detention was repealed only to journalists with regards to publication charges by a presidential decree.

Recommendation n°29: Consider the elimination of the death penalty and, in all events, adjust its implementation to the provisions of Article 6 of the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (Recommended by Chile)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°40: Continue increasing efforts aimed at combating trafficking in human beings at the national as well as at the international level, including through coordination and cooperation with interested governments, international organisations and NGOs (Recommended by Belarus)

IRI: not implemented

CSW response:

There has been a significant failure by Egypt to combat the problems of trafficking and forcible organ harvesting by organised crime linked to Bedouin families in the Sinai Peninsula and they have failed cooperate or coordinate efforts with NGOs. When confronted with reports from national and international NGOs and news agencies, the government began by denying the existence of the problem, then complained, with some validity, that it lacked the capacity to tackle it given the terms of the Camp David Accords that limited the military presence in the area. Trafficking subsequently flourished, with Eritrean refugees and asylum seekers held hostage purpose built camps and tortured in attempts to elicit up to \$30,000 from friends and relatives. This source of funding also enabled the purchase of weaponry, and the fall of the Gadaffi regime added to a proliferation of arms in an area with a historical grievance against the Egyptian state. The Egyptian security presence in the Sinai increased in recent months following the murder of sixteen soldiers by armed groups. It is vital that it is hoped that the new government also uses this opportunity to finally address the issue of traffickers in the Sinai and secure the release of hundreds of migrants currently held for ransom on the border, ensuring that those released are treated in line with UN standards regarding refugees and migrants.

CS-JC response:

The Egyptian government continues to ignore the trafficking of religious minorities. Police refuse to file reports or fail to investigate. Families and concerned citizens have been intimidated or even beaten for reporting incidents of trafficking.

NGOs estimate that 550 Coptic women and girls have been kidnapped and trafficked within and without Egypt in the last five years. Coptic Solidarity recently reported: “According to Al Moheet, a new human rights report indicates that there are dozens of cases of Muslim gangs abducting Christian Copts and holding them for ransom, in Nag Hammadi alone.

Earlier reports document the same travesties against Egypt's Christians, and in different regions, including villages near Alexandria, Minia, Asyut, and Sohag. The human rights report adds that those who are sent to collect ransom payments from the Christians families are often known and connected to some of the larger families of Nag Hammadi, and some are even known to the police, who, as usual, look the other way.”

One of the known dozen cases that were report by NGOs last month is the case of Alfred Abdel Massih, a 27-year-old Christian man, who was abducted on his way to his family business in Nag Hammadi by an armed mob and he was held captive for 22 days, during which he was tortured. His abductors were known by name to his family and the police, and he was only released after the family paid 260,000 Egyptian pounds. Abdel Massih was only released upon paying the ransom and none of his abductors were brought to justice.

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°49: *Continue its efforts towards the early finalization of the anti-terrorism law, which can serve to combat terrorism while ensuring promotion and protection of human rights* (Recommended by Pakistan)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation n°79: *Ensure that all anti-terrorism measures comply with international standards* (Recommended by Norway)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

All the discussions on the adoption of an anti-terrorism law were suspended after the ouster of Mubarak.

Recommendation n°75: *End the exceptional state of emergency and lift the Emergency Law, and to abstain from legislation that introduces measures of Emergency Law into the Constitution* (Recommended by Germany)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

The state of emergency was lifted in May this year. Yet there are attempts to amend the notorious law with a pack of restrictive laws that are drafted by the MOI or by the

cabinet that reflect the adoption of the government to the same restrictive tendency with the Human Rights issues. See CIHRS press release on the NGOS meeting with the minister of Justice "[Rights organizations meet Minister of Justice, state: Security reform requires political will, not additional repressive laws; Crackdown on NGOs continues](#)".

Recommendation n°76: *End the State of Emergency as soon as possible* (Recommended by Austria)

IRI: fully implemented

+

Recommendation n°120: *Lift the state of emergency that has been in effect since 1981 and replace the Emergency Law with a counterterrorism law that guarantees civil liberties* (Recommended by United States)

IRI: fully implemented

CSW response:

This was ended by the military on 31 May 2012

CIHRS response:

The state of emergency was lifted in May this year.

Recommendation n°80: *Ensure that the crime of torture is punished in accordance with the comprehensive definition as contained in Article 1 of the International Convention Against Torture* (Recommended by Germany)

IRI: not implemented

CSW response:

There have been credible reports that thousands of prisoners imprisoned following summary military trials have been subjected to physical, sexual and emotional assault by police and military officers. Furthermore, many female protestors during the 2011 were subjected to 'virginity tests' during imprisonment, and towards the end on 2011, there was ample video evidence of soldiers assaulting unarmed demonstrators, including women. There were also reports of activists being abducted on the street, severely mistreated, threatened and released.

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure as systematic torture still exists and is practised by the security. See pages 97, 98 of CIHRS annual report "[Fractured Walls .. New Horizons](#)".

Recommendation n°84: *Establish independent monitoring of conditions in detention and prisons together with effective complaint procedure for victims of torture* (Recommended by Czech Republic)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°87: *Expedite the reform of the Criminal Code in order to include a definition of torture in accordance with the Convention Against Torture* (Recommended by France)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°89: *Fulfill its pledge to review the definition of torture in Egyptian law and ensure its consistency with the Convention against Torture in order to strengthen its fight against torture* (Recommended by Japan)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

A first step was taken in April 2012, with the parliament discussing a new definition for torture, however the parliament was dissolved before agreeing on the legal text.

Recommendation n°107: *Increase efforts to ensure that the competent authorities, in particular the public prosecutor, investigate all torture allegations promptly and to bring any officials found responsible to justice* (Recommended by Austria)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure as the general prosecutor is believed to hinder the investigations on torture allegations.

Recommendation n°113: *Investigate and prosecute perpetrators of sectarian violence and ensure victims' recourse to the judicial system* (Recommended by United States)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure. See pages 107-110 of CIHRS annual report "[Fractured Walls. New Horizons](#)".

Recommendation n°118: *Join the moratorium established by General Assembly Resolution 62-149, as a preliminary step toward abolishing capital punishment* (Recommended by Spain)

IRI: not implemented

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken on this measure

Recommendation n°123: *Not renew the Emergency Law in April 2010, and ensure that future legislation fully respects Egypt's obligations under international human rights law and not entrench under statute law provisions that facilitate human rights violations* (Recommended by Canada)

IRI: partially implemented

CIHRS response:

Though the emergency status was lifted, yet there are fears that the new emergency law doesn't fully respects Egypt's obligations under international human rights law and not entrench under statute law provisions that facilitate human rights violations. See "[Crackdown on NGOs continues](#)".

Recommendation n°129: *Put an end, as soon as possible, to the state of emergency and ensure that the provisions of the future anti-terrorism law scrupulously respect human rights* (Recommended by France)

IRI: *fully implemented*

+

Recommendation n°152: *Speed up the adoption on anti terrorism law while considering lifting the state of emergency once the law has been passed* (Recommended by Sudan)

IRI: *fully implemented*

CIHRS response:

The state of emergency was lifted in May this year and all the discussions on the anti-terrorism law were suspended.

Recommendation n°134: *Reform articles 126 and 129 of the Penal Code regarding the crime of torture, in order to broaden the scope of punishable conduct and prevent impunity for perpetrators* (Recommended by Spain)

IRI: *not implemented*

+

Recommendation n°136: *Reinforce the fight against torture* (Recommended by Switzerland)

IRI: *not implemented*

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure. See pages 97,98 of CIHRS annual report "[Fractured Walls .. New Horizons](#)".

Recommendation n°140: *Remove the penalty of imprisonment from articles 102bis, 179, and 308 of the Penal Code* (Recommended by Ireland)

IRI: *not implemented*

AFTE response:

No amendments were mad to the Penal Code regarding the imprisonment of journalists. The same articles are still applicable including articles 102 bis and 188 for publishing false news, article 179 the one focuses on insulting the president of the republic. And also the articles 181, 184,185,302,302,306,307 and 308 that criminalize Libel speech.

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°143: *Require that the police act with restraint when not directly threatened* (Recommended by United States)

IRI: *not implemented*

CIHRS response:

The practices of the MOI [*editor's note*: Ministry of Interior] proves that no procedures were taken to amend the policies of the ministry and reform its approaches, as a large number of peaceful protests, sit-ins, and strikes were dispersed, though the participators of which didn't undertake any actions that could threat the police.

Recommendation n°164: *That the emergency legislation under the state of emergency, which is the root cause to many human rights problems in Egypt, be repealed, and that future legislation be elaborated based on the enjoyment of human rights* (Recommended by Sweden)

IRI: *partially implemented*

CIHRS response:

Though the state of emergency, as aforementioned, was lifted earlier this year, yet the amendments made by the newly-appointed minister of justice to the existing, notorious law stresses and ensures on the continuity of the restrictive tendencies towards different HR aspects.

Recommendation n°166: *The counter-terrorism law that is to replace the current state of emergency take into account the recommendations made by the Special Rapporteur on the promotion and protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms while countering terrorism* (Recommended by Netherlands)

IRI: *not implemented*

CIHRS response:

It is worth mentioning that the discussions on the anti-terrorism law were suspended right after the ouster of Mubarak.

Recommendation n°167: *The letter and the spirit of the provisions of the new antiterrorism law do not impose restrictions on the enjoyment of human rights and fundamental freedoms that are contrary to international human rights standards* (Recommended by Greece)

IRI: *not implemented*

CIHRS response:

As aforementioned, the discussions on the anti-terrorism law suspended right after the ouster of Mubarak.

Women & Children

Recommendation n°8: *Advance in the promotion of the status of women in society in order to achieve full equality in rights between women and men in all matters* (Recommended by Chile)

IRI: *not implemented*

Egyptian Association for Community Participation Enhancement (+ El Karama) (EACPE) response:

Despite the vital roles and sacrifices by women in the 2011 revolution, neither the military rulers (Supreme Council of the Armed Forces) nor the short-lived 2012 parliament, the new President, nor constitutional assembly have advanced the status of women in Egypt's society yet. Rather, their actions concerning and/or ignoring women have erased previous hard-won gains, particularly in politics and leadership, and other proposals threaten to regress even further from the goals of the revolution which were freedom, dignity, justice, equality, and equal opportunity for all. At present, Article 36 in the draft constitution ensures gender equality only according to Islamic law. A member of the Constituent Assembly and legal advisor to the FJP

stated that this was stipulated in order to avert full adherence to CEDAW articles and to maintain gender inequality in Islamic inheritance laws. A draft article in the constitution that would have banned trafficking of women and girls was even removed. Before being dissolved as unconstitutional, the 2012 Parliament debated bills proposing to lower the minimum age for marriage to 14 and to abolish the Islamic right to divorce law for women.

Recommendation n°16: Amend the Personal Status Law and Penal Code to guarantee equal rights for women and provide guarantees that domestic violence will be effectively prosecuted (Recommended by Netherlands)

IRI: not implemented

CSW response:

Following the revolution in 2011, there have been no attempts to amend the Personal Status Law and Penal Code as other national needs appeared to take precedence. However, in a worrying development, in early 2011 the President of the Family Appeal Court presented a draft to the then Prime Minister, Essam Sharaf, repealing some of the more progressive parts of the Personal Status Law. The draft includes 7 articles, demanding the cancellation of (El Khol'), that a mother's custody would end when the male child reaches 7 years old and female child reaches 10 years old, that the father has sole educational guardianship and in case the foster mother is inflicted she should go to court. The draft also mentions enforcing a wife's obedience by coercive force in the event the wife does not object to the warning in time, or that a final verdict has been issued in addition to the cessation of her alimony until she is once again obedient. Although, this has not been enacted, as of yet, there are fears that changes, such as those listed above, could be a reality for Egyptian women with the emergence of a new Islamic government and will further diminish their already limited rights.

EACPE response:

Instead of working to amend the Personal Status Code and Penal Code to guarantee equal rights for women and to require prosecution of domestic violence, certain policymakers and leaders have proposed the opposite, demanding to review the family law and revise it according to strict interpretations of shari'a. Although the minimum age for marriage was set by law in 2008 at 18, some members of the 2012 parliament stated that under shari'a there is no minimum age for marriage. Some MPs disputed the legitimacy of the Islamic divorce law for women (Khula) as well as the laws that grant the mother custody of children to age 15. Some MPs proposed removing the ban on female genital mutilation, and other contended that the ratification of CEDAW should be reversed and the National Council for Women should be replaced with a National Council for the Family. This Parliament was dissolved by the Supreme Court's decision before any legislation was passed.

Recommendation n°22: Consider elaborating an integrated national strategy to address the different forms of violence against women (Recommended by Palestine)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation n°135: *Reform the Criminal Code to punish all cases of sexual and domestic violence* (Recommended by France)

IRI: *not implemented*

+

Recommendation n°162: *Take concrete steps to increase the protection of women, ensuring that, complaints of domestic violence are properly registered and investigated by the police, and that perpetrators are prosecuted and convicted* (Recommended by Norway)

IRI: *not implemented*

EACPE response:

There has been no progress by the government for an integrated national strategy, policy, protection, or services to address the different forms of violence against women. While a law against trafficking was approved in Egypt after the 2010 UPR session, the 2012 Constitutional Assembly drafting Egypt's new constitution has rejected a constitutional article that would have specifically outlawed the trafficking of women and girls. On 8 March 2011 nearly 300 women protesting the exclusion of women from SCAF's constitutional committee were beaten, sexually assaulted, and harassed by a mob. The following day the military detained 18 female protesters, held 17 of them for 4 days, beat some of them and used electric shocks, strip-searched them and forced them to subject to the violation of 'virginity testing' in public spaces under the threat of being charged with prostitution. An Egyptian general defended the use of forced virginity testing, saying that "these were girls who camped out with men in Tahrir Square"; this general has since been appointed Minister of Defense by Egypt's new president. One of the young women and her father filed a court case against the military, and the Egyptian court decision issued a ban of virginity tests for female detainees. However, a military court acquitted the doctor who conducted the exams on the young women detained on 9 March. In December 2011, women protesters were beaten violently by soldiers who kicked them and dragged them through the streets. Armed forces took at least eight female protesters to a parliament building in central Cairo. They reportedly beat them with sticks and some were molested by soldiers or threatened with sexual assault. Thousands of women and men took to the streets to decry the beatings. Follow-up demonstrations by women on 9 June 2012 and 3 October 2012 have called for protection from sexual assaults and sexual harassment. Follow-up demonstrations by women on 9 June 2012 and 3 October 2012 have called for protection from sexual assaults and sexual harassment. On Friday 9 June 2012 the march was called to demand an end to sexual assaults. Around 50 women participated, surrounded by a larger group of male supporters who joined hands to form a protective ring around them. The protesters carried posters saying, "The people want to cut the hand of the sexual harasser," and chanted, "The Egyptian girl says it loudly, harassment is barbaric." After the marchers entered a crowded corner of Tahrir square, a group of men waded into the group of women, heckling them and groping them. The male supporters tried to fend them off, and it turned into a melee involving a mob of hundreds. The marchers tried to flee while the attackers chased them and male supporters tried to protect them. But the attackers persisted, cornering several women against a metal sidewalk railing, including an Associated Press reporter, shoving their hands down their clothes and trying to grab their bags. Unsurprisingly, a Gallup poll in 2012 found that the percentage of Egyptian women who said they feel

safe walking alone at night in their neighbourhood dropped to 57% from 76% since the revolution. In October 2012, the National Council of Women called on the Ministry of the Interior to ensure greater protection for women from sexual harassment, particularly in front of schools and on busy streets. The Minister of the Interior agreed to increase patrols in these areas and to implement the sexual harassment law by making arrests based on witness accounts and not waiting only for women to report the cases.

Recommendation n°23: *Consider further steps to ensure a high number of women in decision-making positions* (Recommended by Norway)

IRI: not implemented

CSW response:

Since the revolution there has been a noticeable decline in female representation in decision-making positions in Egypt. In the new parliament women make up less than 2%, occupying only 8 of 508 seats. A law introduced under the Mubarak regime requiring 64 female members was discarded following his ousting. No women ran for the Presidency and the issue of 'women rights' was not seen as a priority by many of the political parties. Despite promising to appoint a woman as his vice-President, President Mursi eventually appointed a male to the position and included only two women in his cabinet.

EACPE response:

The number of women in decision-making positions has lowered, as a result of policies enacted by the military, the lack of female leaders appointed by the military and the new president, and the lack of support for female candidates by political parties. In February 2011 the SCAF appointed an all-male committee to write the constitutional articles for the March 2011 referendum. In July 2011 during a reshuffle of Egyptian governors of the provinces, SCAF did not appoint any female governors. The Minister for Local Development claimed that women could not be appointed governors because they would not be able to go out into the streets in the current security environment to address social problems. For the November 2011 parliamentary elections, the SCAF revoked the 2010 quota that guaranteed 10% of the parliament's seats to women. Instead each party was required to include at least one female name on each list of 8 candidates. Most of the parties put the woman's name in the middle or bottom of the list (and the Salafis' Al Nour party used a flower on the ballot in some instances instead of a photo of their female candidate's face). Because of the proportional election system, only the top or top few names on each list could gain seats. Consequently, of the 498 elected members of the now-dismissed parliament, only 8 were women or approximately 2%. In the constitutional assembly (2nd) that is currently at work on the draft constitution, only 6 of 100 are female. And in August 2012, the new President named only 2 women among the 35 Cabinet posts and 2 women to his advisory council of 17.

Recommendation n°28: *Consider strengthening the Complaints Office of the National Council for Women and the helpline of the National Council for Children, building on past experience and with a view to strengthening the role and effectiveness of these two institutions throughout the Republic* (Recommended by Palestine)

IRI: not implemented

EACPE response:

In place since 2002, the Ombudsman Office of the National Council of Women can receive complaints but has no legal power to investigate, recommend corrective measures, and issue or pursue those recommendations to the appropriate government body. These are powers that would strengthen its role and effectiveness to handle and address complaints. Instead, it is still a project funded by EU without any plans on how it is to become an important part of the Egyptian bureaucracy with clear mandate, terms of reference and legal authority. From January to August 2012, the office received 2,899 complaints: Personal Status complaints represented the largest number of complaints received by the Office (46.4%), followed by family guidance at a rate of 13.46%, divorce proceedings at 12.52%, then alimonies for the spouse and children at 12.44% and claims for child support by 10.64%.

Recommendation n°35: *Continue efforts to improve the situation of women and their empowerment* (Recommended by Jordan)

IRI: *not implemented*

HCER response:

Among other categories of society, women are exposed to violations concerning their right to water and sanitation. Women are exposed to double violation because she undertakes the main role in getting water and take care of her family's health. It is important that she can participate in taking decisions related to achieve environmental justice and what is related to it of rights, whether concerning drinking water, housing or land as one side of women empowerment which she has not access it yet and also according to what has been stated in CEDAW Convention.

EACPE response:

Despite the vital roles and sacrifices by women in the 2011 revolution, neither the military rulers (Supreme Council of the Armed Forces) nor the short-lived 2012 parliament, the new President, nor constitutional assembly have advanced the status of women in Egypt's society yet. Rather, their actions concerning and/or ignoring women have erased previous hard-won gains, particularly in politics and leadership, and other proposals threaten to regress even further from the goals of the revolution which were freedom, dignity, justice, equality, and equal opportunity for all. At present, Article 36 in the draft constitution ensures gender equality only according to Islamic law. A member of the Constituent Assembly and legal advisor to the FJP stated that this was stipulated in order to avert full adherence to CEDAW articles and to maintain gender inequality in Islamic inheritance laws. A draft article in the constitution that would have banned trafficking of women and girls was even removed. Before being dissolved as unconstitutional, the 2012 Parliament debated bills proposing to lower the minimum age for marriage to 14 and to abolish the Islamic right to divorce law for women.

Recommendation n°39: *Continue implementing the National Illiteracy Eradication Project, giving priority to girls and women* (Recommended by Bolivia)

IRI: *not implemented*

EACPE response:

No progress. Moreover, it is strange that the draft constitution states that the State is responsible to eradicate illiteracy in 10 years. This should be 3 to 5 years maximum, as all other countries have declared.

Recommendation n°44: *Continue its efforts in ensuring the improvement of the status of women, including through intensifying the implementation of programmes and activities for the empowerment of women and enhancing women's participation in the political field* (Recommended by Malaysia)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation n°53: *Continue its policies in the area of the promotion and protection of the human rights of women* (Recommended by Bhutan)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation n°59: *Continue the implementation of effective programs for the elimination of all forms of discrimination against women* (Recommended by Belarus)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation n°60: *Continue to adopt strategies to combat discrimination against women* (Recommended by Angola)

IRI: not implemented

EACPE response:

Despite the vital roles and sacrifices by women in the 2011 revolution, neither the military rulers (Supreme Council of the Armed Forces) nor the short-lived 2012 parliament, the new President, nor constitutional assembly have advanced the status of women in Egypt's society yet. Rather, their actions concerning and/or ignoring women have erased previous hard-won gains, particularly in politics and leadership, and other proposals threaten to regress even further from the goals of the revolution which were freedom, dignity, justice, equality, and equal opportunity for all. At present, Article 36 in the draft constitution ensures gender equality only according to Islamic law. A member of the Constituent Assembly and legal advisor to the FJP stated that this was stipulated in order to avert full adherence to CEDAW articles and to maintain gender inequality in Islamic inheritance laws. A draft article in the constitution that would have banned trafficking of women and girls was even removed. In July 2011 the president of the Family Court of Appeal in Egypt submitted a draft bill to the interim prime minister that called for the abolition of the Khula divorce law, and reinstating, under some conditions, a practice in which husbands can forcibly return 'disobedient' wives to their homes--a practice outlawed since the 1960s. The Al Wafd party's newspaper published a lengthy attack in March 2011 on women's rights laws as well, such as those allowing women to obtain passports and travel abroad without the permission of their fathers or husbands. The Salafis' Al Nour party held a conference in October 2011 entitled "Women's Role in Political Life" and did not have a single woman among the speakers. Subsequently, instead of working to amend the Personal Status Code and Penal Code to guarantee equal rights for women and to require prosecution of domestic violence, members of the parliament (since dissolved) proposed the opposite, demanding to review the family law and revise it according to strict interpretations of shari'a. Although the minimum

age for marriage was set by law in 2008 at 18, some members of the 2012 parliament stated that under shari'a there is no minimum age for marriage. Some MPs disputed the legitimacy of the Islamic divorce law for women (Khula) as well as the laws that grant the mother custody of children to age 15. Some MPs proposed removing the ban on female genital mutilation, and other contended that the ratification of CEDAW should be reversed and the National Council for Women should be replaced with a National Council for the Family. This Parliament was dissolved by the Supreme Court's decision before any legislation was passed. In terms of the political field, the number of women in decision-making positions has lowered. In February 2011 the SCAF appointed an all-male committee to write the constitutional articles for the March 2011 referendum. In July 2011 during a reshuffle of Egyptian governors of the provinces, SCAF did not appoint any female governors. The Minister for Local Development claimed that women could not be appointed governors because they would not be able to go out into the streets in the current security environment to address social problems. For the November 2011 parliamentary elections, the SCAF revoked the 2010 quota that guaranteed 10% of the parliament's seats to women. Instead each party was required to include at least one female name on each list of 8 candidates. Most of the parties put the woman's name in the middle or bottom of the list (and the Salafis' Al Nour party used a flower on the ballot in some instances instead of a photo of their female candidate's face). Because of the proportional election system, only the top or top few names on each list could gain seats. Consequently, of the 498 elected members of the now-dismissed parliament, only 8 were women or approximately 2%. The new President named only 2 women among the 35 Cabinet posts and 2 women to his advisory council of 17.

Recommendation n°46: *Continue its efforts to eradicate female genital mutilation and strengthen implementation of its laws and administrative decisions criminalizing its perpetrators* (Recommended by Bhutan)

IRI: not implemented

EACPE response:

Rather than seeking to strengthen the law, a female member of parliament proposed removing the ban on female circumcision in April 2012. The current President appeared to suggest during a Q&A session while still a candidate that he was in favor of leaving the choice on having the procedure for the family to make. Their party, the FJP, stated it remains opposed to the ban and that more awareness efforts are needed to ensure the ban is enacted.

Recommendation n°47: *Continue its efforts to promote the political participation of women at all levels and to increase the representation of women in the judiciary* (Recommended by Palestine)

IRI: not implemented

EACPE response:

The number of women in decision-making positions has lowered. In February 2011 the SCAF appointed an all-male committee to write the constitutional articles for the March 2011 referendum. In July 2011 during a reshuffle of Egyptian governors of the provinces, SCAF did not appoint any female governors. The Minister for Local Development claimed that women could not be appointed governors because they

would not be able to go out into the streets in the current security environment to address social problems. For the November 2011 parliamentary elections, the SCAF revoked the 2010 quota that guaranteed 10% of the parliament's seats to women. Instead each party was required to include at least one female name on each list of 8 candidates. Most of the parties put the woman's name in the middle or bottom of the list (and the Salafis' Al Nour party used a flower on the ballot in some instances instead of a photo of their female candidate's face). Because of the proportional election system, only the top or top few names on each list could gain seats. Consequently, of the 498 elected members of the now-dismissed parliament, only 8 were women or approximately 2%. The new President named only 2 women among the 35 Cabinet posts and 2 women to his advisory council of 17.

Recommendation n°92: Further intensify its efforts to promote gender equality, to combat violence against women and girls, sexual harassment and abuse, and recognize the important role of non-governmental organizations in this field (Recommended by Finland)

IRI: not implemented

EACPE response:

Despite the vital roles and sacrifices by women in the 2011 revolution, neither the military rulers (Supreme Council of the Armed Forces) nor the short-lived 2012 parliament, the new President, nor constitutional assembly have advanced the status of women in Egypt's society yet. Rather, their actions concerning and/or ignoring women have erased previous hard-won gains, particularly in politics and leadership, and other proposals threaten to regress even further from the goals of the revolution which were freedom, dignity, justice, equality, and equal opportunity for all. At present, Article 36 in the draft constitution ensures gender equality only according to Islamic law. A member of the Constituent Assembly and legal advisor to the FJP stated that this was stipulated in order to avert full adherence to CEDAW articles and to maintain gender inequality in Islamic inheritance laws. A draft article in the constitution that would have banned trafficking of women and girls was even removed. Before being dissolved as unconstitutional, the 2012 Parliament debated bills proposing to lower the minimum age for marriage to 14 and to abolish the Islamic right to divorce law for women.

There has been no progress by the government for an integrated national strategy, policy, protection, or services to address the different forms of violence against women. While a law against trafficking was approved in Egypt after the 2010 UPR session, the 2012 Constitutional Assembly drafting Egypt's new constitution has rejected a constitutional article that would have specifically outlawed the trafficking of women and girls. On 8 March 2011 nearly 300 women protesting the exclusion of women from SCAF's constitutional committee were beaten, sexually assaulted, and harassed by a mob. The following day the military detained 18 female protesters, held 17 of them for 4 days, beat some of them and used electric shocks, strip-searched them and forced them to subject to the violation of 'virginity testing' in public spaces under the threat of being charged with prostitution. An Egyptian general defended the use of forced virginity testing, saying that "these were girls who camped out with men in Tahrir Square"; this general has since been appointed Minister of Defense by Egypt's new president. One of the young women and her father filed a

court case against the military, and the Egyptian court decision issued a ban of virginity tests for female detainees. However, a military court acquitted the doctor who conducted the exams on the young women detained on 9 March. In December 2011, women protesters were beaten violently by soldiers who kicked them and dragged them through the streets. Armed forces took at least eight female protesters to a parliament building in central Cairo. They reportedly beat them with sticks and some were molested by soldiers or threatened with sexual assault. Thousands of women and men took to the streets to decry the beatings. Follow-up demonstrations by women on 9 June 2012 and 3 October 2012 have called for protection from sexual assaults and sexual harassment. Follow-up demonstrations by women on 9 June 2012 and 3 October 2012 have called for protection from sexual assaults and sexual harassment. On Friday 9 June 2012 the march was called to demand an end to sexual assaults. Around 50 women participated, surrounded by a larger group of male supporters who joined hands to form a protective ring around them. The protesters carried posters saying, "The people want to cut the hand of the sexual harasser," and chanted, "The Egyptian girl says it loudly, and harassment is barbaric." After the marchers entered a crowded corner of Tahrir square, a group of men waded into the group of women, heckling them and groping them. The male supporters tried to fend them off, and it turned into a melee involving a mob of hundreds. The marchers tried to flee while the attackers chased them and male supporters tried to protect them. But the attackers persisted, cornering several women against a metal sidewalk railing, including an Associated Press reporter, shoving their hands down their clothes and trying to grab their bags. Unsurprisingly, a Gallup poll in 2012 found that the percentage of Egyptian women who said they feel safe walking alone at night in their neighbourhood dropped to 57% from 76% since the revolution. In October 2012, the National Council of Women called on the Ministry of the Interior to ensure greater protection for women from sexual harassment, particularly in front of schools and on busy streets. The Minister of the Interior agreed to increase patrols in these areas and to implement the sexual harassment law by making arrests based on witness accounts and not waiting only for women to report the cases. With regard to NGOs, the Egyptian government under the military rulers and continuing under its new president has chosen to target NGOs rather than support them. Currently, 43 employees of foreign NGOs are standing trial in Egypt for operating without a license; Law 84 of 2002 dictates that all NGOs must be registered with Egypt's ministries, which have the right to monitor activity and funding, and to dissolve them. A new law on NGOs was proposed in April 2012, which aimed to nationalize civil society. Under this law civil society would be considered an institution of the government, and NGO staff would be regarded as civil servants. The draft law extensively enumerates the activities prohibited to associations and NGOs, including, strangely, a ban on NGOs from conducting field research. The draft law formulates this prohibition in a broad, vague manner, allowing it to denote any type of field research or opinion polls as being among the list of prohibited activities. In addition, the draft law raises the minimum number of founding members for an association to twenty - twice the number required by the current law - which will impede the right of citizens to establish organizations. Moreover, in order to establish a civil association, an amount of no less than 100,000 Egyptian pounds must be in the possession of the association, whereas the current law does not require any specific monetary sum. The draft law prohibits associations from

fundraising activities and from receiving funds from abroad - except upon government authorization - which would have serious consequences for civil society, as domestic funding sources are not adequate to sustain its activities. The draft law bars associations and NGOs from establishing memberships in or affiliations with any foreign networks except upon government approval. This prohibition is contrary to international standards of freedom of association which allow associations to draw on the experience of and engage in international coalitions for the defense of national, regional and international causes. It raises the maximum penalty for imprisonment and fines and provides for the possibility of imposing even harsher penalties derived from the Penal Code or any other law. The new draft law also added new acts which had not been punishable by law No. 84 of 2002. The introduction of criminal sanctions in a law regulating civil activity would terrorize civil society activists or those aspiring to support civil society or participate in its activities. Rather, sanctions imposed on civil society associations should be of an administrative nature.

Recommendation n°99: *Implement programs to fight against child labour*
(Recommended by Syria)

IRI: -

EACPE response:

In the draft constitution there are clear flaws regarding the protection of children from the dangers of child labor. The proposed rule to ban child labor in the workplace does not set any minimum age for work, such as the age to complete compulsory education (15), and it provides no protection after compulsory education for children in the worst forms of child labor, which may destroy their lives or their health or descendants or education. The draft constitution proposed in Article 35 only prohibits "the employment of a child not having exceeded the age of compulsory education in a job not relevant for the age thereof." The proposed text drafted by civil society had stated: "prohibits the employment of children before completing compulsory education, also prohibits employment before the age of eighteen years in businesses of the worst forms of child labor."

Recommendation n°105: *Increase cooperation and coordination between governmental institutions and the National Council for Women as the best framework to ensure that women's rights take root and promote women* (Recommended by Tunisia)

IRI: *not implemented*

EACPE response:

The National Council of Women's 30 members were replaced in 2012 by appointees of the interim Prime Minister. The NCW has since advocated that the constituent assembly be at least 50 percent female, proposed candidates for membership in the Assembly (all were ignored), and presented draft constitutional articles defending women's rights to members of the constituent assembly. In April 2012, the head of the NCW appealed to the Speaker of the Assembly not to approve two controversial laws on the minimum age of marriage and allowing a husband to have sex with his dead wife within six hours of her death. Recently, the NCW called on the Ministry of the Interior to ensure greater protection for women from sexual harassment, particularly in front of schools and on busy streets. The Minister of the Interior agreed to increase patrols in these areas and to implement the sexual harassment law by

making arrests based on witness accounts and not waiting only for women to report the cases. In response to the request from the NCW to activate the Equal Opportunities Unit, the Minister of the Interior appointed a head of this Unit. The NCW has published its opposition to the draft article 36 in the current draft of the constitution, declaring that: "The article thus drafted does not reinforce the principle of full citizenship and gender equality without discrimination, in addition to being inconsistent with the text in other articles of the Constitution, and can be considered as conflicting with the ruling of the principles and provisions of Islamic sharia'. The article in its present form does not contain any obligation on the state to fight discrimination and considered it a crime punishable by law. Furthermore, it does not conform with Egypt's commitments to the international conventions and treaties, and may have repercussions on the political, economic and social levels in the short and long terms." A major measure of improvement of the NCW in order to ensure women's rights would be to fund, strengthen and constitute the Ombudsman Office with power over gender discrimination complaints. In place since 2002, the Ombudsman Office of the National Council of Women can receive complaints but has no legal power to investigate, recommend corrective measures, and issue or pursue those recommendations to the appropriate government body. These are powers that would strengthen its role and effectiveness to handle and address complaints. Instead, it is still a project funded by EU without any plans on how it is to become an important part of the Egyptian bureaucracy with clear mandate, terms of reference and legal authority. From January to August 2012, the office received 2,899 complaints: Personal Status complaints represented the largest number of complaints received by the Office (46.4%), followed by family guidance at a rate of 13.46%, divorce proceedings at 12.52%, then alimonies for the spouse and children at 12.44% and claims for child support by 10.64%.

Recommendation n°154: *Strengthen efforts aimed at ensuring equal rights for women in the field of work* (Recommended by United Arab Emirates)

IRI: not implemented

EACPE response:

There has been no progress by the government for an integrated national strategy to insure equal rights for women in the field of work.

Recommendation n°155: *Strengthen its policy on the rights of the child, with attention to the Guidelines for the Alternative Care of Children* (Recommended by Brazil)

IRI: not implemented

+

Recommendation n°158: *Strengthen the legal framework to fight all crimes against children* (Recommended by Syria)

IRI: not implemented

EACPE response:

Rather than preserving the law that rose the minimum age for marriage to 18, Egypt's parliament discussed lowering the minimum age as far as 9, before the parliament was dissolved as unconstitutional. Rather than seeking to strengthen the law against female circumcision, a female member of parliament proposed removing the ban on female circumcision in April 2012. The current President appeared to suggest during a Q&A session while still a candidate that he was in favor of leaving the choice on

having the procedure for the family to make. Their party, the FJP, stated it remains opposed to the ban and that more awareness efforts are needed to ensure the ban is enacted.

While a law against trafficking was approved in Egypt after the 2010 UPR session, the 2012 Constitutional Assembly drafting Egypt's new constitution has rejected a constitutional article that would have specifically outlawed the trafficking of women and girls. In the draft constitution there are clear flaws regarding the protection of children from the dangers of child labor. The proposed rule to ban child labor in the workplace does not set any minimum age for work, such as the age to complete compulsory education (15), and it provides no protection after compulsory education for children in the worst forms of child labor, which may destroy their lives or their health or descendants or education. The draft constitution proposed in Article 35 only prohibits "the employment of a child not having exceeded the age of compulsory education in a job not relevant for the age thereof." The proposed text drafted by civil society had stated: "prohibits the employment of children before completing compulsory education, also prohibits employment before the age of eighteen years in businesses of the worst forms of child labor."

Recommendation n°165: *That the legislation related to violence against women, which would be promulgated based on the voluntary pledges made by Egypt, include provisions aimed at eliminating de jure and de facto discrimination against women* (Recommended by Mexico)

IRI: not implemented

EACPE response:

Although long term efforts by civil society aiming to protect women from violence in the private and public spheres, no positive actions were taken by government, parliament or supreme council of military. The rate of VAW [*editor's note: Violence Against Women*] has increased; we have seen women beaten in the streets because of not being veiled. Sexual harassment also became so intensive in the streets, transportation and workplaces.

Other

Recommendation n°4: *Accomplish the Human Rights Goals* (Recommended by Brazil)

IRI: not implemented

TP response:

US State Department International Religious Freedom Report for 2011: The constitution and the Constitutional Declaration of 2011 provide for freedom of belief and the practice of religious rites, but the government places restrictions on these rights in policy and practice, such as forbidding Muslims from converting to another religion. Islam is the official state religion, and Sharia (Islamic law) is the primary source of legislation. Despite the ouster of former president Hosni Mubarak, the government's respect for religious freedom remained poor.

Recommendation n°9: *Align the national legislation with international law*
(Recommended by Switzerland)

IRI: ~~not~~partially/fully implemented

CS-JC response:

The Egyptian government does not align national legislation with international law. Egypt's current constitutional declaration of March 2011 (copying the amendments made in 1980 on the 1971 constitution) states in Article 2: "Islam is the religion of the state, and the Arabic language is its official language. The principles of Islamic law are the main source of legislation." The presence of Islamic law in the second article has a hierarchical power over the rest of the articles in the constitution, as well as, a hierarchy to legislators.

Article 151 stipulates: "The President of Republic shall conclude treaties and communicate them to the People's Assembly, accompanied with a suitable clarification. They shall have the force of law upon being concluded, ratified and published according to established procedure. However, peace treaties, alliance pacts, commercial and maritime and all treaties resulting on modifications in the State territory, related to sovereignty rights, or change State Treasury with certain charges nor provided for in the budget, shall require approval by the People's Assembly."

NGOs such as Al-Kalima, expressed concern stating: "by attaching a qualification to the adoption of International Laws and Treaties which states "taking into consideration the provisions of the Islamic Sharia and the fact that they do not conflict with the text annexed to the instrument, we accept, support and ratify it." This has rendered the adoption of the international law useless. A similar qualification was also made to the adoption of international law in Egypt on ratification of the "International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights" which was signed by Egypt in 1982."

It's important to highlight the ongoing discussions in the current constituent assembly where alarming changes are being strongly advocated by the dominant Islamists (some 75%):

- Declare Allah, not the people, as sovereign,
- Limit the right of worship to the three "heavenly" religions, and restrict it to be within the public order and as defined by (unspecified) law.
- Impose Islamic Sharia (rather than the principles) as the source of legislation
- Impose the Islamic institute Al-Azhar as the authority (rather than the supreme constitutional court) to define what is meant by sharia principles,
- Impose sanctity on the Divine Being (from an Islamic point of view), the Prophet, his wives, companions and early caliphs.

HCER response:

We are in a transition phase from an old regime to a new one. The local legislations are still far away from human rights international conventions and charters, among which environmental rights charters such as right to safe food, right to access suitable house, right to enjoy clean environment and right to health that, in turn, includes right to access safe drinking water with appropriate cost.

Recommendation n°63: *Continue to intensify its efforts to ensure that violence, in particular hate-motivated crime, does not occur* (Recommended by Finland)

IRI: *not implemented*

CS-JC response:

The Egyptian government failed to limit and often directly and indirectly engage in promoting hate motivated crime against women and non-Muslims. In July of 2011, the Egyptian Islamist Abou Ishak Al-Huainy issued a Fatwa on Egyptian Television, inciting the murder of the Christian businessman Naguib Sawiris for posting a cartoon on Twitter of Mickey mouse wearing Islamic clothes. While Al-Huainy was never prosecuted for issuing a death sentence on Sawiris, Sawiris was tried for posting the cartoon. While the court threw out the case on February 2012, saying the plaintiffs had no legal standing, the Egyptian government once again punished the victim of incitement and not the perpetrator.

Recommendation n°83: *Establish an effective and inclusive process to follow-up on the universal periodic review recommendations* (Recommended by Norway)

IRI: *not implemented*

CIHRS response:

No steps were taken in that measure.

Recommendation n°93: *Further promote identity and culture of different communities and to raise awareness in the society about their historic presence in Egypt and contribution to the society* (Recommended by Armenia)

IRI: *not implemented*

CS-JC response:

The Egyptian government failed to recognize the traditional presence of ethnic and religious minorities. Although Egyptian law does not officially ban the teaching of the Coptic language, it is almost impossible to print or publish Coptic publications, as printing or publishing material aimed to teach the Coptic language can compromise a person's business and puts them under direct threat and intimidation by State Security Services.

Recommendation n°96: *Host in Cairo the new OHCHR regional office in North Africa, as so pledged in its candidature for membership to the Human Rights Council* (Recommended by Israel)

IRI: *not implemented*

CIHRS response:

Until this moment, the authorities in Cairo refused to host a new OHCHR regional office.

Methodology

A. First contact

Although the methodology has to consider the specificities of each country, we applied the same procedure for data collection about all States:

1. We contacted the Permanent Mission to the UN either in Geneva (when it does exist) or New York;
2. We contacted all NGOs which took part in the process. Whenever NGOs were part of coalitions, each NGO was individually contacted;
3. The National Institution for Human Rights was contacted whenever one existed.
4. UN Agencies which sent information for the UPR were contacted.

We posted our requests to the States and NHRI, and sent emails to NGOs and UN Agencies.

The purpose of the UPR is to discuss issues and share concrete suggestions to improve human rights on the ground. Therefore, stakeholders whose objective is not to improve the human rights situation were not contacted, and those stakeholders' submissions were not taken into account.

However, since the UPR is meant to be a process which aims at sharing best practices among States and stakeholders, we take into account positive feedbacks from the latter.

B. Processing the recommendations

The persons we contact are encouraged to use an Excel sheet we provide which includes all recommendations received by the State reviewed.

Each submission is processed, whether the stakeholder has or has not used the Excel sheet. In the latter case, the submission is split up among recommendations we think it belongs to. Since such a task is more prone to misinterpretation, we strongly encourage stakeholders to use the Excel sheet.

If the stakeholder does not clearly mention neither that the recommendation was “fully implemented” nor that it was “not implemented”, UPR Info usually considers the recommendation as “partially implemented”, unless the implementation level is obvious.

UPR Info retains the right to edit comments that are considered not to directly address the recommendation in question, when comments are too lengthy or when comments are defamatory or inappropriate. While we do not mention the recommendations which were not addressed, they can be accessed unedited on the follow-up webpage.

C. Implementation Recommendation Index (IRI)

UPR Info developed an index showing the implementation level achieved by the State for the recommendations received at the UPR.

The **Implementation Recommendation Index (IRI)** is an individual recommendation index. Its purpose is to show an average of stakeholders' responses.

The *IRI* is meant to take into account stakeholders disputing the implementation of a recommendation. Whenever a stakeholder claims nothing has been implemented at all, the index score is 0. At the opposite, whenever a stakeholder claims a recommendation has been fully implemented, the *IRI* score is 1.

An average is calculated to fully reflect the many sources of information. If the State under Review claims that the recommendation has been fully implemented, and a stakeholder says it has been partially implemented, the score is 0.75.

Then the score is transformed into an implementation level, according to the table below:

| Percentage: | Implementation level: |
|-------------|-----------------------|
| 0 – 0.32 | Not implemented |
| 0.33 – 0.65 | Partially implemented |
| 0.66 – 1 | Fully implemented |

Example: On one side, a stakeholder comments on a recommendation requesting the establishment of a National Human Rights Institute (NHRI). On the other side, the State under review claims having partially set up the NHRI. As a result of this, the recommendation will be given an *IRI* score of 0.25, and thus the recommendation is considered as “not implemented”.

Disclaimer

The comments made by the authors (stakeholders) are theirs alone, and do not necessarily reflect the views, and opinions at UPR Info. Every attempt has been made to ensure that information provided on this page is accurate and not abusive. UPR Info cannot be held responsible for information provided in this document.

Uncommented recommendations

Hereby the recommendations which the MIA does not address:

| rec. n° | Recommendation | SMR | Response | A | Issue |
|---------|--|-------------|----------|---|--|
| 3 | Accelerate programs aimed at job creation, particularly for young people | Cuba | Accepted | 4 | Development |
| 11 | Allow international election observation in all upcoming elections | Canada | Rejected | 5 | Elections |
| 18 | Better disseminate the Declaration on Human Rights Defenders and ensure its full observance | Norway | Accepted | 4 | International instruments, Human rights defenders, |
| 19 | Conduct a wide-ranging review of Egyptian human rights laws in order to bring them into line with Egypt's international commitments, as so pledged in its Human Rights Council candidature and within its National Report | Israel | Rejected | 3 | General |
| 31 | Continue and strengthen strategies and programs for comprehensive development, especially in the rural and less developed areas of the country | Cuba | Accepted | 4 | Development |
| 32 | Continue effective policies aimed at ensuring rights of persons with disabilities through instruments that are in line with respective international conventions as well as by developing and implementing national programs | Kyrgyzstan | Accepted | 5 | Disabilities |
| 33 | Continue efforts in eradicating illiteracy and adult education and share its pioneering experience in this field | Qatar | Accepted | 2 | Right to education |
| 34 | Continue efforts on human rights education in order to guarantee enjoyment of all people of their rights | Morocco | Accepted | 2 | Human rights education and training |
| 37 | Continue finding the appropriate solutions for the challenges mentioned in the national report and faced by the citizens in their full enjoyment of fundamental rights whether it is political, economic, social and cultural rights | Kuwait | Accepted | 2 | General |
| 42 | Continue its efforts aimed at combating trafficking in persons at the policy and legislative levels in cooperation with civil society and the media, with a view to providing victims of trafficking with the needed protection and counselling, contributing to international efforts in this regards | Philippines | Accepted | 2 | Trafficking, Civil society, |
| 43 | Continue its efforts aimed at eradication of illiteracy in rural areas | Kuwait | Accepted | 2 | Right to education |

| | | | | | |
|----|--|----------------|----------|---|--|
| 45 | Continue its efforts in the context of the Human Rights Council to develop its work on human rights in connection with civilians in armed conflict | Palestine | Accepted | 2 | International humanitarian law |
| 48 | Continue its efforts to provide training and capacity building in the area of human rights for police officers and members of the judiciary and prosecution as well as journalists | Palestine | Accepted | 2 | Human rights education and training |
| 54 | Continue its process of home-grown reforms to deepen democratic reform and strengthen foundations of modern states in which all citizens enjoy all human rights | China | Accepted | 2 | Other |
| 55 | Continue promoting its successful cultural policies that have far-reaching social content, stimulate participation by the popular sectors of the population and extend culture to all as a mechanism to combat exclusion and poverty | Venezuela | Accepted | 2 | Poverty, ESC rights - general, |
| 56 | Continue promoting the work of the Higher Committee for Migration in order to promote the rights of migrants and to implement the possibility for Egyptian migrants abroad to cast their vote | Bolivia | Accepted | 2 | Migrants, Elections, |
| 57 | Continue pursuing social policies in keeping with family values and not be intimidated by suggestions on social norms that are controversial, non-universal and specific to certain societies | Bangladesh | Accepted | 2 | Other |
| 58 | Continue the efforts and successes achieved by the national institutions in undertaking awareness raising campaigns to spread a culture of human rights | Saudi Arabia | Accepted | 2 | Human rights education and training |
| 65 | Continue to strengthen policies that have led to a decrease of the illiteracy rates | Angola | Accepted | 2 | Right to education |
| 66 | Continue to work with the Non-Aligned Movement and the United Nations system in strengthening human rights in the world | Laos | Accepted | 2 | Other |
| 67 | Continue, with the support of donor countries, its National Capacity Building Program with the objective of expanding the scope of the training and capacity building activities to government personnel | Bhutan | Accepted | 2 | Human rights education and training |
| 68 | Develop specific awareness raising campaigns to promote tolerance and eliminate discrimination based on sex and gender | Czech Republic | Rejected | 5 | Women's rights, Human rights education and training, |
| 69 | Effectively address poverty and unemployment, in cooperation with international community | Lebanon | Accepted | 4 | Technical assistance, Poverty, Development, |
| 78 | Enhance human rights education and training programs for the general public and government officials | Philippines | Accepted | 4 | Human rights education and training |

| | | | | | |
|-----|---|---------------|----------|---|---|
| 81 | Ensure the protection of women, in practice, from all forms of violence by implementing national legislation, as pledged in its National Report to universal periodic report, and to adopt a unified family code to ensure the equal status of women under law | Israel | Rejected | 5 | Women's rights |
| 94 | Give attention and provide adequate follow-up to the recommendations made by the Special Rapporteur on the promotion and protection of human rights while countering terrorism following his visit to the country, in coordination with the involved ministries and civil society organizations | Mexico | Accepted | 4 | Counter-terrorism, Special procedures, Civil society, |
| 98 | Implement a program to adequately integrate the refugee populations into the society of Egypt, taking into account the generosity that has historically characterized the country in this field | Mexico | Accepted | 5 | Asylum-seekers - refugees |
| 103 | In the spirit of a constructive dialogue and with the cooperation of the international community, continue efforts to enhance the quality of its educational and health system with a special focus on combating illiteracy | Philippines | Accepted | 2 | Right to health, Right to education, |
| 104 | Include the study of human rights in the curriculum of the various stages of free education provided in state institutions | Bolivia | Accepted | 5 | Human rights education and training |
| 108 | Increase public awareness on human rights and promote human rights education and training | Greece | Accepted | 4 | Human rights education and training |
| 110 | Intensify its efforts to wealth distribution and poverty eradication, especially assistance to the marginalized and disadvantaged groups | Malaysia | Accepted | 4 | Poverty |
| 111 | Intensify its programs to extend social and economic rights to all and improve standard of living for those with limited income | Algeria | Accepted | 4 | ESC rights - general |
| 119 | Keep up the positive momentum in upgrading its laws and institutions while ensuring their effective implementation, in particular in the areas of education of all and the rights of women | Indonesia | Accepted | 4 | Women's rights, Right to education, |
| 121 | Make additional efforts in eradicating illiteracy | Lebanon | Accepted | 4 | Right to education |
| 124 | Pass comprehensive anti-trafficking in persons legislation | United States | Accepted | 5 | Trafficking |
| 126 | Persons, who are administratively detained without being formally charged, be the object of an equitable trial or be immediately released | Switzerland | Accepted | 4 | Detention conditions |

| | | | | | |
|-----|--|----------------|----------|---|---|
| 128 | Provide human rights education and training to members of the police, security services, prison and detention staff and judiciary with specific focus on protection of human rights of women, children, national and other minorities, refugees and persons with disabilities and to ensure accountability of security and other state personnel for possible violations of human rights | Czech Republic | Accepted | 4 | Human rights education and training |
| 144 | Respect minimum standards relating to the death penalty as long as it the latter is effectively applied | Belgium | Accepted | 5 | Death penalty |
| 147 | Review national legal provisions, as e.g. those criminalising habitual debauchery, which are open to abuse for persecution and intimidation of persons of minority sexual orientation or gender identity or of persons with HIV-AIDS | Czech Republic | Rejected | 3 | Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity, HIV - Aids, |
| 150 | Share experience and good practices with other countries in areas of development and protection of human rights | Laos | Accepted | 1 | General |
| 151 | Share with other countries its experience in the education of persons with disabilities and in providing them with employment | Qatar | Accepted | 1 | Disabilities |
| 153 | Strengthen education in the field of human rights | Jordan | Accepted | 4 | Human rights education and training |
| 156 | Strengthen programs of capacity building in human rights field and raise human rights awareness level | Kuwait | Accepted | 4 | Human rights education and training |
| 157 | Strengthen public education, awareness and capacity building programmes on human rights | Malaysia | Accepted | 4 | Human rights education and training |
| 170 | Uphold its international obligations relating to refugees | United States | Accepted | 4 | Asylum-seekers - refugees |

A= Action Category (see on [our website](#))

SMR = State making recommendation

Contact

UPR Info

Avenue du Mail 14
CH - 1205 Geneva
Switzerland

Website:

<http://www.upr-info.org>



Phone:

+ 41 (0) 22 321 77 70

Fax:

+ 41 (0) 22 321 77 71

General enquiries

info@upr-info.org

Follow-up programme

followup@upr-info.org

Newsletter “UPR Trax”

uprtrax@upr-info.org