

# **General Assembly**

Distr. LIMITED

A/HRC/WG.6/6/L.10 8 December 2009

Original: ENGLISH

HUMAN RIGHTS COUNCIL Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review Sixth session Geneva, 30 November -11 December 2009

Advance unedited version

## DRAFT REPORT OF THE WORKING GROUP ON THE UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW<sup>\*</sup>

Bhutan

<sup>\*</sup> The final document will be issued under symbol number A/HRC/13/11. The annex to the present report is circulated as received.

# CONTENTS

	Paragraphs	Page
Introduction	1 - 4	3
I. SUMMARY OF THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE REVIEW PROCESS	5 - 82	3
A. Presentation by the State under review	5 - 23	3
B. Interactive dialogue and responses by the State under review	24 - 100	5
II. CONCLUSIONS AND/OR RECOMMENDATIONS	101 - 102	15
Annex		
Composition of the delegation		25

## Introduction

1. The Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review (UPR), established in accordance with Human Rights Council resolution 5/1 of 18 June 2007, held its sixth session from 30 November to 11 December 2009. The review of Bhutan was held at the 10th meeting on 4 December 2009. The delegation of Bhutan was headed by H.E. Mr. Lyonpo Kinzang Dorji, Former Prime Minister and Special Envoy of the Prime Minister. At its meeting held on 8 December 2009, the Working Group adopted the present report on Bhutan.

2. On 7 September 2009, the Human Rights Council selected the following group of rapporteurs (troika) to facilitate the review of Bhutan: India, Madagascar, and Uruguay.

3. In accordance with paragraph 15 of the annex to resolution 5/1, the following documents were issued for the review of Bhutan:

(a) A national report submitted / written presentation made in accordance with paragraph 15 (a) (A/HRC/WG.6/6/BTN/1);

(b) A compilation prepared by the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR), in accordance with paragraph 15 (b) (A/HRC/WG.6/6/BTN/2);

(c) A summary prepared by OHCHR, in accordance with paragraph 15 (c) (A/HRC/WG.6/6/BTN/3).

4. A list of questions prepared in advance by Argentina, Czech Republic, Denmark, Germany, Latvia, Nepal, The Netherlands, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland was transmitted to Bhutan through the troika. These questions are available on the extranet of the UPR.

## I. SUMMARY OF THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE REVIEW PROCESS

#### A. Presentation by the State under review

5. H.E. Mr. Lyonpo Kinzang Dorji, Former Prime Minister and Special Envoy of the Prime Minister, presented co-leader of the delegation, H.E. Lyonpo Thakur S. Powdyel, Hon'ble Minister, Ministry of Education, Royal Government of Bhutan, Thimphu and other members of the delegation.

6. The Bhutanese delegation explained that national level preparations were multi-sectoral and broad-based. The National Report was broadly available in Dzongkha, English and Nepali.

7. The delegation stated that Bhutan's governance since the 17<sup>th</sup> Century is based on the precepts of justice, equity and compassion, refined and updated by successive monarchs of the Wangchuck dynasty. In culmination of a series of far reaching political changes initiated by the Fourth King, Bhutan peacefully transitioned into a Parliamentary Democracy and adopted its first written Constitution in 2008.

8. The delegation informed that the Constitution is the overarching legal framework for the country, based on the principle that every individual possesses fundamental rights and freedom to secure equality and effective protection of their rights and dignity irrespective of ethnic origin, religion, gender or other status. It guarantees and protects human rights including the right to life,

liberty and security of person, right to freedom of speech, expression and opinion, and freedom of thought, conscience and religion.

9. Bhutan's efforts to strengthen human rights have been complemented through constructive engagement with bodies like CRC, CEDAW and regional conventions. This has contributed to the development of legislative instruments and in undertaking human rights activities.

10. The delegation emphasized that Bhutan is fully committed to ensuring equal rights for women and men to enjoy all economic, social, cultural, civil and political rights, and also eliminating discrimination against women in all its forms. Bhutanese women are secured by societal traditions, for instance, matri-lineal practices are pervasive, they inherit property and are able to make significant decisions on property and family matters.

11. Bhutan is a multi ethnic, multi religious country. Consistent with the philosophy of Gross National Happiness (GNH), the principle of non discrimination irrespective of gender, ethnic origin, religion, language, political opinion, economic status or other grounds, has always been central to all government policies and actions, which are designed to foster an inclusive and harmonious society.

12. Concerning the rights enjoyed by Bhutanese of ethnic Nepalese origin (Lhotshampas), the delegation informed that those people, who had first entered southern Bhutan in the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, as economic migrants, were granted Bhutanese citizenship as a one-time measure in 1958. Lhotshmapas, now comprising over 20 percent of the population, are fully represented in the civil service, the security forces, the Parliament and in the business sector. Two of the 10 cabinet ministers, the Deputy Speaker of the National Assembly and 20 percent of its members are Lhotshampas.

13. Despite Bhutan's diverse society, no sectarian or religious violence has occurred and no societal tension or discord exists. The Constitution guarantees religious freedom while the government promotes peaceful coexistence between different religious groups.

14. The delegation emphasized that Bhutan believes that all human rights are indivisible, interrelated, interdependent and mutually reinforcing, and that equal importance must be accorded to civil and political rights, and economic, social and cultural rights including the right to development.

15. The delegation highlighted that Bhutan's development is guided by the philosophy of GNH, which recognizes that quality of life is more than just material comfort; that psychological and emotional well being and cultural growth enhances a person's ability to contribute to enriching all humanity. Bhutan is refining the tools and indicators of GNH so that this holistic development paradigm may become an alternative development model.

16. The delegation pointed out that poverty remains one of the greatest impediments to the full enjoyment of human rights in Bhutan.

17. The delegation explained that with a population of 658,888, the most serious challenge that Bhutan faced is demographic inundation. Bhutan's relative socio-economic development success made it an attractive destination for people in search of better livelihoods. Given Bhutan's tiny population and fragile culture, such a problem posed a threat to its survival as a nation state. The nationality and citizenship laws are the only safeguards against such threats.

18. In response to questions on the issue of citizenship, the delegation stated that the Constitution and the Citizenship Acts confers citizenship through *jus sanguinis* and naturalization. In recent years, 588 individuals of Nepalese origin, 930 Tibetans and 222 individuals of other nationalities were granted Bhutanese citizenship through naturalization. With UNICEF assistance, Bhutan is in the process of developing an effective institutional mechanism for birth registration. According to Bhutan's citizenship laws, Bhutanese women who are married to non-Bhutanese do not lose their citizenship.

19. The delegation emphasized that the issue of the people in the refugee camps in eastern Nepal is a complex humanitarian problem compounded by the mass movement of people across porous borders. The delegation reiterated the government's commitment to finding a lasting solution through the bilateral process. This notwithstanding, Bhutan continues to face the threat of terrorism, posed by violent extremist groups from the refugee camps. Bhutan does not have the means to deal with such groups whose expressed objectives are to destabilize the country.

20. The delegation highlighted Bhutan's serious concerns over the effects of climate change. Despite its efforts, climate change and its impacts such as Glacial Lake Outburst Floods, erratic weather patterns, and rising cases of vector borne diseases endanger the most basic human rights of its people.

21. While recognizing and appreciating the important role of NGOs in advancing the cause of human rights, the delegation expressed concern over the Stakeholders compilation submitted by the six NGOs. Numerous UN resolutions and the IB package recognize that information they submit must be from "credible and reliable" sources. However, the delegation regretted that they were special interest NGOs based outside and unfamiliar with the situation in Bhutan. They have relied on second and third hand accounts, now outdated, and originating from individuals with politicized and personal agenda.

22. Despite challenges, the delegation expressed Bhutan's determination to continue pursuing the full range of human rights and fundamental freedoms, in accordance with human rights treaty obligations.

23. Bhutan recognized that as a parliamentary democracy, substantial financial and human resources are required to strengthen democratic institutions, and educate Bhutanese on their rights and duties. It sought the constructive support and cooperation of the international community to further protect and promote human rights in Bhutan.

## B. Interactive dialogue and responses by the State under review

24. During the interactive dialogue, 53 delegations made statements. Eight delegations were not able to make their statements.<sup>2</sup> A number of States expressed appreciation for the delegation's comprehensive presentation and well prepared national report. They commended Bhutan's peaceful transition to a parliamentary democracy and the results of reforms, including the adoption of a written constitution in 2008, which strengthens human rights protection. A number of states congratulated Bhutan on the success of its unique approach to development that has been pursued over the past four

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> United Arab Emirates, Afghanistan, Maldives, Jordan, Nigeria, Colombia, Syrian Arab Republic and Djibouti

decades, influenced by the philosophy of Gross National Happiness (GNH). The text of the recommendations made during the dialogue appear in Chapter II of this report.

25. The Lao People's Democratic Republic, as a fellow least developed country and a landlocked developing country, welcomed the significant progress in the promotion of the rights of Bhutan's population to political, social and economic development and human rights. It made recommendations.

26. Myanmar congratulated Bhutan for her peaceful political transition. It appreciated measures taken on the efforts to guarantee the independence of judicial systems and asked Bhutan to share insight on steps taken in that regard and sought further information on the role of the National Judicial Commission. It asked to what extent the National Commission for Women and Children has been playing for improving the promotion and protection of human rights.

27. Sri Lanka sought further information on key features of the Constitution that specifically provide guarantees for human rights and on the safeguards provided in the Constitution and the national legal framework to protect victims against violations of human rights. Sri Lanka congratulated Bhutan on its achievements and best practices in the areas of health, education and poverty alleviation. Sri Lanka made recommendations.

28. Egypt commended the devotion of an entire chapter on women in development in Bhutan's 10<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan which requires effectively mainstreaming gender issues into Bhutan's policies and programmes and to maintain gender disaggregated data. Egypt welcomed the establishment of effective response to children and women's rights violations, especially dealing with domestic violence and abuses cases. Egypt made recommendations.

29. Belarus appreciated the energetic steps taken by Bhutan to improve the legal and court system. Belarus expressed approval of the efforts taken in eradicating illiteracy, preventing the spread of HIV and combating malnutrition. Belarus considered that more attention needed to be paid to dealing with such problems as domestic violence and the sexual exploitation of children for commercial purposes. Belarus made recommendations.

30. Singapore noted that Bhutan is guided by a development philosophy that differs from income bases measurements and is committed to a development path that is clean and green and that countries could draw on such successful approaches. Singapore welcomed the establishment of the first Women and Child Protection Unit to provide effective, prompt and sensitive response to situations of violations of women and children's rights. Singapore made recommendations.

31. China noted that, since 1961, Bhutan has used 30 per cent of its revenue on social sectors, and under the tenth five-year development plan, 45 per cent of the budget was allocated to education, health and employment. It expressed support for Bhutan's priority on poverty reduction to improve human rights protection. China made a recommendation.

32. Cambodia appreciated Bhutan's efforts to conduct a reform policy of many areas in line with a guiding principle of its development, known as the Gross National Happiness. Cambodia compliment the efforts made on poverty reduction and its progress towards achieving the Millennium Development Goals. Cambodia commended the steps taken to ratify the two CRC Optional Protocols in July 2009. Cambodia made recommendations.

33. Nepal asked about efforts to address alleged violations of the rights of the minorities and Bhutan's plans to implement the recommendations of CRC, particularly the reunion of women and children in refugee camps with their families and relatives in Bhutan. Nepal stated that hundreds of already verified refugees by Nepal-Bhutan Joint Verification team in 2003 continue to languish in refugee camps, despite Bhutan's commitments to take them back home. It asked if Bhutan has any time frame to return to bilateral dialogue to work for lasting and durable solutions of this humanitarian problem.

34. Brazil recently hosted the Fifth Gross National Happiness Conference. Welcoming the drafting of a domestic violence bill, it asked if there was an institution for investigating complaints, providing assistance and ensuring access to justice for victims. It commended Bhutan for promoting children's rights. Brazil supported negotiations between Bhutan and Nepal towards durable solutions for refugees. Brazil made recommendations.

35. Canada noted positive legislative changes paving the way for greater freedom of expression, a more independent judiciary, less corruption and better labour conditions. Canada remained concerned about the longstanding plight of Bhutanese refugees in Nepal, the restrictive conditions for acquiring Bhutanese citizenship, violence against girls and women, including sexual abuses against young girls in villages. Canada made recommendations.

36. Philippines highly commended the strong basis established by Bhutan for the promotion of democratic values. Recognizing the challenges Bhutan faces, Philippines highlighted the significant gains in health, poverty alleviation and education. It sought information on the operationalization of Gross National Happiness in the planning process and the tools used to monitor its implementation. Philippines inquired about plans to enhance Bhutan's progress in improving gender equality. It made recommendations.

37. Cuba noted that Bhutan is a small developing country, victim of an unfair international economic order and that, nonetheless, Bhutan is making positive efforts in advancing the promotion and protection of human rights. Cuba congratulated Bhutan on its primary health care approach and asked for more information about the village health care workers initiative. It also noted that Bhutan guarantees free education to children. Cuba welcomed the priority given to combating poverty. Cuba made a recommendation.

38. Bangladesh noted the challenges Bhutan faces and recent impressive progress, which would have far-reaching human rights implications. It acknowledged progress in poverty reduction, education, healthcare and employment, as well as progress towards realizing MDGs and SAARC Development Goals. It urged Bhutan to continue its good work, calling on it to do more to eradicate poverty. Bangladesh made recommendations.

39. Austria encouraged Bhutan to proceed on the path of legal and political reform. Austria noted that many women suffer from poor education, are strongly dependent on their husbands and families and may face labour exploitation and domestic violence. Austria asked about measures to effectively improve their situation and about the strengthening of efforts regarding children in need of alternative care, typically provided by monasteries or the extended family. Austria made recommendations.

40. Germany referred to worrying reports about domestic violence, noting that while CEDAW welcomed the planned tabling of a domestic violence bill by 2010, it urged Bhutan to prioritize the

elimination of all forms of violence against women and increase access to justice for women victims. Germany asked about Bhutan's efforts in this regard, and made a number of recommendations.

41. Qatar noted Bhutan's efforts to achieve its MDGs, describing the concept of the Gross National Happiness in Bhutan's development efforts. It applauded the provision of free primary education, calling for it to be made mandatory. It noted also the development of a national plan to ensure integration of children with special needs into the system. Qatar encouraged ratification of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD) and called for further technical cooperation with human rights bodies and mechanisms for capacity building in relation to human rights.

42. Malaysia considered Bhutan's efforts to strengthen democratic norms, cultures and values amongst its people to be entirely appropriate. It was pleased to note that despite the many constraints and challenges, Bhutan is well on track to achieve most of the Millennium Development Goals, in particular in the areas of poverty eradication, basic public health and education. Malaysia made a number of recommendations.

43. The Netherlands expressed concern that the Civil Society Act of 2007 may result in restrictions on civil society. Appreciating Bhutan's efforts to advance the position of women and combat domestic violence, it hoped for the establishment of Women and Child Protection Unit in major towns before the self-imposed 2013 deadline. The Netherlands also raised concern about the situation of refugees from Bhutan in camps in Eastern Nepal and encouraged Bhutan to resume bilateral negotiations with Nepal. It made recommendations.

44. Serbia noted efforts that Bhutan has taken towards specific measures to fulfil its international obligations relating to children and women's rights, citing the drafting of legislation on adoption, child care protection and domestic violence. Serbia sought information on measures to combat stereotyping of gender roles in domestic media. Serbia made recommendations.

45. Algeria commended Bhutan's efforts to attain Millennium Development Goal 1, and was encouraged by results achieved thus far in resolving problems with food supply in vulnerable regions and rural areas. It welcomed Bhutan's substantial cuts in infant mortality rates and the achievements made in a number of sectors, particularly on primary health care. Algeria made recommendations.

46. India welcomed measures taken by Bhutan, including the process of establishment of a Supreme Court. It noted that Bhutan has become an observer to the International Labour Organisation. Mindful that Bhutan's priority is to enhance its institutional capacities and consolidate its democracy against the challenges of poverty, unemployment, illegal immigration and terrorism, India pledged its continuing support. India sought more details about the scope and powers of the Parliamentary Committee on Human Rights.

47. Thailand commended Bhutan's good work in public health and that campaigns to prevent discrimination against persons with HIV/AIDS are regularly carried out. Thailand welcomed the importance Bhutan places on the promotion and protection of women and children's rights and hoped that the Domestic Violence bill would be adopted in due course. Thailand recognized that various challenges remained to be tackled by Bhutan as a new democracy. Thailand made recommendations.

48. Indonesia noted that, consistent with Bhutan's commitment to establishing an inclusive and participatory system of governance, Bhutan has pledged to ensure 30 percent of candidates at the next elections will be women. It also noted that Bhutan is a country in transition and commended the Constitutional guarantee of free education up to class ten. Indonesia made recommendations.

49. Turkey welcomed the ratification of the optional protocols to the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC), establishment of the Parliamentary Committee on Human Rights and adoption of the Royal Bhutan Police and Prison Acts. It cited the increasing number of newspapers, radio and TV stations as developments in media freedom. It welcomed efforts on education, climate change and the elimination of poverty. Turkey made recommendations.

50. Islamic Republic of Iran appreciated Bhutan's efforts and commitments to further promotion and protection of human rights and to address existing challenges, citing international recognition for Bhutan's strong commitment to environmental conservation and protection. It also referred to such issues as women and children's rights and the high rate of poverty and unemployment. It made recommendations.

51. Viet Nam commended Bhutan's cooperation with UN human rights mechanisms. It appreciated Bhutan's efforts to realize the objectives of the Millennium Development Goals, especially for poverty reduction, free education and health care. Viet Nam shared the difficulties and challenges that Bhutan is facing as it seeks to promote the enjoyment of human rights. With that in mind, Vietnam made recommendations.

52. Brunei Darussalam expressed support for Bhutan's endeavours to learn from the United Nations human rights mechanisms through projects and training. It was encouraged by Bhutan's work at the regional level with other SAARC members on the welfare of women and children, and welcomed its pledge to draw international best practices into its domestic policies and legislation. It encouraged Bhutan to continue with its efforts to guarantee the human rights and freedoms as enshrined in its Constitution.

53. Denmark acknowledged Bhutanese progress in promoting human rights. It sought more information concerning freedom of religion or belief for all individuals of different faiths, adherence to a number of international basic human rights instruments and to finding a prompt solution to the question of Bhutanese refugees in Nepal. Denmark made recommendations.

54. Kyrgyzstan noted that Bhutan sought to bring about the enjoyment of human rights through many diverse national projects and programmes. Kyrgyzstan also noted that the Bhutan has taken an important step in seeking to promote human rights by cooperating with NGOs and international organizations. Kyrgyzstan welcomed Bhutan's efforts particularly in seeking to combat the use of child labour and to provide education to people in the country about human rights. Kyrgyzstan made a recommendation.

55. In response, the delegation indicated on MDGs and poverty reduction, that it has been fully integrated into Bhutan's national development plans. Poverty reduction has been articulated as the main objective of the Tenth Plan.

56. Regarding the right to food, Bhutan has developed a national Food Security Strategy Paper, the objective of which is to sustainably increase food security.

57. Concerning gender, Bhutan is committed to mainstreaming gender as reflected in the  $10^{\text{th}}$  Five Year Plan. Gender focal persons have been identified in all government agencies and it is investing efforts to develop a gender info-base.

58. With respect to Bhutan's political transition, the historic elections and transition to democracy were the culmination of the process initiated by the fourth King in the early 1970s. In the first elections, 79.4 percent of the Bhutanese electorate exercised their adult franchise with 52 percent women voters. The present government is committed to ensuring at least 30 percent women candidates in the next elections.

59. On international instruments, Bhutan is serious about its international treaty obligations and is building the necessary legal, political and social institutions, and developing its human resources. A multi-sectoral task force will study international human rights instruments and make recommendations to the government for ratification. Despite not ratifying the core human rights instruments, Bhutan remains committed to their principles, which are enshrined in the Constitution and other laws.

60. Mexico recognized the recent efforts made by Bhutan in promoting and respecting human rights. It noted the important progress made in health and poverty reduction and the Government's recognition of challenges in youth unemployment, domestic violence, gender equality, better access to free education and drinking water and to ratify a number of international human rights instruments. Mexico sought information on the technical assistance Bhutan needed to guarantee access to education and eliminate sexual exploitation and abuse. Mexico made recommendations.

61. Slovenia cited the stakeholder summary regarding the situation of Lhotshampas in Bhutan, which stated that those classified as F7 (non-nationals, migrants and illegal settlers) have consistently been denied access to services, including education and health, the right to work and to own property, marry and travel freely. It asked about plans to improve their situation. Slovenia made recommendations.

62. Italy commended Bhutan for the abolition of capital punishment in 2004. Italy acknowledged the progress achieved for the protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms and believed that some more steps could be taken to sustain the momentum for change. Italy noted that the situation of refugees in Nepal and of religious and ethnic minorities as areas of concern and encouraged Bhutan to tackle the root causes of the refugee flows towards neighbouring countries. Italy made recommendations.

63. Pakistan noted as encouraging the Government's according top priority to the eradication of poverty. It appreciated that Bhutan is projected to outstrip global poverty reduction targets two years ahead of schedule and is also on track to achieve most MDGs. It asked about Bhutan's targeted measures towards poverty reduction, and sought information on the Kidu system. Pakistan made recommendations.

64. Chile noted the numerous measures and policies adopted by Bhutan in different areas with a view to promoting and protecting human rights. Chile recognized the efforts made by Bhutan in moving to a Constitutional Monarchy and hoped that the country would continue in this direction. Chile also made reference to ratification to the Optional Protocol to the CRC. Chile made recommendations.

65. France noted the efforts made by the authorities in seeking to implement the CRC and the Protocols. However, the Committee on the Rights of the Child has recently expressed concern as to the high proportion of forced labour of children, and France asked what measures Bhutan is taking in this regard. It expressed particular concern over the situation of refugees in Bhutan. France made recommendations.

66. Spain recognized the recent progress made by Bhutan in human rights, particularly with the abolition of the death penalty in 2004, and congratulated it for the ratification of the CRC's Optional Protocol on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography. It made recommendations.

67. Azerbaijan welcomed measures to combat domestic violence and trafficking, national legislative reforms and the ban on corporal punishment in schools. It aligned itself with a number of treaty body recommendations and urged the international community to provide technical assistance to Bhutan to overcome challenges in promoting and protecting human rights. Azerbaijan made recommendations.

68. United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland noted that violations of women's rights came from sexual abuse and trafficking, domestic violence, labour exploitation and limited access to work. Noting that only two political parties registered and stood for election, it asked about steps being taken to ensure a transparent and fully representative government. It noted the lack of public access to media and information and sought information on plans to guarantee media freedom and freedom of information, speech and expression. It made recommendations.

69. Japan welcomed Bhutan's establishment of the Committee on Human Rights in the National Assembly. It noted the human rights awareness and training efforts of the Government. Japan cited challenges relating to the issue of Bhutanese refugees in eastern Nepal, including the determination of their nationality, and hoped these would be resolved through a bilateral process. Japan made recommendations.

70. Switzerland noted such developments as the abolition of the death penalty, efforts to combat corruption and legislative reform and stated that Bhutan is an exemplary case for its region. Switzerland expressed concern about the situation of the Lhotsampa minority of Bhutan. It drew attention to the refugee problem involving Bhutan and Nepal and that, despite several rounds of talks, the situation has not been resolved. Switzerland made recommendations.

71. Venezuela noted the human rights challenges facing Bhutan, particularly with regard to the right to health and education, due to its mountainous geography and dispersed rural population. Venezuela appreciated Bhutan's major efforts in building up an education system according to the needs of its inhabitants. It also highlighted Bhutan's attention to gender equality. Venezuela sought information on the initiatives taken by Bhutan to ensure the progressive implementation of the right to education on the basis of equal opportunity. Venezuela made a recommendation.

72. Poland, while appreciating progress made in the promotion and protection of human rights, noted that Bhutan still faced challenges. Poland referred to reports indicating that ethnic Nepalese suffer discriminatory legislation and practices of exclusion, including in acquiring citizenship and was alarmed at the effects on children who risk becoming or are stateless. Poland asked about measures intended to resolve these issues. Poland made recommendations.

73. United States of America noted that Bhutan's most recent census categorized over 14 per cent of its population as "non-national residents", including people who effectively lost their nationality through legal changes over the past 20 years. It sought information on efforts to protect non-nationals' rights. It commended Bhutan's five-year plan for requiring agencies to mainstream gender issues and promote women's empowerment. It made recommendations.

74. Latvia highly valued Bhutan's commitment to ensuring the success of the democratic system. Latvia referred to the issue of standing invitations to special procedures, an issue addressed also as a written question before the UPR session. It noted Bhutan's previous cooperation with special procedures mandate holders, and made a recommendation in this regard.

75. Bahrain noted the adoption of programmes to protect human rights, such as a study of gender issues and Government policies in this regard. It commended efforts to prevent domestic violence against women in the five-year plan. It sought more information on efforts to empower women in all policies and national plans. Bahrain made a recommendation.

76. Uzbekistan welcomed the strengthening of national mechanisms to protect human rights, the results of efforts to defend the rights of women, children and the disabled, to guarantee rights to education, health and to inform the population about human rights. It noted Bhutan's efforts, priorities and actions to fulfil international human rights obligations, despite difficulties, and the need for technical support.

77. Norway believed that civil society plays an important role in fostering a culture of human rights and effective cooperation with the United Nations human rights machinery as fundamental to improve the situation on the ground. Norway considered as important the National Plan of Action for gender. Norway appreciated that efforts for a solution for the refugees in the camps in Nepal are gaining momentum and, while noting that the international community offered to resettle 75,000 of about 110,000 people in the camps, it expressed concern that not a single person has been allowed to go back to Bhutan. Norway made recommendations.

78. Argentina was pleased about the creation of the National Commission on Women and Children and the recognition of equal rights under the Constitution. It also welcomed a pilot study on gender. Argentina referred, inter alia, to the international campaign regarding the ratification and entry into force of the International Convention on the Protection of all persons from Enforced Disappearance (CED). It made recommendations.

79. Slovakia encouraged Bhutan to continue the process of democratic reforms in compliance with international standards. It noted that Bhutan has ratified only two international human rights instruments and made recommendations for further ratification. Citing CRC concerns about disparities in the rights of children of Nepalese origin to citizenship, education, health services, culture, religion and language, it made a related recommendation.

80. Morocco welcomed the efforts taken by Bhutan in seeking to consolidate the achievements made and to ensure the democratic values and culture as well as recognized human rights principles become rooted in the country. Morocco, while noting the important role played by the National Commission for Women and Children, referred to CEDAW's concerns about its effectiveness and coordination capacity. Morocco noted that Bhutan's national report identified the challenge of youth unemployment and sought information on the measures taken to address this issue and create job opportunities for rural women. Morocco made recommendations.

81. Saudi Arabia highlighted that the Government seeks to bring legislation in line with international civil and political rights standards. It noted among achievements the success in education. Saudi Arabia noted that legislation on civil society was adopted in 2007 and that the Government remains fully committed to further develop dialogue with NGOs working in particular on human rights and humanitarian issues. Noting some concerns expressed, Saudi Arabia encouraged Bhutan to accelerate implementation of the law on civil society by the relevant bodies as quickly as possible.

82. Kuwait said the national report reflected Bhutan's recognition of the need to strengthen all human rights. Kuwait noted constraints faced by Bhutan, particularly the eradication of poverty, unemployment and climate change, and that Bhutan's difficult geography affected the delivery services. It commended Bhutan's progress in strengthening freedom of the press and media, and made recommendations on this and other issues.

83. In response, the delegation stated that on rights of women and children, the NCWC was established in 2004 with the specific objective of securing the rights of women and children in the country. Bhutan is up to date with its reporting obligations to CRC and CEDAW, and to other international and regional instruments.

84. In order to reinforce the harmonization of CRC, CEDAW and other relevant instruments, the Child Care and Protection Bill and the Adoption Bill have been submitted to the Parliament for enactment. A Domestic Violence Bill is in the final stages and Women and Children Protection Units are being established in the Royal Bhutan police.

85. Concerning sexual harassment, the Labour and Employment Act has clear provisions on Sexual Harassment and penal provisions are enshrined in the Penal Code of Bhutan 2004.

86. With respect to human trafficking, Bhutan is minimally affected unlike the many misplaced reports. Nevertheless, Bhutan is undertaking efforts to address this and has stepped up its ongoing cross border collaboration on developing closer networking and information sharing with neighbouring countries.

87. Regarding commercial exploitation of children, Bhutan fully subscribes to the objectives and purposes of the CRC and has very strong legal provisions in place to prevent the worst forms of child labour and to regulate the minimum age for admission into employment.

88. On sexual orientation, the provisions concerning unnatural acts in the Penal Code, have since its enactment, never been invoked for acts between two consenting adults of the same sex.

89. With regard to independence of the Judiciary, the Constitution provides for separation of powers among the three branches of the government. Bhutan's legal procedures have clear provisions dealing with the rule of law, independence of the judiciary and due process of law.

90. Concerning access to education, the Constitution requires the State to provide free education to all children irrespective of language, ethnicity or family background.

91. With respect to access to health, the Constitution provides for access to public health services without any discrimination to all irrespective of legal status.

92. On the issue of Security Clearance, the delegation informed that security clearance is not required for a child to attend government schools.

93. Regarding corporal punishment, the Constitution and the Teachers Code of Conduct adequately addresses the issue. The government has submitted a Child Care and Protection Bill for enactment. On monastic institutions, the NCWC and the central monastic body have put certain measures in place *viz* alternative forms of discipline in the monastic system, establishment of a complaints and response mechanism and identification of a child protection officer.

94. Concerning the issue of operationalization of GNH, the GNH Commission is entrusted with the responsibility of ensuring all development programmes and projects are in line with GNH principles. A GNH Committee has been constituted in all government ministries and agencies to institutionalize GNH values and practices. Bhutan has developed a comprehensive inventory of nine core domains and 72 indices to assess the success of development programmes along GNH lines.

95. With regard to Media, the government is committed to promote a free media, which would serve as a powerful tool in the evolution of democracy in the country.

96. On cooperation with UN Human Rights Mechanisms, Bhutan is committed to continue constructive engagement with UN human rights mechanisms as in the past. The government would be pleased, in principle, to receive a member of the CEDAW Committee to advise on implementation of its recommendations made to Bhutan in July 2009. Bhutan also enjoys excellent cooperation with the ICRC, which conducts regular visits to Bhutan.

97. Regarding the report of the Working Group on Minorities-2005, Bhutan expressed reservations on the credibility and objectivity of the report as it did not capture the situation of minorities in South Asia and neither was Bhutan represented at the seminar on which the report was based.

98. With respect to the time frame for resumption of bilateral talks with Nepal, Bhutan conveyed that it remained hopeful that whenever a conducive situation presents itself, Bhutan would work with Nepal to resume the talks.

99. On resettlement of people from the refugee camps, Bhutan conveyed deep appreciation for the generous offers made by the United States, Canada, Australia, Denmark, The Netherlands, New Zealand, Norway and Sweden, which will contribute towards resolving the humanitarian problem.

100. In conclusion, the delegation expressed appreciation for the constructive suggestions, comments and recommendations from the Working Group and stated that the outcome of the report would be reported to the government for consideration.

## **II. CONCLUSIONS AND/OR RECOMMENDATIONS**

101. In the course of the discussion, the following recommendations were made to Bhutan. These recommendations will be examined by Bhutan, which will provide responses in due time. The response of Bhutan to these recommendations will be included in the outcome report adopted by the Human Rights Council at its thirteenth session.

- 1. Consider acceding to core international human rights instruments (Pakistan); Favourably consider ratification of all core international human rights instruments (Norway); Consider an early ratification of ICCPR and its Optional Protocols, ICESCR and the Convention against Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman, and Degrading Treatment (CAT) and its Optional Protocol (OP-CAT) (Slovakia); Study the possibility of becoming a party to ICCPR as well as ICESCR, as these two international conventions are really cornerstones of the whole human rights system (Viet Nam); Evaluate the possibility of ratifying CAT and OP-CAT (Argentina); Consider the possibility of ratifying CED (Argentina); Consider becoming a party to CRPD (Thailand); Consider becoming a member of the International Labour Organization (ILO) and ratifying ILO Convention 138 on minimum age and ILO Convention 182 on the worst forms of child labour (France); Consider an early ratification of the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court, including accession to the Agreement on the Privileges and Immunities of the Court (Slovakia);
- 2. Accelerate its ongoing transitional efforts with a view to acceding to the core international human rights treaties (Italy);
- 3. Adhere to the principles under the 1951 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees and its Protocol of 1967 with a view to their ratification (Mexico);
- Ratify core international human rights treaties, in particular ICCPR and ICESCR (Austria); 4. Ratify the core international instruments, especially ICCPR, ICESCR, CAT and OP-CAT (Denmark); Ratify the main international human rights instruments, in particular ICCPR and its two optional protocols, CAT and OP-CAT, the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD) and the Statute of the International Criminal Court (Chile); Ratify or accede to all core international human rights instruments such as ICCPR, ICESCR and CAT (Germany); Promptly ratify of ICERD to carry out effective implementation of the principles of this instrument (Mexico); Improve guarantees for the exercise of the right to information through the ratification of ICCPR and its two protocols (Spain); Ratify ICERD and CRPD (Spain); Sign and ratify ICESCR, CAT, the Optional Protocol to the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women and CED (Spain); Accede to CRPD (Egypt); Accede to the Convention relating to the Status of Refugees, its 1967 Protocol and the 1961 Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness (Canada); Accede to the 1951 Convention on the Status of Refugees (Poland); Continue efforts to build a legal framework in order to ensure protection for human rights, involving inter alia the ratification of the main international instruments in this area (France); Make a long-term plan for the step-by-step ratification of or accession to all core international human rights instruments (Slovenia); Become a party to ICERD, ICCPR and its Optional Protocols, ICESCR, the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, the

Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court and the Convention on the Status of Refugees and its Protocol (Argentina);

- 5. Incorporate the definition and prohibition of torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment in national legislation (Argentina);
- 6. Take measures to expedite the enactment of the adoption bill and the child care and protection bill by Parliament (Serbia)
- 7. Consider establishing an independent national human rights institution in conformity with the Paris Principles (Egypt);
- 8. Establish an independent national human rights institution in full compliance with the Paris Principles (Azerbaijan);
- 9. Continue to prioritize efforts aimed at strengthening national institutions and developing national capacities, including establishing relevant mechanisms, to undertake regular studies of international human rights instruments and to make appropriate recommendations to the Government (Malaysia);
- 10. Continue efforts to strengthen steps and provide resources for the National Commission for Women and Children (Bahrain);
- 11. Improve the work of the National Commission for Women and Children by enhancing its capacity, providing it with additional human resources and an adequate budget, in cooperation with the international community (Morocco);
- 12. Consider, as appropriate, learning and adopting, in accordance with national conditions, the best practices of other developing countries on the functioning of the oversight mechanisms (Sri Lanka);
- 13. Favourably consider the possibility of drawing up a national plan of action to protect the rights of children, as recommended by the Committee on the Rights of the Child (Belarus);
- 14. Envisage the adoption of a national plan for the promotion of the rights of the child and call for international assistance to allow it implement such a plan (Morocco);
- 15. Move forward on mainstreaming gender issues into all Government plans and policies (Japan);
- 16. Take concrete measures aiming at fostering a genuine human rights culture with due regard to national and regional particularities as well as historical, cultural and religious backgrounds (Islamic Republic of Iran);
- 17. Develop educational programmes to prevent and combat negative social attitudes towards different ethnic groups (United States of America);

- 18. Continue to work with international organizations and the Human Rights Council in particular to promote development and human rights (Lao People's Democratic Republic);
- 19. Strengthen its cooperation with human rights special procedures and consider issuing a standing invitation (Brazil); Consider extending a standing invitation to all special procedures of the Human Rights Council (Latvia); Extend an open and permanent invitation to the United Nations special procedures mandate holders (Chile); Extend an open and standing invitation for all the special procedures (Spain);
- 20. Accept visits from United Nations special rapporteurs, and in particular to accept the request made by the Special Rapporteur on freedom of religion or belief, which has been awaiting a response since 2006 (France); Respond positively to the request for a visit of the Special Rapporteur on freedom of religion or belief (Spain); Issue an invitation to the Special Rapporteur on freedom of religion or belief (Denmark); Approve the request for a visit by the Special Rapporteur on freedom of religion or belief (Norway);
- 21. Bear in mind the need to work towards securing the full range of human rights and fundamental freedoms, including the right to development, for all Bhutanese, in continuing the pursuit of Gross National Happiness (Philippines);
- 22. Continue pursuing the realization of the full range of human rights and fundamental freedoms for the Bhutanese people, in accordance with the country's international human rights obligations (Malaysia);
- 23. In line with previous recommendations of Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, develop policies and programmes to support the elimination of stereotypes associated with traditional roles and prevent the emergence of new stereotypes that are discriminatory against women (Germany); Continue its efforts to eliminate stereotypes based on male superiority (Turkey);
- 24. Continue and strengthen measures to enforce existing regulations to combat negative stereotyping of women in the local media (Serbia);
- 25. Follow up on the recommendation by the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women to introduce specific legislation and raise public awareness in order to close the gender gap, particularly in rural areas (Norway);
- 26. Introduce specific legislation providing for the adoption and implementation of temporary special measures to accelerate de facto gender equality (Azerbaijan);
- 27. Continue adopting measures to eliminate discrimination, particularly gender-based discrimination (Chile);
- 28. Enact legislation that eliminates and prevents all discrimination against any resident, including in education (United States);

- 29. Consider abolishing restrictive requirements such as "no objection certificates" or "security clearance certificates" when individuals apply for higher education, jobs, business licences and travel documents (Brazil);
- 30. Continue to strengthen the promotion and protection of the human rights of vulnerable groups within society, particularly women, children, disabled persons and persons with HIV/AIDS (Thailand);
- 31. Continue taking effective measures to further promote and protect the rights of women and children (Islamic Republic of Iran);
- 32. Reinforce the human rights protection of vulnerable and disabled children (Chile);
- 33. Improve the situation of vulnerable children, particularly those living in rural and remote areas, and children with disabilities (Azerbaijan);
- 34. Establish specialized services to meet the needs of children with disabilities (Spain);
- 35. Combat domestic violence (Turkey);
- 36. Expedite finalization of the draft domestic violence bill (Serbia);
- 37. Elaborate programmes aimed at elimination of all forms of violence against women and adopt the bill on domestic violence which is supposed to be tabled by 2010 (Poland); Enact legislation on domestic violence to protect the rights of women as a matter of priority (United Kingdom); Enact legislation on domestic violence as a matter of priority and increase access to justice for victims of such violations (Netherlands); Enact legislation on domestic violence against women while increasing access to justice for women victims, especially in remote and rural areas (United States);
- 38. Continue, in collaboration with the National Commission for Women and Children and other relevant stakeholders, to pursue public advocacy campaigns and promote greater awareness and understanding of the rights of victims of violence against women (Serbia);
- 39. Continue to work towards eliminating all violence against women and to increase access to justice for women victims of violence, including in remote and rural areas (Canada);
  Further address the issue of eliminating violence against women and children (Japan);
- 40. Adopt measures to increase the number of women working on violence against women issues in law enforcement agencies (United States of America);
- 41. Prohibit corporal punishment of children at home (Slovenia);
- 42. Consider realizing as soon as possible its plans to establish four more women and child protection units in the other major towns (Singapore);

- 43. Intensify efforts to combat trafficking, align its definitions of prostitution and trafficking with international law, intensify its efforts to provide support to women at risk and seek bilateral agreements with neighbouring States (United States);
- 44. Promote measures to combat the commercial sexual exploitation of children (Japan);
- 45. Continue with current activities and efforts to ensure that the establishment of democracy and a democratic culture of governance in the country are firmly entrenched and made sustainable through completion of the institution and capacity-building process and the process of enacting various laws and regulations as may be required by the Constitution (Indonesia);
- 46. Continue on the path chosen and, in particular, foster and promote activities and discussion on human rights issues domestically and capacity-building of institutions (Switzerland);
- 47. Strengthen efforts to build the rule of law in Bhutan in accordance with international standards, integrating, alongside these, the principles of Gross National Happiness (Viet Nam);
- 48. Promote improvement in the juvenile justice system (Japan);
- 49. Promote and ensure freedom of religion for all individuals of all faiths (Denmark);
- 50. Continue to protect and strengthen freedom of the press and media ; (Kuwait)
- 51. Strengthen capacity-building measures for workers in the media and the press also through efforts of the international community (Kuwait);
- 52. Enact legislation that promotes and protects the rights to freedom of opinion and expression (United Kingdom);
- 53. Promote the establishment of civil society organizations without undue restrictions and seek the assistance of the United Nations system in Bhutan to this end (Netherlands);
- 54. Establish effective mechanisms to monitor the situation of human rights in the country and allow independent human rights organizations to operate in Bhutan and express their views freely (Italy); Allow free exercise of the work of independent human rights organizations (Spain);
- 55. Strengthen the working conditions and involvement of civil society organizations (Norway);
- 56. Undertake extensive advocacy campaigns to encourage greater women's participation in the political process at both the national and local levels (Indonesia);

- 57. Continue efforts to raise greater awareness among Bhutanese in all areas of the country of the democratic process, including voting rights, in order to foster greater political participation by all members of society (Turkey);
- 58. Continue targeted policies and initiatives to encourage greater participation of women in the electoral process (Turkey);
- 59. Take proactive measures to promote women's participation in the local elections planned for in 2010 (Norway);
- 60. Repeal all provisions which criminalize sodomy and other sexual activities between consenting adults (Canada); Decriminalize sodomy or other sexual activity between consenting adults (Slovenia); Eliminate legal provisions which criminalize sodomy and other sexual activities between consenting adults (Spain);
- 61. Establish a monitoring mechanism to effectively ensure the protection of the rights of children in alternative care, including in monasteries (Austria);
- 62. Provide adequate support to children in the care of their extended families (Austria);
- 63. Take further efforts in addressing the problem of unemployment, especially among young people (Belarus);
- 64. Intensify efforts to create more employment opportunities for youth by, inter alia, providing more entrepreneurship training courses and apprenticeships (Malaysia);
- 65. Continue every effort to fulfil its tasks and overcome all the challenges of eradicating poverty and improving economic and social conditions of Bhutan people (Lao People's Democratic Republic); Step up its efforts to further reduce poverty, particularly in rural areas, and to improve the well-being of the people (Belarus); Continue its efforts to achieve equitable socio-economic development and to further address poverty alleviation through its overarching objective according to its current policies and action plan (Cambodia); Continue to fight poverty, with the support and cooperation of the international community (Bangladesh); Continue its efforts to eradicate absolute poverty (Pakistan); Devote more resources to plans to reduce poverty and to programmes supporting the most vulnerable groups in society, especially in rural areas of the country (Viet Nam);
- 66. Continue to strengthen its efforts in tackling poverty and enhancing the access of all persons, especially those living in rural areas, to basic social services such as health and education (Thailand);
- 67. Develop a strategy to combat malnutrition (Brazil);
- 68. Continue its efforts to achieve Millennium Development Goals within the stipulated time frame (Bangladesh);

- 69. Continue efforts to ensure that the right to health can be enjoyed on a fair and equal basis by everyone in the country within the context of attaining the Millennium Development Goals, and improve the training of medical and paramedical personnel (Algeria); Take further measures to enhance the national system for health care (Kyrgyzstan);
- 70. Ensure compulsory and free of all costs primary education for all children (Azerbaijan);
- 71. Continue the policy of free education through cooperation with and assistance from the international community (Indonesia);
- 72. Introduce literacy programmes aimed especially at women, and improve access to education by women, including those in remote parts of the country (Austria);
- 73. Intensify its efforts to close the gender gap in education, in particular at higher levels, for which it is necessary to have international cooperation and technical assistance so that it can face up to the shortage of teachers and infrastructure needs in order to eradicate illiteracy and achieve full access to scientific knowledge for its population by using modern teaching methods (Venezuela);
- 74. Implement additional measures to ensure equal access for girls and women to all levels of education, including provision of incentives to girls and their families to remain in school, development of non-formal educational opportunities to reduce illiteracy among girls and women and increased access to adult education (United States);
- 75. Take action to encourage pregnant and/or married girls and women to continue their education (United States);
- 76. Continue to work with all neighbouring countries to find a lasting solution to illegal and economic migrants through the bilateral process, based on agreements already reached between the Governments of Bhutan and Nepal (Lao People's Democratic Republic);
- 77. In line with recommendations of the Committee in the Rights of the Child, enhance efforts to find a prompt solution for either the return or resettlement of people living in refugee camps, with particular attention to children and women and reunification of families (Germany); Focus on refugees from Bhutan in camps in eastern Nepal wishing to return to Bhutan and in particular, at this juncture, on addressing those cases with compelling humanitarian concerns (Netherlands);
- 78. Step up efforts to find a sustainable solution for refugees through discussion with relevant parties, and attach particular importance to children and women and the need for families to remain together (Algeria); Enhance efforts to find a prompt solution for the return or resettlement of people living in refugee camps in eastern Nepal (Denmark); Intensify efforts to find a sustainable solution to the situation of Bhutanese refugees in Nepal, in agreement with neighbouring States (France); Take active measures to find a solution in Nepal and Bhutan for the remaining number of refugees (Norway);

- 79. Resume dialogue with Nepal and enhance cooperation with the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) to resolve the question of Bhutanese refugees, including by voluntary return, with particular attention to family reunification and other humanitarian cases (Canada); Work with UNHCR and the Core Group to develop a near-term initiative to allow some refugees to return immediately to Bhutan, granting special consideration to cases of humanitarian concern, such as those involving the elderly (United States);
- 80. Make it a priority on the agenda of the new Government and, if necessary, the Parliament, efforts to seek a constructive solution to the refugee problem, respecting the rights of those concerned, and in that context step up dialogue with the international community and the United Nations humanitarian agencies (Switzerland);
- 81. Adopt the necessary legal framework and launch appropriate policies, including awareness campaigns for the public, to guarantee the indiscriminate access of the Nepalese minority to the same enjoyment of human rights as for other Bhutanese citizens (Slovakia); Take measures to ensure respect for the human rights of persons belonging to ethnic minorities (Canada); Take legislative and practical measures to promote and protect the rights of persons belonging to minorities (United Kingdom); Commit to ensuring respect, in all circumstances, of the fundamental rights and dignity of all people in the country (Switzerland); Address the claims of discriminatory treatment of minorities (Italy);
- 82. Continue to make sure that its legislation and practices in the fight against terrorism match its international obligations related to human rights, international humanitarian law and refugee law (Mexico);
- 83. Share its experiences and best practices internationally on the concept of Gross National Happiness (Philippines);
- 84. Consider sharing its sustainable development experiences through the help of the relevant specialized agencies (Singapore);
- 85. Continue its contribution at the international level to efforts aimed at fighting hunger in accordance with the outcome of the World Food Summits as well as relevant resolutions of the General Assembly and the Human Rights Council (Egypt);
- 86. Continue and strengthen with international cooperation its efforts in environmental conservation and protection, which contribute significantly to global efforts to safeguard the common heritage of mankind (Islamic Republic of Iran);
- 87. Continue to make the most of its experience within the framework of the South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation (Switzerland);
- 88. Call upon the international community to pay attention to the difficulties associated with the present stage of development in Bhutan and provide the needed assistance to it to strengthen the capacity of its national mechanisms responsible for preparing periodic

reports for treaty bodies and to train its law enforcement officials, judges and police officers in the area of human rights (Egypt);<sup>3</sup>

- 89. Oversee the strengthening of technical cooperation between Bhutan and various United Nations organs to enhance capacity in the field of exchange of technology and information (Kuwait);
- 90. Call for enhanced cooperation and support from the international community and relevant United Nations agencies to strengthen the capacity of existing oversight mechanisms that serve to promote and protect human rights in Bhutan, in keeping with domestic requirements (Sri Lanka);<sup>4</sup>
- 91. Request technical assistance and cooperation, as deemed appropriate, from the international community, including relevant United Nations and specialized agencies, with a view to ensuring the promotion and protection of the full spectrum of human rights of its people (Malaysia);
- 92. Call upon relevant United Nations agencies and organizations, in particular UNICEF, to provide technical assistance to build its capacity to promote gender equality, make women more autonomous, protect children in the country and set up effective institutional mechanisms for birth registration (Algeria);
- 93. Continue advancing its efforts to improve indicators regarding poverty, illiteracy, schooling, mothers' health and access to water with the cooperation of the international community, in particular the developed countries, which must increase their official development aid and other forms of aid to Bhutan (Cuba);
- 94. With the support of the international community, including the relevant specialized agencies of the United Nations, strengthen its efforts to implement its national food security-related programmes (Egypt); Call upon the international community, especially the relevant United Nations programmes and funds, to provide assistance for Bhutan to sustainably consolidate its national strategy for food security and improve national food production (Algeria);
- 95. Continue to fully use technical assistance and international cooperation to promote the implementation of national development programmes so as to improve its capacity in protecting its people's right to health and education (China);

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The recommendation as read during the interactive dialogue: The international community pays attention to the difficulties associated with the present stage of development in Bhutan and provide the needed assistance to it to strengthen the capacity of its national mechanisms responsible for preparing periodic reports for treaty bodies and to train its law enforcement officials, judges, and police officers in the area of human rights (Egypt);

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The recommendation as read during the interactive dialogue: Enhanced cooperation and support from the international community and relevant United Nations agencies to strengthen the capacity of existing oversight mechanisms that serves to promote and protect human rights in Bhutan, in keeping with domestic requirements (Sri Lanka);

- 96. Seek the assistance of the international community to meet the Millennium Development Goals (Philippines);
- 97. Call for the provision of technical and financial assistance by the international community to contribute to the development process of the country with the view to achieving the Millennium Development Goals (Islamic Republic of Iran);<sup>5</sup>
- 98. Continue its process of consultation with civil society in its follow-up to the universal periodic review (United Kingdom);
- 99. Establish an inclusive process to follow up on the recommendations of the Working Group (Norway).

102. All conclusions and/or recommendations contained in the present report reflect the position of the submitting State(s) and /or the State under review thereon. They should not be construed as endorsed by the Working Group as a whole.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The recommendation as read during the interactive dialogue: Providing technical and financial assistance by the international community to contribute to the development process of the country with the view to achieve Millennium Development Goals(Islamic Republic of Iran)

#### Annex

#### **COMPOSITION OF THE DELEGATION**

The delegation of Bhutan was headed by H.E. M. Lyonpo Kinzang Dorji, Former Prime Minister and Special Envoy of the Prime Minister, Royal Government of Bhutan, Thimphu and composed of 11 members:

H.E. Lyonpo Thakur S. Powdyel, Hon'ble Minister, Ministry of Education, Royal Government of Bhutan, Thimphu (Co-leader);

H.E. Ambassador Bap Kesang, Advisor, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Royal Government of Bhutan, Thimphu;

H.E. Mr. Yeshey Dorji, Ambassador and Permanent Representative, Permanent Mission of the Kingdom of Bhutan to the United Nations and other International Organizations, Geneva;

H.E. Mr. Sonam T. Rabgye, Ambassador of the Kingdom of Bhutan to Belgium and the European Communities, Brussels;

Ms. Maina Khadka, Head, Tertiary Education, Ministry of Education, Royal Government of Bhutan, Thimphu;

Dr. Rinchen Chophel, Executive Director, National Commission of Women and Children, Thimphu;

Ms. Karma Hamu, Chief Planning Officer, Gross National Happiness Commission, Royal Government of Bhutan, Thimphu;

Ms. Doma Tshering, Chief, Foreign Minister's Office, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Royal Government of Bhutan, Thimphu;

Mr. Sonam Tobgay, Minister Counsellor, Permanent Mission of the Kingdom of Bhutan to the United Nations, New York;

Mr. Tashi Delek, Senior Attorney, Office of the Attorney General, Royal Government of Bhutan, Thimphu;

Mr. Phuntsho Norbu, Second Secretary, Permanent Mission of the Kingdom of Bhutan to the United Nations and other International Organizations, Geneva.

-----