

Submission to the Universal Periodic Review of Indonesia

Human Rights Watch

March 2022

Introduction

- 1. The situation of human rights in Indonesia is at a turning point. While progress has been made in many areas in recent years, many core rights are at risk. Human Rights Watch submits this report on Indonesia's implementation of recommendations that the Indonesian government agreed to in its 2017 Universal Periodic Review.
- 2. This submission is not a complete review of all 141 recommendations in 2017. The Indonesian government needs to make greater and more concerted efforts to implement these recommendations and others, including those involving religious freedom, women's rights, children's rights, LGBT rights, and the rights to a healthy environment and with respect to climate change.

Freedom of religion or belief

- 3. In 2017, religious freedom in Indonesia received the most attention in Geneva. The review took place after a long and massive Islamist protest against then-Jakarta Governor Basuki Purnama, a Christian who was prosecuted for insulting Islam that resulted in his imprisonment. Twenty-six countries made recommendation on freedom of religion or belief.² Indonesia supported some, but rejected the proposal to revoke the 1965 blasphemy law and the 2006 so-called religious harmony regulation.
- 4. A 1952 decree defines a religion to have a single God, prophets, a holy book, and a global network.³ Hundreds of discriminatory regulations allow local authorities to refuse to issue building permits for religious minorities or to pressure congregations to relocate in the name of "harmony." Islamist militants use the regulations to justify their intimidation or violence against religious minorities, for instance, to stop them building a church or celebrate a religious ritual.
- 5. The victims include non-Muslim minorities such as Christians, Hindus, Buddhists, and Confucians who are recognized under the constitution. But in a predominantly Sunni Muslim country, other Muslim minorities also face discrimination, including Shia, Ahmadis, and non-Syafei Sunnis. Religious groups with smaller numbers of adherents, such as Millah Abraham, Jehovah's Witnesses, and ethnically based religions like Sunda Wiwitan, Kejawen, Parmalim, Kaharingan also suffer discrimination.
- 6. Indonesian government institutions, including the Ministry of Religious Affairs, the Coordinating Board for Monitoring Mystical Beliefs in Society (the "blasphemy law" office), the Religious Harmony Forum, and the semi-official Indonesian Ulema Council,⁴ erode religious freedom by issuing decrees and *fatwas* against minority groups, using their position of authority to press for the prosecution of "blasphemers," or by closing down houses of

¹ Additional information on human rights issues in Indonesia can be found at Human Rights Watch, *Indonesia – World Report 2022*, https://www.hrw.org/world-report/2022/country-chapters/indonesia.

² These countries included Norway, Ireland, Slovakia, Germany, Republic of Korea, Switzerland, Canada, New Zealand, Austria, South Africa, Peru, Italy, Oman, Panama, Guatemala, Netherlands, Hungary, Kenya, United States of America, Czechia, Norway, Brazil, Sweden, Denmark, Spain, and Australia. See "UPR of Indonesia 3rd Cycle, 27th Session, Thematic List of Recommendations," United Nations Human Rights Council, https://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/UPR/Pages/IDIndex.aspx (accessed on March 16, 2022).

³ Andreas Harsono, "Religious Minorities in Indonesia Face Discrimination," *New Mandala*, December 24, 2020, https://www.newmandala.org/religious-minorities-in-indonesia-face-blasphemy-prosecutions-intimidation-denial-of-service/ (accessed on March 16, 2022).

⁴ Human Rights Watch, *In Religion's Name: Abuses against Religious Minorities in Indonesia* (New York: Human Rights Watch, February 2013), https://www.hrw.org/report/2013/02/28/religions-name/abuses-against-religious-minorities-indonesia.

worship.⁵

7. Indonesia should:

- a. Review the 1952 Minister of Religious Affairs decree on the definition of a religion, which differentiates between *kepercayaan* (belief) and *agama* (religion) and has become the basis to discriminate against small religions and spiritual movements⁶;
- b. Revoke the 1965 blasphemy law. Drop the plan to expand the 1965 blasphemy law in the draft Criminal Code⁷;
- c. End abusive closure of houses of worship and review the impact of the 2006 religious harmony regulation, including by making an official count of the number of houses of worships that have been closed since 2006;
- d. Revoke more than 400 provincial and local decrees, mostly made by governors, mayors and regents, that discriminate against religious minorities, women and LGBT individuals.

Women's Rights

8. Discriminatory mandatory *jilbab* (also called *hijab*) regulations require women and girls to wear jilbabs, while also prohibiting close-fitting clothing and requiring them to cover their bodies except their hands, feet, and face. Indonesia's National Commission on Violence Against Women (Komnas Perempuan) has stated that the regulations violate women's rights, including by forcing women and girls to wear the jilbab in government buildings, schools or public places, and imposing curfews and other restrictions on women and girls. These local, provincial, and national regulations currently affect areas in which about 90 percent of Indonesia's population reside. Some areas have introduced local rules that force even non-Muslim girls to wear jilbabs, such as in West Sumatra and Aceh.

9. Indonesia should:

- a. Issue a public policy statement that all national and local ordinances and regulations requiring the jilbab and other female clothing are discriminatory, should not be enforced, and should be repealed. The central government, especially the Ministry of Home Affairs, should exercise its authority to revoke executive decrees issued by governors, mayors, and regents;
- b. Work with Islamic organizations, including the Nahdlatul Ulama and the Muhammadiyah, to create a public messaging campaign against requiring or

⁵ One the latest example took place in West Kalimantan in which Governor Sutarmidji had accused the Ahmadiyah community of committing "blasphemy against Islam." He ordered their mosque to be closed down. See Brad Adams, "End Closures and Prevent Demolition of Ahmadiyah Mosque," *Project Multatuli*, November 4, 2021, https://projectmultatuli.org/en/end-closures-and-prevent-demolition-of-ahmadiyah-mosque/ (accessed on March 10, 2022).

⁶ Andreas Harsono, "Religious Minorities in Indonesia Face Discrimination," *New Mandala*, December 24, 2020, https://www.newmandala.org/religious-minorities-in-indonesia-face-blasphemy-prosecutions-intimidation-denial-of-service/ (accessed on March 16, 2022).

⁷ Andreas Harsono, "Indonesia to Expand Abusive Blasphemy Law," October 31, 2019, Human Rights Watch dispatch, https://www.hrw.org/news/2019/10/31/indonesia-expand-abusive-blasphemy-law.

⁸ Human Rights Watch, "I Wanted to Run Away": Abusive Dress Codes for Women and Girls in Indonesia (New York: Human Rights Watch, March 2021), https://www.hrw.org/report/2021/03/18/i-wanted-run-away/abusive-dress-codes-women-and-girls-indonesia.

⁹ Updated Submission to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women: Review of the Combined State Party Report for Indonesia - 80th Session, September 2021 https://www.hrw.org/news/2021/09/20/updated-submission-committee-elimination-discrimination-against-women.

pressuring women and girls to wear the jilbab or other Islamic dress, and promoting tolerance and inclusivity.

LGBT Rights

- 10. In 2017, 13 countries recommended that Indonesia take action on the rise of discrimination and violence on the grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity.¹⁰
- 11. Between 2017 and 2021, police across Indonesia raided saunas, hotel rooms, hair salons, and private homes on suspicion that gay or transgender people were inside. Militant Islamists often tipped off police or accompanied them during these raids, and perpetrators often justified targeting LGBT people with reference to discriminatory clauses in the 2008 pornography law.¹¹
- 12. On January 13, 2018, police in Cianjur, West Java, raided a private villa where five men had gathered. 12
- 13. In Aceh, on January 27, 2018, police raided five hair salons that employed *waria* (transgender women). Police forced them to remove their shirts, cut their hair in public, and detained them for 72 hours.¹³
- 14. On August 29, 2020, police forcibly broke up a party at a Jakarta hotel, arresting nine men and charging them with the crime of "facilitating obscene acts." ¹⁴ They were sentenced to between four and five years in prison.
- 15. In January 2021, Sharia (Islamic law) police in Aceh province, where by-laws permit as punishment up to 100 lashes and up to 100 months in prison for consensual same-sex sexual acts, publicly flogged two gay men 77 times each after a vigilante mob raided their apartment in November, allegedly caught them having sex, and handed them over to the police.¹⁵

16. Indonesia should:

a. Stop police raids targeting LGBT people, investigate and appropriately discipline or prosecute officers responsible for unlawful raids, and dissolve any regional and local police units dedicated to targeting LGBT people;

¹³ Andreas Harsono, "Indonesian Police Arrest Transgender Women," Human Rights Watch dispatch, January 30, 2018, https://www.hrw.org/news/2018/01/30/indonesian-police-arrest-transgender-women.

¹⁰ These countries included Ireland, Slovakia, Norway, Spain, Sweden, Iceland, Czechia, Norway, Brazil, Australia, Argentina, and Mozambique. See "UPR of Indonesia 3rd Cycle, 27th Session, Thematic List of Recommendations," United Nations Human Rights Council, https://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/UPR/Pages/IDIndex.aspx (accessed on March 16, 2022).

¹¹ Human Rights Watch, "Scared in Public and Now No Privacy": Human Rights and Public Health Impacts of Indonesia's Anti-LGBT Moral Panic (New York: Human Rights Watch, July 2018), https://www.hrw.org/report/2018/07/01/scared-public-and-now-no-privacy/human-rights-and-public-health-impacts.

¹² Ibid.

¹⁴ Human Rights Watch, "Indonesia: Investigate Police Raid on 'Gay Party'", Human Rights Watch press release, September 7, 2020, https://www.hrw.org/news/2020/09/07/indonesia-investigate-police-raid-gay-party.

¹⁵ Kyle Knight, "77 Lashes for a Gay Couple in Indonesia," Human Rights Watch dispatch, January 28, 2021, https://www.hrw.org/news/2021/01/28/77-lashes-gay-couple-indonesia.

- b. Repeal all local regulations, including Sharia rules in Aceh, that violate the rights of LGBT people¹⁶;
- c. Amend the discriminatory anti-LGBT provisions of the pornography law that have allowed for prosecutions on the grounds that same-sex conduct is "deviant."

Environment and Climate Change

- 17. As one of the world's top 10 emitters of greenhouse gases, Indonesia is contributing to the climate crisis that is taking a mounting toll on human rights around the globe.¹⁷
- 18. In its 2021 update to its national climate action plan, Indonesia reiterated its 2016 goals rather than establishing more ambitious targets as required by the Paris Agreement on climate change. These goals are insufficient to meet the agreement's goal to limit global warming to 1.5°C above pre-industrial levels. If all countries' commitments were in this range, the global temperature increase would exceed 4°C by the end of the century. 19
- 19. Implementation of a new job creation law that weakens environmental regulations is expected to exacerbate deforestation and land disputes.²⁰ In November 2021, at the Glasgow climate summit, the Indonesian government signed a global pledge to end forest loss by 2030, but Environment and Forestry Minister Siti Nurbaya Bakar promptly criticized the pledge and

¹⁶ Indonesian LGBT organization Arus Pelangi documented 45 provincial and municipal ordinances that discriminate based on sexual orientation or gender identity, including 23 that explicitly mention homosexuality, lesbian, and transgender. Arus Pelangi, *Catatan Kelam: 12 Tahun Persekusi LGBTI di Indonesia* (Dark Note: 12 Years of Persecutions of LGBTI in Indonesia), pp. 72-83, Jakarta: 2019.

¹⁷ According to the most recent data on Climate Watch, a database managed by the World Resources Institute, Indonesia was among the top 10 polluters regardless of whether the accounting included or excluded emissions from land use, land use change and forestry (LULUCF). Climate Watch, Global Historical Emissions, https://www.climatewatchdata.org/ghg-emissions?end_year=2018§ors=total-excluding-lucf&start_year=1990 (accessed on March 4, 2022).

¹⁸ Republic of Indonesia's Nationally Determined Contribution, 2016, https://www4.unfccc.int/sites/ndcstaging/PublishedDocuments/Indonesia%20First/First%20NDC%20Indonesia submitted%20to%20UNFCCC%20Set November%20%202016.pdf (accessed March 4, 2022). Republic of Indonesia's Updated Nationally Determined Contribution, 2021 https://www4.unfccc.int/sites/ndcstaging/PublishedDocuments/Indonesia%20First/Updated%20NDC%20Indon esia%202021%20-%20corrected%20version.pdf (accessed March 4, 2022). See also the Climate Action Tracker's analysis of Indonesia's updated NDC, Climate Action Tracker, CAT Climate Target Update Tracker, Indonesia, July 23, 2021, https://climateactiontracker.org/climate-target-update-tracker/indonesia/ (accessed March 4, 2022). Article 4.11 of the Paris Agreement states that: "A Party may at any time adjust its existing nationally determined contribution with a view to enhancing its level of ambition, in accordance with guidance adopted by the Conference of the Parties serving as the meeting of the Parties to this Agreement." The ordinary meaning of "enhance" is "to raise the level of," or to "increase." An ordinary reading of article 4.11 therefore means that a party that decides to adjust its existing NDC must do so in a way which increases contribution from that contained in its existing NDC. Paris Agreement, 2015, https://unfccc.int/files/essential_background/convention/application/pdf/english_paris_agreement.pdf (accessed March 4, 2022).

¹⁹ Climate Action Tracker, CAT Climate Target Update Tracker, Indonesia, July 23, 2021, https://climateactiontracker.org/climate-target-update-tracker/indonesia/ (accessed March 4, 2022).

²⁰ Human Rights Watch, "Indonesia: New Law Hurts Workers, Indigenous Groups", Human Rights Watch news release, October 15, 2020, https://www.hrw.org/news/2020/10/15/indonesia-new-law-hurts-workers-indigenous-groups#. See also: Mia Siscawati, "Indonesia: Rollback in the Time of Covid-19", Forest Peoples Programme (FPP), Aliansi Masyarakat Adat Nusantara (AMAN), Lowerstein International Human Rights Clinic of Yale Law School, February 2021,

https://www.forestpeoples.org/sites/default/files/documents/Indonesia%20Rollback%20Report_EN%20FINAL.pdf (accessed March 4, 2022).

vowed to continue clearing forests as part of "development" plans.²¹

- 20. Successive Indonesian governments have allocated huge swaths of land to development projects irrespective of its impacts on local communities, including Indigenous and forest-dependent people. The government affirms land rights but without adequate protections, including for Indigenous rights, resulting in rural people losing control over their land. Most of these projects have occurred with no or minimal consultation with affected communities, while some communities face intimidation and harassment by local police working on behalf of powerful entities.
- 21. In May 2021, the government announced that it would shut down all its coal-fired power plants by 2060, two decades later than the deadline scientists established to shut such plants to meet the 1.5°C target of the Paris Agreement.²² The government says it will continue to build coal-fired power stations, which will lead to tens of thousands of preventable and premature deaths because of air pollution.²³

22. Indonesia should:

- a. Through legislative action recognize and protect Indigenous people and their rights to land and forests they manage and use;
- Provide necessary resources to the Land Agency to investigate compliance with national laws on land acquisition, particularly consultation and compensation;
- c. Establish a land-dispute resolution mechanism to mediate and adjudicate on the numerous land-related conflicts across the country;
- d. Review its Nationally Determined Contribution to establish emissions reduction targets that bring it in line with the Paris Agreement goal to limit global warming to 1.5°C above pre-industrial levels.

Shackling of Persons with Psychosocial Disabilities

23. In 2017, the Indonesian government supported 11 of the 12 recommendations addressing the rights of persons with disabilities.²⁴ agreeing to improve its legal and institutional frameworks and implement policies and programs focusing on and promoting

²¹ Fathin Ungku and Stanley Widianto, "Indonesia signals about-face on COP26 deforestation pledge," Reuters, November 4, 2021, https://www.reuters.com/business/cop/indonesia-signals-about-face-cop26-zero-deforestation-pledge-2021-11-04/ (accessed March 4, 2022).

²² Reuters, "Indonesian state utility to retire coal power plants gradually," May 27, 2021, https://www.reuters.com/article/indonesia-coal-idUSL3N2NE3FM (accessed March 4, 2022).

²³ S. N. Koplitz et al., "Burden of Disease from Rising Coal-Fired Power Plant Emissions in Southeast Asia," Environmental Science and Technology 2017, 51, pp. 1467-1476, https://www.banktrack.org/download/burden_of_disease_from_rising_coalfired_power_plant_emissions_in.pdf (accessed March 4, 2022); Greenpeace, "Human Cost of Coal Power", August 2015, https://www.greenpeace.org/static/planet4-indonesia-stateless/2019/02/676f10e5-676f10e5-full-report-human-cost-of-coal-power.pdf (accessed March 4, 2022).

²⁴ These countries included South Africa, China, Thailand (139), Egypt (139.15), Columbia (139.140), 16, Morocco (139.39), Vietnam (139.16), Saudi Arabia (140.2), 141, Japan (142), Cuba (143), Thailand 144; Saudi Arabia (140.2) See "UPR of Indonesia 3rd Cycle, 27th Session, Thematic List of Recommendations," United Nations Human Rights Council, https://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/UPR/Pages/IDIndex.aspx (accessed March 29, 2022).

the rights of persons with disabilities.²⁵ However, despite a 1977 government ban, families, traditional healers, and staff in institutions, continue to shackle people with psychosocial disabilities, sometimes for years at a time, due to prevalent stigma and the absence of adequate community-based services.²⁶ About 15,000 people were still living in chains as of November 2019.²⁷

24. State-run residential institutions and private faith-healing centers where people with disabilities are arbitrarily detained are exceptionally overcrowded, unsanitary, and lack measures to support personal hygiene. In state-run mental hospitals people with psychosocial disabilities are routinely forced to take medication, locked in isolation rooms, and subjected to involuntary treatment ranging from physical and chemical restraints to electroconvulsive therapy. 9

25. Indonesia should:

- a. Strengthen and monitor the implementation of laws banning shackling with better training, more personnel; and sufficient resources;
- b. Create and implement a de-institutionalization policy with a time-bound action plan for de-institutionalization, based on the values of equality, independence, and inclusion for persons with disabilities;
- c. Develop a time-bound plan to shift progressively to voluntary community-based mental health support and independent living services.

Papua and West Papua

26. In 2017, four countries recommended that Indonesia investigate and end decades of human rights violations in Papua and West Papua provinces.³⁰ However, the situation has gotten worse since then, with the long cycle of extrajudicial killings, torture, and arbitrary arrests reinforcing Indigenous Papuan concerns over discrimination and racism in the resource-rich and isolated provinces.

²⁵ UN Human Rights Council (UNHRC), Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review: Indonesia, A/HRC/36/7, July 14, 2017, https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G17/192/60/PDF/G1719260.pdf (accessed February 15, 2022); Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review: Indonesia – Addendum, A/HRC/36/7/Add.1, September 19, 2017, https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G17/273/32/PDF/G1727332.pdf (accessed February 15, 2022).

²⁶ Human Rights Watch, *Living in Hell: Abuses against People with Psychosocial Disabilities in Indonesia* (New York: Human Rights Watch, March 2016, p. 3, https://www.hrw.org/sites/default/files/report_pdf/indonesia0316web.pdf.

²⁷ Human Rights Watch, *Living in Hell*, p. 35; Human Rights Watch, *Living in Chains: Shackling of People with Psychosocial Disabilities Worldwide* (New York: Human Rights Watch, October 2020), p. 40, https://www.hrw.org/sites/default/files/media_2020/10/global_shackling1020_web_2.pdf. Ministry of Health of Republic of Indonesia, "Stop Stigma and Discrimination to People with 'Mental Disorder'," October 10, 2014, http://www.depkes.go.id/article/view/201410270011/stop-stigma-dan-diskriminasi-terhadap-orang-denganguan-jiwa-odgj.html (accessed August 20, 2015); Marsel Rombe, "Indonesian Mental Health Law Passed after Five Years," *Jakarta Globe*, July 13, 2014, http://jakartaglobe.beritasatu.com/news/indonesian-mental-health-law-passed-five-years (accessed August 19, 2015).

²⁸ Ibid., p. 45.

²⁹ Ibid., pp. 46-58.

³⁰ These countries included Australia, Germany, Mexico and New Zealand. See: "UPR of Indonesia 3rd Cycle, 27th Session, Thematic List of Recommendations," United Nations Human Rights Council, https://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/UPR/Pages/IDIndex.aspx (accessed March 29, 2022).

- 27. In August 2019, Indonesian militants attacked a West Papuan student dorm in Surabaya, Java Island, calling them "monkeys" for allegedly failing to raise the Indonesian flag to celebrate Independence Day. Police stormed the dorm, using teargas to arrest the students. Indigenous Papuans, angered by decades of racism, protested in 30 cities across Indonesia.³¹ Pro-independence rallies ensued, with police and military using deadly force in Sorong,³² Jayapura,³³ Wamena³⁴ and some other towns Hundreds of Indigenous Papuans were wounded and killed in the protests. Several officers were killed and more than 30 settlers were burned to death. The government responded by sending more troops to these areas and arresting political activists including Victor Yeimo of the West Papua National Committee, now awaiting trial in Jayapura.³⁵
- 28. Human Rights Watch also keeps documenting the restriction for foreign journalists and international rights observers to visit the areas, not fulfilling the government's 2018 promise to invite the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights.³⁶

29. Indonesia should:

- a. Create an independent, impartial investigation into the protests and riots in Papua and West Papua and hold those responsible for unlawful attacks accountable;
- b. Fulfill President Joko Widodo's promise to invite the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights to visit Papua and West Papua;
- c. Release all political prisoners in Papua and West Papua provinces (as well as in the Moluccas Islands);³⁷
- d. End all restrictions on foreign journalists to visit Papua and West Papua and abolish the discriminatory clearing house mechanism at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs that makes it slow and difficult for foreign journalists to obtain visas;³⁸

³¹ Andreas Harsono, "Indonesian Officers' Racist Slurs Trigger Riots in Papua," Human Rights Watch dispatch, August 23, 2019, https://www.hrw.org/news/2019/08/23/indonesian-officers-racist-slurs-trigger-riots-papua.

³² Human Rights Watch, "Investigate Deaths of Papuan Protesters," Human Rights Watch press release, September 7, 2019, https://www.hrw.org/news/2019/09/07/indonesia-investigate-deaths-papuan-protesters.

³³ Human Rights Watch, "Drop Case Against Papuan Protest Organizers," June 10, 2020 https://www.hrw.org/news/2020/06/10/indonesia-drop-case-against-papuan-protest-organizers

³⁴ Human Rights Watch, "Investigate Riot Deaths in Papua," October 7, 2019, https://www.hrw.org/news/2019/10/07/indonesia-investigate-riot-deaths-papua.

³⁵ Human Rights Watch, "Drop Charges, Release Peaceful Papuan Activist," https://www.hrw.org/news/2021/05/12/indonesia-drop-charges-release-peaceful-papuan-activist.

³⁶ Phelim Kine, Indonesia Shuts Out UN Rights Chief From Papua, June 19, 2018, https://www.hrw.org/news/2018/06/19/indonesia-shuts-out-un-rights-chief-papua.

³⁷ Human Rights Watch, "List of Known Political Prisoners in Indonesia," May 4, 2020, https://www.hrw.org/news/2020/05/04/list-known-political-prisoners-indonesia.

³⁸ The restrictions against foreign journalists and academics were expanding over the last few years that included not only Papua and West Papua but also those interested in the issue of deforestation in other parts of Indonesia. See Andreas Harsono, "Indonesia's Harmful Restrictions on Foreign Journalists, Academics," *The Jakarta Post*, August 19, 2020, https://www.hrw.org/news/2020/08/19/indonesias-harmful-restrictions-foreign-journalists-academics.

e. Ratify the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court and implement the statute in national legislation, including by incorporating provisions to cooperate promptly and fully with the ICC and to investigate and prosecute genocide, crimes against humanity and war crimes before its national courts in accordance with international law.